

legal Judaism and non-legal Heathenism. Many of the conclusions here recorded to have been reached by one who, if he did not take the first rank among scientific exegetes, was a manly and independent thinker, will be consulted with advantage.

There are other books which at present can be little more than referred to. Among these is Philippi's *Exposition of the Epistle to the Galatians*¹—a posthumous publication exhibiting the well-known qualities of the Rostock divine, in whom exegetical skill joined hands with unbending Lutheran dogmatism. There is also the very useful edition of the Gothic Bible of Ulfilas, with Textual variations and an excellent Glossary, which we owe to Ernst Bernhardt.² We have peculiar pleasure, too, in noticing the contributions made by two French scholars, MM. Meyer³ and Menegoz,⁴ to Biblical Theology. The former attempts a reproduction of Christ's own teaching as it may be gathered from Matthew's Gospel. The volume contains much that deserves consideration, both on the idea of the kingdom of heaven and on other parts of Christ's doctrine. The latter limits himself to an examination of Paul's ideas of *sin* and *redemption*. These are investigated with admirable care and completeness. Some of the studies, such as those on the Wrath of God, the origin of the Pauline idea of Expiation, the roots of the Pauline Christology, are more than usually suggestive. Both books, though open to criticism at various points, are of real value, and are welcome additions to one of the most important and fruitful fields of New Testament inquiry.

S. D. F. SALMOND.

BREVIA.

The Appearance of the Risen Jesus to all the Apostles (1 Cor. xv. 7).—The reasons that are assigned by the Commentators (*e.g.* by Meyer), for taking the "all" of ver. 8 as masculine, and referring it back to "the apostles"

¹ *Erklärung des Briefes Pauli an die Galater. Aus dem handschriftlichen Nachlass der akademischen Vorlesungen von S. F. A. Philippi.* Gütersloh, 1884.

² *Die gothische Bibel des Vulfila nebst der Skeireins, dem Kalender und den Urkunden.* Herausgegeben von Ernst Bernhardt. Halle, 1884.

³ *Le Christianisme du Christ, etc.* Par D.—H. Meyer. Paris: Fischbacher.

⁴ *Le Péché et la Rédemption d'après Saint Paul.* Par Eugène Menegoz. Paris: Fischbacher.

of ver. 7 seem decisive. But, if Paul says here: "then to all the apostles, last of all [of them], however, to me," two corollaries appear to follow. (1) The "last of all" is subordinate to, not co-ordinate with, the *ἔπειτα* of ver. 7, and thus the chain *ἔπειτα—ἔπειτα—ἔσχατον πάντων* is broken and the argument from it that the Apostle is giving a *Chronological* list of the appearances of Jesus, fails. The series of *ἔπειτα—ἔπειτα* would be appropriate in any enumeration on any scheme (cf. xii. 28). (2) The appearance of Jesus to Paul is contained in the appearance to all the apostles of ver. 7, and thus a suspicion is raised that ver. 7 is not intended to assert an appearance to the apostles collectively, but rather an appearance to them distributively,—not one appearance to twelve men but twelve appearances massed together in a single statement. Do the other contextual hints support so unexpected a result? The position of the *πᾶσιν* in ver. 7, is certainly in its favour (cf. 1 Cor. vii. 17; Rom. xii. 4., xvi. 16; Jelf's *Grammar*, § 454, 1). The confusing change from the *τοῖς δώδεκα* of ver. 5 to the *τοῖς ἀποστόλοις* of ver. 7, which has troubled the commentators, would be thus explained. The strong declaration of the Apostle that the appearance to the five hundred (*ἑφάπαξ*) was a single appearance is explained. And finally, the repetition of the *πᾶσιν* of ver. 7 in the *πάντων* of ver. 8, and of the *ἀποστόλοις* in the *ἀποστόλων* of ver. 9, and the *ἐκείνοι* of ver. 11, all favour the distributive sense of *πᾶσιν*. If such an understanding of the passage be deemed the legitimate one, we learn thus incidentally of several appearances of the risen Jesus not elsewhere recorded (cf. Acts i. 3), and a new point is given to such a passage as 1 Cor. ix. 1. Did each apostle receive, then, a special and personal visitation from the risen Lord?

BENJ. B. WARFIELD.

The Seal of Obadiah.—In 1 Kings xxi. 8 we are told of Jezebel, that she wrote letters in Ahab's name, which secured the death of Naboth, and sealed them with the king's seal. The seal which witnessed Jezebel's fatal letter would be a precious historical relic, while next to it in value would be that of Ahab's prime minister, to which perhaps the following narrative pertains. In the *Revue Archéologique* for January last, M. Clermont-Ganneau, the eminent explorer of Palestinian antiquities, inserted a brief article on a seal lately discovered in Palestine. He dates it so