

Theology on the Web.org.uk

Making Biblical Scholarship Accessible

This document was supplied for free educational purposes. Unless it is in the public domain, it may not be sold for profit or hosted on a webserver without the permission of the copyright holder.

If you find it of help to you and would like to support the ministry of Theology on the Web, please consider using the links below:



Buy me a coffee

<https://www.buymeacoffee.com/theology>



PATREON

<https://patreon.com/theologyontheweb>

PayPal

<https://paypal.me/robbradshaw>

A table of contents for *Caribbean Journal of Evangelical Theology* can be found here:

https://biblicalstudies.org.uk/articles_caribbean-journal-theology_01.php

ISSN: 0799-1711

CARIBBEAN JOURNAL OF EVANGELICAL THEOLOGY

Published annually by the
Caribbean Evangelical Theological Association (CETA),
Caribbean Graduate School of Theology (CGST) and
Jamaica Theological Seminary (JTS)
P.O. Box 121, Kingston 8, Jamaica, West Indies
Email: jts-cgst@colis.com

Copyright © 2021 *Caribbean Journal of Evangelical Theology*

EDITORIAL COMMITTEE

D. V. Palmer
Lecturer, CGST

Erica Campbell
Lecturer, JTS

Cecelia Spencer
Librarian, JTS/CGST

Fay Williams
Lecturer, JTS

PURPOSE

The Caribbean Journal of Evangelical Theology (CJET) is designed to promote scholarly study and research, to provide a forum for the expression of facts, ideas, and opinions from a Caribbean evangelical theological perspective, and to stimulate the application of this research to the Caribbean region.

This periodical is indexed in *Religion Index One: Periodicals*, *the Index to Book Reviews in Religion*, *Religion Indexes: Ten Year Subset on CD-ROM*, and the *ATLA Religion Database on CD-ROM*, published by the American Theological Library Association, 820 Church Street, Evanston, IL 60201-5613, E-mail: atla@atla.com, www: <http://www.atla.com/>.

The views expressed are not necessarily those of CJET, CETA, CGST OR JTS.

Design/Typesetting assistance by Shane Dennis

ISSN: 0799-1711

PROFESSIONAL
THEOLOGICAL
JOURNAL FOR
THE CARIBBEAN
COMMUNITY
AND
BEYOND

CJET

VOLUME
21

2022

Caribbean Journal of Evangelical Theology

CONTENTS

- | | |
|-----------|---|
| 1 | CREATED TO REST
Lisa Renee Wilson |
| 8 | NATION-BUILDING
L. Smith |
| 20 | MINORS SHOULD HAVE EQUAL RIGHTS
Joan Pinkney |
| 33 | AN ARGUMENT FOR ETERNAL
SECURITY
Leroy Williams |
| 41 | THE BRETHERN MOVEMENT AND ITS
CONTRIBUTION
Vincent Ross |
| 54 | THE GOSPEL MANDATE
D. Vincent Palmer |
| 71 | BOOK REVIEW
Anicia Bennett |
| 78 | RETHINKING
Horace Williams |

CREATED TO REST
A
THEOLOGICAL REVIEW
OF THE
GLOBAL PAUSE FOR THE
COVID-19 PANDEMIC

Lisa Renée Wilson

MA (hons.)

Introduction

In November 2019, several persons in Wuhan, China became ill with a viral infection. As the cases grew, medical professionals determined that this was a new strain of the severe acute respiratory syndrome coronavirus 2 (SARS-CoV-2) in December 2019. The disease was then named Coronavirus disease 2019, abbreviated as COVID-19. As the virus spread across the city and the country, the outbreak threatened the region and the globe.

Chinese officials implemented lockdowns in the most affected areas, but not soon enough to stem a global pandemic. By March 2020, over two hundred countries were noted as having a person who was tested positive for CoVid-19 (covid19.who.int) City by city, country by country, the call went out for persons to stop moving and stay home to slow or prevent the spread of this disease. Curfews, quarantines, isolation and social distancing orders as well as closed borders and lockdowns were implemented in all corners of the globe. Earth came to a rest. This pause resulted in significant ecological benefits across the globe. In this paper, I examine the Old Testament theology of Rest and the implications for humanity today.

1 Ecological Impact of CoVid-19 Pause

1.1 Seismic Quiet

In January 2020, the outbreak of COVID-19 was declared a global health emergency (Sohrabi, Alsafi et al 2020). By March, the World Health Organization recognised it as a pandemic. Emergency measures were put into effect to slow the spread of the virus. These emergency measures were different levels of lockdown, stay-in-place orders, and curfew. The result was a disruption to social and economic behaviour, production and travel (Lecocq, Hicks, van Noten et al 2020).

As the world slowed to a pause, scientists stated that Earth took notice. Seismologists around the world collectively reported a fifty percent reduction in seismic noise during the global lockdown(Lecocq, Hicks, van Noten et al 2020). For the first time, the effect of human

traffic on seismic activity was minimised for a clearer baseline. The Earth's natural seismic noise level could be detected in the stillness.

1.2 Nitrous oxide and Carbon emissions

The extreme shifts in daily activity allowed research scientists an exceptional opportunity to study their environmental impact. It was found that there was significant reduction in the levels of nitrous oxide emissions in the atmosphere (Bauwens, Compernelle et al 2020). Chinese residents experienced an 18 percent drop in carbon emissions between February and March (National Geographic 2020). This was accredited to the fall in coal consumption and industrial output (CarbonBrief 2020). This country's rest resulted in the avoidance of approximately 250 million metric tons of carbon pollution. Many persons reported via social media that the sky was clearer than they could ever remember. The stars of the night sky had returned.

According to National Geographic (2020), estimates for the European Union are that harmful emissions will reduce by approximately 400 million metric tons in 2020 due to the declining power demands and depressed manufacturing industry. The United States of America did not mandate a federal lockdown, though many states went into go-slow and stay-in-place modes. With their limited data, experts expect that the CoVid-19 pandemic will also have a ripple effect on their atmosphere. In the short-term, the reduction in ground transportation relayed a significant reduction in carbon emissions.

1.3 Wildlife and Marine Life

Scientists have noted the increased sightings of avian, wildlife and marine species in areas where human movement was reduced. Creatures of air, land, and sea have been observed in spaces where they would normally avoid due to human occupation (C19-wild.org). The lack of human invasive activity allowed the animals to temporarily reclaim parts of their natural habitat. According to UN Environment (2020), humans have been increasingly encroaching on the natural habitat of wildlife by deforestation, climate change and other harmful ecological practices.

2 Biblical Theology of Rest

2.1 Rest as part of Creation

In the beginning, Elohim created the heavens and the earth. When all was formed, He rested from His creative works on the seventh day. Genesis 2 verses 1- 3 states that He blessed and sanctified the seventh day because He had rested from creation on that day. From the Biblical story of creation, therefore, while all other six days had tangible and material elements created, this additional seventh day was only noted for being a day of rest.

The Hebrew word for 'rest' is **שָׁבַת**, which is transliterated as *shabat*. Shabat is also translated as "to cease or desist". In other words, shabat indicates coming to a complete pause or halt. This is the closing part of creation. Most cultures, historically and still today, use a seven-day week to reckon times for work and rest. Noteworthy, too, is that many languages call the seventh day by their translation of "shabat". In Spanish, it is el sábado. In Latin, it is Sabbatum. In Greek, it is Sabato.

2.2 Rest for Humanity

The Bible records that the people who were faithful to the Creator as their God, particularly the descendants of Abraham, Isaac and Jacob, were instructed to rest on the seventh day. This seventh day was called “the Sabbath of YHWH” (Exodus 20:10, Deuteronomy 5:14). Upon leaving captivity and slavery in Egypt, the Israelites were reminded to keep this day as sacred unto their God. From the Mosaic covenant, the Israelites with all others who were among them, including their servants, their animals and the foreigners were to do no work on the seventh day (Exodus 20:8-11).

During their journey through the wilderness into the Promised land of Canaan, the Israelites were again reminded of this instruction to rest at the end of the week. Exodus 16 records YHWH’s provision and instructions for this emancipated nation.

22On the sixth day, they gathered twice as much... 23He said to them, “This is what the LORD commanded: ‘Tomorrow is to be a day of sabbath rest, a holy sabbath to the LORD... 26Six days you are to gather it, but on the seventh day, the Sabbath, there will not be any.’” 27Nevertheless, some of the people went out on the seventh day to gather it, but they found none... 29Bear in mind that the LORD has given you the Sabbath; that is why on the sixth day he gives you bread for two days. Everyone is to stay where they are on the seventh day; no one is to go out.” 30So the people rested on the seventh day.

They were expected to go out and carry out their regular activities for six days and rest on the seventh day. No one was to go out. Provisions were to be secured prior to the night-and-day stay-in order. The people were commanded to observe a weekly rest.

2.3 Rest for the Land

Rest was not reserved for people only. The Mosaic laws had instructions regarding rest for the land. In an agriculture-based economy, Leviticus 25 explains that the people were to give the land a rest every seventh year, in honour of YHWH.

¹ The LORD said ... ‘When you enter the land I will give you, let it have a special time of rest, to honor the LORD. ³ You may plant seed in your field for six years, and you may trim your vineyards for six years and bring in their fruits. ⁴ But during the seventh year, you must let the land rest. This will be a special time to honor the LORD. You must not plant seed in your field or trim your vineyards. ⁵ You must not cut the crops that grow by themselves after harvest, or gather the grapes from your vines that are not trimmed. The land will have a year of rest.

The practice of leaving the land go fallow allows the soil to renew itself naturally. The nutrients and richness return after a period of rest. The food produced on the land during the period of rest is still good for consumption. However, no pest control, pruning, weeding or turning of the soil should take place. To date, many countries with a significant agricultural sector have policies which regulate fallow ground (TheEcologist.org 2008).

3 Humans' Responsibility to the Earth

3.1 To Serve and To Protect

According to Season of Creation (2010), it is a part of the believers' mission to 'serve' Earth. Genesis 2:15 in Hebrew reads,

וַיִּקַּח יְהוָה אֱלֹהִים אֶת-הָאָדָם וַיִּנְתְּהוּ בְּגַן-עֵדֶן לְעֹבְדָהּ וּלְשִׁמְרָהּ:

The words in bold are often translated "to work and to keep it". The first root word is עָבַד (a'bad) which means more than just to work. It means also 'to serve' – in the same way that a slave would serve a master or a priest would serve in worship. The limiting translation of tilling or cultivation is in the Niphal form of the verb, not the Qal as is used in this passage. The root of the second word is שָׁמַר (shamar) which also means 'to guard, watch, protect'. Therefore, Man was commissioned 'to serve and to protect' the earth.

As part of this guardian role, man is responsible for the care and oversight of all other lifeforms – birds, fish, animals and plants. Humans are the custodians of the quality of life on Earth. Its proper use, maintenance and rest are mankind's duty. Failure to serve and protect the Earth will result in the interruption of life as we know it as the land and seas will be renewed, and humanity will pay the price.

3.2 Advocate for Ecological Responsibility

In 2005, the National Council of Churches presented an open letter to the church and society in the United States of America regarding the need for better stewardship of the environment. The Council proposed that the Church should assume its role as advocate for ecological justice. It is part of the Church's mission, as instructed by God, to be the caretakers of the earth and our fellow men.

While climate change and ecological abuses have been taking place, the Church in general has been silent. This duty of protector of the earth has been left to independent foundations or individual advocates. Rest for mankind and rest for the earth should be regulated with written policies and guidelines to secure a sustainable environment for the future generations.

Butt (2001) recognised the need for rest in the earth. Recalling the American experience of the midwestern Dust Bowl of the 1930s, Butt pointed out the consequences of abusing and misusing the land and not giving the land rest. The period of rejuvenation is needed for a sustainable and habitable land.

3.3 Recognise the Creator

Capp (2013) states that a lack of rest is prompted by wrong motives. In his theology of rest, Capp points out that rest reminds humans that they are not God. It is YHWH alone who needs neither slumber nor sleep, according to Psalm 121:4. Rest requires that humans recognise, therefore, that we are not in control. Humans cannot maintain a "24/7" schedule for 365 days per year. They must relinquish control to others and surrender to repose. When one relies on the Creator for sustenance, rest is accepted as the gift He gave and a reminder of His continued providence.

3.4 Self-regulation and Accountability

Norman Habel (2011) proported that the church included a Season of Creation in the liturgical calendar as a reminder that we are responsible and accountable for the rest of creation. We are called to honour and defend it for our generation and for those to come. Williams (2015) calls for acknowledgement of the ‘homo energos’ – the current evolutionary phase of mankind which is globally dependent on a lifestyle of high energy consumption. This consumption must be moderated by a public understanding of man’s responsibility to care for the environment.

5 Conclusion

Rest is critical to the cycle of production and rejuvenation that maintains life on Earth. The 2020 global pandemic gave humanity and earth pause to rest from a constant bustle and to reflect on what is important. Our seeming need to consume immense amounts of energy and maintain a ‘24/7’ world, constantly on the go, was halted as Nature refracted the overwhelming impact on Earth’s resources.

To restore balance, the land and the people must routinely rest. Mankind and nature were designed by the Creator to enjoy periods of rest on a regular basis. Humans must be ecologically responsible in our endeavours, maintaining balance across all ecosystems. If we fail to regulate ourselves judiciously, Nature will force humans to pause as with the case of the Coronavirus 2019 outbreak which stemmed from an exorbitant consumption of wildlife animals in Wuhan, China.

The impact of the global pandemic should not be soon forgotten. The insights gained scientifically warrant further study and action by governments and by individuals. Self-regulation guided by the biblical principles of rest and stewardship of the earth is effectively the best way to move towards a sustainable environment. The church must add its voice to the advocacy for ecological responsibility within the congregation and also in the community.

Rest is beneficial to humans physically, socially, spiritually and mentally. The financial benefits of long-term appropriate use and management of earth’s resources outweigh short-term gains by exorbitant consumption. The twenty-first century level of energy consumption and demand for production must be counter-balanced with the impact on the body and the environment. “Sabbath” was made for man, and Man was put to serve and protect the earth, including by providing scheduled times of rest.

Bibliography

- Bauwens, M., S. Compennolle, T. Stavrakou, J.-F. Müller, J. van Gent, H. Eskes, P. F. Levelt, et al. 2020. 'Impact of Coronavirus Outbreak on NO₂ Pollution Assessed Using TROPOMI and OMI Observations'. *Geophysical Research Letters* 47 (11): e2020GL087978. <https://doi.org/10.1029/2020GL087978>.
- Becker, Joshua. n.d. 'The Lost Practice of Resting One Day Each Week'. Accessed 16 September 2020. <https://www.becomingminimalist.com/resting/>.
- 'Brief Bio | Norman Habel'. n.d. Accessed 27 September 2020. http://normanhabel.com/?page_id=36.
- 'Carbon Emissions Are Falling Sharply Due to Coronavirus. But Not for Long.' 2020. Science. 3 April 2020. <https://www.nationalgeographic.com/science/2020/04/coronavirus-causing-carbon-emissions-to-fall-but-not-for-long/>.
- 'Commission and Blessing: A Theology of Ministry to Earth'. n.d. Accessed 16 September 2020. <http://seasonofcreation.com/wp-content/uploads/2010/04/a-theology-of-ministry-to-earth.pdf>.
- 'Coronavirus COVID-19 (2019-NCov)'. n.d. Accessed 7 September 2020. <https://gisanddata.maps.arcgis.com/apps/opsdashboard/index.html#/bda7594740fd40299423467b48e9ecf6>.
- 'COVID-19 Pandemic Lockdowns'. 2020. In *Wikipedia*. https://en.wikipedia.org/w/index.php?title=COVID-19_pandemic_lockdowns&oldid=976256877.
- Environment, U. N. 2020. 'Six Nature Facts Related to Coronaviruses'. UN Environment. 8 April 2020. <http://www.unenvironment.org/news-and-stories/story/six-nature-facts-related-coronaviruses>.
- 'Fallow and Fertile'. n.d. Accessed 14 September 2020. <https://theecologist.org/2008/jun/20/fallow-and-fertile>.
- 'Fearing Shortages, People Are Planting More Vegetable Gardens'. n.d. NPR.Org. Accessed 5 September 2020. <https://www.npr.org/sections/coronavirus-live-updates/2020/03/27/822514756/fearing-shortages-people-are-planting-more-vegetable-gardens>.
- 'Gardening During Covid-19'. n.d. Accessed 5 September 2020. <https://www.uvm.edu/extension/mastergardener/gardening-during-covid-19>.
- 'God's Earth Is Sacred: An Open Letter to Church and Society in the United States'. n.d. Accessed 26 September 2020. <https://seasonofcreation.com/wp-content/uploads/2010/04/1.pdf>.
- 'Impact of the COVID-19 Pandemic on the Environment'. 2020. In *Wikipedia*. https://en.wikipedia.org/w/index.php?title=Impact_of_the_COVID-19_pandemic_on_the_environment&oldid=976027175.
- 'Impacts of COVID-19 on Wildlife | C19-Wild | University of Manitoba'. n.d. C19-Wild. Accessed 3 September 2020. <https://www.c19-wild.org/>.

- Lecocq, Thomas, Stephen P. Hicks, Koen Van Noten, Kasper van Wijk, Paula Koelemeijer, Raphael S. M. De Plaen, Frédérick Massin, et al. 2020. 'Global Quieting of High-Frequency Seismic Noise Due to COVID-19 Pandemic Lockdown Measures'. *Science*, July. <https://doi.org/10.1126/science.abd2438>.
- 'Let the Land Rest'. n.d. Accessed 16 September 2020. <http://www.apologeticspress.org/APContent.aspx?category=13&article=841>.
- 'Pandemic Quiets the Earth'. n.d. Accessed 1 September 2020. <https://www.bc.edu/bc-web/bcnews/science-tech-and-health/earth-environment-and-sustainability/pandemic-quiets-the-earth.html>.
- 'Sabbath of the Land'. n.d. Accessed 14 September 2020. <http://www.ecclesia.org/truth/sabbath-land.html>.
- Slick, Matt. 2020. 'Is Isolation of People during Disease Pandemic Biblical?' Text. 26 March 2020. <https://carm.org/is-isolation-of-people-during-disease-pandemic-biblical>.
- Sohrabi, Catrin, Zaid Alsafi, Niamh O'Neill, Mehdi Khan, Ahmed Kerwan, Ahmed Al-Jabir, Christos Iosifidis, and Riaz Agha. 2020. 'World Health Organization Declares Global Emergency: A Review of the 2019 Novel Coronavirus (COVID-19)'. *International Journal of Surgery* 76 (April): 71–76. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ijso.2020.02.034>.
- Stuart, Douglas K. 2009. *Old Testament Exegesis: A Handbook for Students and Pastors*. 4th ed. Louisville, Ky: Westminster John Knox Press.
- 'Timeline: WHO's COVID-19 Response'. n.d. Accessed 14 September 2020. <https://www.who.int/emergencies/diseases/novel-coronavirus-2019/interactive-timeline>.
- 'WHO Coronavirus Disease (COVID-19) Dashboard'. n.d. Accessed 14 September 2020. <https://covid19.who.int>.
- 'WHO Coronavirus Disease (COVID-19) Dashboard | WHO Coronavirus Disease (COVID-19) Dashboard'. n.d. Accessed 14 September 2020. <https://covid19.who.int/table>.
- 'Why Do We Need Physical Rest?' 2013. The Gospel Project. 5 August 2013. <https://www.gospelproject.com/why-do-we-need-physical-rest/>.
- 'Why The Earth Needs A Theology Of Energy The Arrival Of Homo Energos'. n.d. Illuminate. Accessed 16 September 2020. <https://illuminate.recollect.net.au/nodes/view/1063>.

**NATION-BUILDING: THE
CONTRIBUTION OF THE SDA
CHURCH IN JAMAICA**

Livingston Smith

PhD

In Matthew 16: 18, Christ declares ‘On this Rock I will build my church, and the gates of hell shall not prevail against it.’ By his church, I believe Christ meant all believers in him, irrespective of time and place. Miller¹ puts it thus: ‘The church is ecumenical in essence but divided into doctrinal lines into denominations of believers in Jamaica’. This paper focuses on one of the denominations that comprise the church of God.

It is said that one in nine Jamaicans is a Seventh-Day Adventist. Whether or not the one in every nine is committed and active, is quite another question. Irrespective, this is an extraordinary statistic for any denomination to achieve. This essay examines the contributions of this denomination to the Jamaican society. In order give this essay some historical grounding, a brief history of the general SDA church and its genesis in Jamaica precedes this analysis.

A Brief History of the SDA Church

That the Seventh-Day Adventist denomination has a current global baptized membership of some twenty one million and twenty five million adherents is impressive for a church that began out of the speculations of the 19th century William Miller who had taken a special interest in understanding Daniel 8: 14. This chapter mentions that ‘after 2, 300 days, then shall the sanctuary be

¹ Professor Errol Miller’s keynote speech ‘The Church and its Impact on Nation-Building: Real of Imagined?’ Bethel Baptist Church, 60th Anniversary Lecture, November 11, 2015, is an excellent and detailed examination of the contribution of the Christian church, broadly speaking, to Jamaica’s nation-building.

cleansed'. Miller's interpretation of this prophecy was that Christ would return in about 1843. Miller began to preach this in 1831. A popular movement was birthed out of Miller's preaching. Later, Miller would refine his predictions to an exact time frame for Christ's return: between March 21, 1843, and March 21, 1844. However, Christ did not return, and the disappointment left thousands vilified, bewildered, and disillusioned. Remnants of the disappointed group continued to meet; they located the error in Miller's explanation and produced a different way to interpret Daniel 8: 14 and related scriptures. Key names such as James and Ellen White and Joseph Bates emerged to give leadership, and a new denomination, later taking the name of Seventh-Day Adventists, was born.

The SDA Church in Jamaica

The Seventh-day Adventist Church entered Jamaica in 1890, through William Arnold's work as a colporteur. William Arnold was selling religious books in the tiny Caribbean island of Antigua. He sold a book, *The Coming King* to Henry Palmer in Antigua. Palmer sent it to his son, James, in Jamaica. Shortly thereafter, the young Palmer reportedly found a religious tract at the Kingston Wharves where he worked but paid little attention to it until he realised it came from the same publishing house as the book his father had sent him. He wrote to the publishing house, received additional literature, and passed them out in the city of Kingston.

Palmer reportedly gave a tract to a Dr Ross of the Kingston Public Hospital, who, not being a very religious man, passed it to a Margaret Harrison. Harrison, a devout Christian, was immediately fired up with the message and started sharing it with her friends and family members. Soon, they were holding Sabbath worship at her house and then in a rented room on Highholborn Street in Kingston. These were the first recorded Adventist worship services in Jamaica.

By 1903, the church had grown by such leaps and bounds to the extent that the world governing body, the General Conference of Seventh-day Adventists, voted to make Jamaica a conference.²

² Not much has been published on this topic except for a small book entitled *Thy Light Is Come: A Short History of the Seventh-day Adventist Church in Jamaica*, by Linette Mitchell, and a few unpublished term papers by seminarians at the Seventh-day Adventist Theological Seminary at Andrews University. Mitchell's

This status meant that the Adventist Church could now formally organise its work throughout the island. Three years later - in 1906 - the World Church organised the West Indian Union with headquarters in Kingston, Jamaica, to manage its affairs in the Caribbean, Central America, and sections of South America.

In a short time, eleven Adventist high and preparatory schools began operations and the Advent message spread like wildfire. Conferences were organised, churches were erected across the country and, by 1959, the West Indian Training School broadened its scope immensely, changed its name to become West Indies College, in anticipation of the dawn of a new era.

By 1962, the year Jamaica became an independent nation, the Seventh-day Adventist Church had positioned itself to become one of the most influential organisations in the country. Having already reorganised itself into East, West and Central Jamaica Conference, the church intensified its operations to meet the needs of the newly independent nation.

Having grown its membership to more than 33, 000 by 1962, the church continued to spread its wings across the country, evangelising, ministering, offering social, educational, and medical services, and setting up more schools, health centres, social and spiritual programmes, geared towards empowering the newly independent society.

Contribution to Education

A well-trained mind is a country's most important resource and the developing of its human potential the single most important responsibility of a progressive society. It is central to development both from the individual and broader societal perspective, as highly educated people are needed to achieve sustained good governance, strong institutions, and a developed infrastructure.³

The SDA church entered Jamaica in the 1890's, and so unlike such denominations as the Anglican, Roman Catholics, the United

book is a chronological narrative of the development of the Adventist work in Jamaica, focusing on significant people and events.

³ The World Bank Development Report 2008, for example, explains that education is central to development both from the individual and broader societal perspectives. For the individual, education improves health and nutrition, increases productivity and, earnings--and reduces inequality. This report details a host of other benefits of education to the society and the individual.

Church, Methodists, Baptist, Presbyterian, et cetera, was not part of the early thrust of denominational provision of education in Jamaica that began just after emancipation.⁴

However, once the SDA began to grow its numbers in Jamaica, the provision of educational opportunities was a main thrust of this denomination. It may not be well known that the SDA currently operates 7, 500 educational institutions worldwide in some one hundred and fifty countries, one hundred and eighteen being tertiary institutions. This involves some one and half million students. This is bettered only by the Catholic Church.⁵

The SDA Church in Jamaica has been making a stellar contribution in this area. It operates eleven high and preparatory schools and one major university, Northern Caribbean University. NCU, granted university status in 1999, is one of the nations three major universities with some five thousand students and graduating up to nine hundred students per year.⁶

The nature of Adventist education is praiseworthy as it sees as its goal character development, and that the biblical worldview must provide the matrix in which the Christian understanding takes

⁴ The SDA Church was not part of some of the most vital contributions that the Christian church made to nation-building in Jamaica just after the emancipation of slaves in 1834. For example, the Free Village Movement was an outstanding success. By 1844 there were 116 of these and the many of the churches on the island had taken part in this movement described by Morris as ‘constructive, radical and transformative.’ With regards to education, it was the denominations that provided elementary education to the children of the newly freed. For example, the Anglican Church used the Negro Education Grant that was allocated by the British Government, to import teachers.

Because of the tremendous work done by the various denominations, by 1900 Jamaica was 14th in the world in the provision of elementary education to its population. Miller, in his assessment, concludes that ‘Prior to independence, from emancipation to independence, the church was the prime mover in creating education capacity.’ See, for a masterful analysis, Professor Errol Miller’s ‘The Church and its Impact on Nation-Building: Real of Imagined?’ Bethel Baptist Church-60th Anniversary Lecture: November 11, 2015. <https://errolmiller.com/the-church-its-impact-on-nation-building/>.

⁵ The SDAs operate one of the largest Christian educational systems in the world. Their first school was opened in 1853 in Buck’s Bridge, New York.

⁶ Since it received its charter, the university has graduated close to 15,000 persons. Its nursing graduates continue to be hailed for their impressive passes in the national nursing exams. Its information technology programme is now considered one of the best in the world, with teams from the Department of Information Science constantly winning international prizes in the prestigious Microsoft Imagine Cup Competition. See various NCU reports as well as Jamaica Gleaner articles- <https://jamaica-gleaner.com/gleaner/20130111/news/news7.html> See also “History of the Northern Caribbean University.” *Northern Caribbean University: A Seventh-day Adventist Institution*. Accessed January 23, 2019. www.ncu.edu.jm/weare.

place, leading to the emphasis on a life of service. For the SDA, true education, with redemption, is virtually the same. ⁷

Contribution to Health Care and Diet

According to Melbourne (2015) ‘Seventh-day Adventist medical work in Jamaica began in 1912. That August, “Massage and Hydropathic Treatment” rooms opened in Kingston with four nurses. This endeavor was highly supported and received recommendations from leading doctors in Jamaica. However, this medical facility discontinued operations in 1918 due to lack of funds. Yet, interest in the medical work persisted. Occasionally, classes in home care were taught at the West Indian Training School. The leaders saw the potential benefits that the medical work could provide as the “right arm of the ministry.”

The account given in the SDA Encyclopedia further explains that:

In the June 1, 1944, the church purchased property in Kingston to build a modern Sanatorium and Hospital with the first phase to be completed in 1945. The next phase involved building a modern 52-bed hospital, including auxiliary facilities for a nurses’ training school, outpatient office, and maternity ward. The members of North Street Church firmly supported the project and, with their own funds, purchased the property on which the facilities would be built. The new hospital, Andrews Memorial Hospital, was named after the church’s first foreign missionary, John Nevins Andrews. When the hospital’s doors were first opened, it was then the most modern hospital on the island. Its impact on Jamaica’s health care environment was significant. The hospital celebrated its 75th anniversary in March 2019. It collaborates with Northern Caribbean University to offer a baccalaureate nursing program. (Melbourne, 2015, p. 5)

⁷ The impact of education on the society must not be underestimated. As UNESCO points out: ‘The impact of improved education permeates the entire labor force, thus supporting links between increasing commitment to education and rising productivity and income. In short, individuals who acquire more years of learning influence the relative opportunities of others in the labor market. In doing so, rising incomes for the educated promote the accumulation of years of schooling for the nation at large (UNESCO-UIS/ OECD 2003).’
‘Education also boosts democratization and functions as an engine for general social cohesion and a means to fight poverty. Better educated citizens are more likely to participate in the democratic process and have a tendency to support democratic regimes over other political systems (Ganimian and Solano Rocha, 2011).’

In addition to the fine reputation of the quality of nurses that NCU graduates and their contribution to the delivery of health care in the country, the Adventists are also well known for the promotion of a healthy lifestyle that is holistic in nature, embodying physical exercise, sunlight, fresh air, a spiritual focus, and a vegetarian diet. Much of this has been influencing the society, especially as persons become more health conscious.

This lifestyle is also well supported by scientific research. There is now a well-established body of research by Adventists which supports a vegetarian lifestyle. Major Western cohort studies have also generally demonstrated vegetarian diet health benefits, such as reduced cardiovascular disease, cancer, and overall mortality rates as well as better mental health (Beezhold et al. 2009; Key et al. 1999; Tonstad et al. 2009).

There is significant documentation that Adventist who practice the diet recommended by their denomination have lower overall mortality, incidence of cardiovascular disease, and many cancers. Vegetarian Adventists have less hypertension, lower blood lipids and C-reactive protein (CRP—associated with inflammation), less diabetes, and lower body mass index (BMI) values, when compared to Adventist non-vegetarians. Vegetarian Adventists have less cardiovascular disease, lower rates of colorectal cancer, and vegans especially have lower rates of prostate, and probably breast cancer, than non-vegetarian Adventists.

Adventists in California live 7.3 years (men) and 4.4 years (women) longer than non-Adventist California men and women, adjusting for educational differences. Higher nut consumption is associated with much lower risk of coronary heart disease, etcetera. ⁸

Social Intervention and Community Outreach

Because of its Biblical perspectives, the Seventh-day Adventist Church regards as germane its involvement in development and relief aid. The Adventist Development and Relief Agency (ADRA) has been established globally as a humanitarian, disaster relief and

⁸ See, for example, Orlich et al, Vegetarian Dietary Patterns and Mortality in Advanced Health Study 2, <https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pmc/articles/PM> . See also, the most widely cited research on the health benefits of the Adventist lifestyle are three prospective-cohort studies, conducted over a period of 50 years at Loma Linda University Health. Collectively known as the Adventist Health Studies, the National Institutes of Health-funded projects evaluate data gleaned from 96,194 Adventists in North America.

community development Non-governmental Organization (NGO). It's concern for the very poor, the deprived, the sick, the malnourished and the victims of natural and man-made disasters, results in the commitment by the Church in using its own funds and resources for the benefit of such needy people.

The work of ADRA in Jamaica is quite considerable in its relief supplies throughout the island. In addition, each church has an outreach arm with a mission to assist the communities in which they are located.

The church also has other outreach activities. For example, the Central Jamaica Conference (CJC) of Seventh-day Adventists, on July 13, 2019, opened doors to its 'Life Hope Centre' for the poor and homeless on the compound of the Mandeville Seventh-day Adventist Church, Mandeville, Jamaica. In this model, those who come for assistance will receive counselling, medical, dental, or other interventions. Yet another area of contribution is youth ministries.

Youth Ministries

With Jamaica's population pyramid showing 29% of below fifteen years, all programmes to reach as many, are vital. The SDA's have a very detailed programme to reach their own young people and to keep them in the church.

Their Pathfinder Program is well known and is a well-established way of reaching their youth with a tailored programme for each age group. The Master Guide, Adventurers, Pathfinder, and other Adventist Youth programmes teach practical survival skills, discipline through drill, church history and Bible knowledge.

In addition to the above, the Central Jamaica Conference acquired the Camp Verley property for the development of its youth center.

Other initiatives include its first mobile clinic dubbed HYPE, or Helping Young People Engage. HYPE is the coming together of Adventist young people, pooling their resources to serve God and humanity.

The main objective of HYPE is to engage youth in acts of service, while providing healthcare, and promoting lifestyle changes, as well as an intentional sports program to connect youth of the church with youth of the community. It is non-discriminatory and will seek to serve across religions, ethnicity, and political persuasions.

The mobile clinic will go across Jamaica and will engage volunteers throughout the Island to have resource personnel to execute its mission. Funds and medical equipment were donated by the HYPE initiative by The Dental Place Cosmetics and Spa.

Media and Communication

The university's communication studies programme constantly receives applause from media managers for the high-quality students it produces. A recent graduate, Vashan Brown, was voted most outstanding junior reporter, only a few months after being employed to the RJR group. In addition, a recent film festival staged by the department gained the attention of Hollywood producers and Canadian broadcasters, who have expressed an interest in working with Jamaican student filmmakers and producers.

In November 2010, the university took the business of media and communication to another level when it launched its media group, comprising an island-wide radio station - NCU Radio - aired on 91.1, and 91.3 FM, NCU TV on Channel 188 on the Flow digital network.

Contribution to 'Smadidization' and Inclusion

The church, carrying out its mission, believes that each member, as part of the body of Christ, has an important role to play. Each has a gift in so doing, as Miller (2015) points out. We then are transformed into authentic and Christlike servant-leaders through the roles of choir director, choir member, organist, worship leader, lay preacher, elder, deacon, evangelist, prophet, President, pastor, secretary, treasurer et al.

This is an important psychic contribution of what Nettleford had dubbed 'smaddization,' that is, the defiance of inferiority and the bestowment of importance to each child of God in the church. The church and its various activities have drawn together, in 'fellowship and communion' at the Lord's Table, people from various backgrounds and so have been a force for inclusion. I have left what is arguably the most important matter for the last.

Evangelism and Contribution to the Development and Practice of Strategic Evangelistic Strategies.

Perhaps, even more important, is the church's impact on thousands of lives in its unswerving determination to rescue men and women

from crime, immorality, and hopelessness through a rigorous evangelism programme.

As their numbers indicate, SDA's have been most effective through their evangelistic strategies which are as important to nation building as are their educational, health and other thrusts, once seen within the Kingdom perspective.

From the very beginning, the church membership took an active part in the missionary work which included house to house, district to district meetings.

The SDA's developed and perfected the 'tent crusade' style of evangelism. The first tent pitched was in 1894, by Elder F. I. Richardson and the aftermath was overwhelming, resulting in the first organized SDA church in Jamaica at 32 Text Lane, Kingston.

This first tent meeting by F. I. Richardson would mark the beginning of an evangelistic explosion that is now part of the storied legacy of Adventist evangelism in Jamaica. All across the island, for the next one hundred years, laymen and pastors alike would engage in this method of evangelism.

The role of colporteurs must be noted. According to the Adventist Encyclopedia, in the very early years Adventist colporteurs scattered 18,000 Signs of the Times and other periodicals, and 510,450 pamphlets--and tracts distributed. The books sold are as follows: "Patriarchs and Prophets" 2,670, "Prophecies of Jesus" 450, "Helps to Bible Study" 530, "Christ our Saviour" 1,720, "Mount of Blessing" 950, "Gospel Primer" 3,450, "His Glorious Appearing" 5,650, "From Eden to Eden" 5,285, "Steps to Christ" 8,862, trade and miscellaneous books 2,088, besides hundreds of health books; total number of religious books 32,480. As the result of this and other work, there was an interest to learn more of the truth in nearly every district in the island.

G. A. King, colporteur from the United States, writing in 1894, described hundreds of books sold in Kingston which resulted in many accepting the truth, attending meetings, and keeping the Sabbath. Books were sold from one end of the island to the other, resulting in believers springing up all over. A. J. Haysmer testified to the conversion of several families based on Adventist literature. In the early years of Adventism, the majority of the people who

accepted the truth did so because of the direct work of the canvasser or from the publications that they sold.

Another major factor that contributed to the success of the SDAs in Jamaica was the early focus on lay leadership and the enthusiasm and passion with which these local lay leaders embraced the work. Scores of reports testified of active laymen and women preaching, teaching, giving Bible studies, engaging in house to housework, doing public evangelism, and accepting the work as their own. They did not wait on clerical or conference leadership to launch out in new territory. Without pastoral leadership or conference resources, many faithful laymen and women advanced the work of God using their own time, efforts, and resources.

J. B. Beckner described the Jamaican believers as having great zeal for the message and eagerness to take it to others. They were willing to build the Lord's house, make sacrifices, carry stones on their heads, saw lumber, and do whatever was necessary for success of the work.

Conclusions

The SDA cannot claim involvement in such weighty and earlier contributions just after slavery ended, such as the free-village movement, the denominational system of education that emerged around 1834 and onwards, nor the founding of building societies, the first of which was by the Reverend William Gardner of the Congregational Church in 1872.

However, the contribution of the SDA church in Jamaica since their arrival in the 1890's has been enormous and consequential. This essay focused on what it has done in education, health care, youth, communication, and social development as well as its spiritual contribution in molding the nation. Not enough was said about what each believer in their private settings as an SDA Christian does in their workplaces and communities as exemplars of the Christian lifestyle. However, this too must be added their illustrious and profound contribution, under God.

Bibliography

Andrews University Digital Commons @ Andrews University Faculty Publications Church History January 2008 Exploring the Factors That Shaped the Early Adventist Mission to Jamaica Trevor O'Reggio Andrews University, toreggio@andrews.edu.

Abbey, David E., Paul K. Mills, Floyd F. Petersen, and W. Lawrence Beeson. 1991. Long-Term Ambient Concentrations of Total Suspended Particulates and Oxidants as Related to Incidence of Chronic Disease in California Seventh-Day Adventists. *Environmental Health Perspectives* 94: 43–50.

Baroni, Luciana. 2015. Vegetarianism in Food-Based Dietary Guidelines. *International Journal of Nutrition* 1: 48–73. [CrossRef]

Beezhold.

Bonnie L., Carol S. Johnston, and Deanna R. Daigle. 2009. Vegetarian Diets Are Associated with Healthy Mood States: A Cross-Sectional Study in Seventh Day Adventist Adults. *Nutrition Journal* 9: 26. [CrossRef].

Bryan, G. C., J. A. Johnson, L. Dawes, and C. Samuel. 2012. An Assessment of the Risk Factors for Type 2 Diabetes among Women in Rural Jamaica. *West Indian Medical Journal* 61: 809–13. [PubMed]

Buettner, Dan. 2008.

Fundamental Beliefs. 2015. General Conference of Seventh-Day Adventists. Available online: https://szu.adventist.org/wp-content/uploads/2016/04/28_Beliefs.pdf (accessed on 26 June 2018).

“General Statistics by Division for 2017,” *2019 Annual Statistical Report: 155th Report of the General Conference of Seventh-day Adventists for 2017* (Office of Archives, Statistics, and Research, Silver Spring, Maryland, 2019), 36.

“History of the Northern Caribbean University.” *Northern Caribbean University: A Seventh-day Adventist Institution*. Accessed January 23, 2019. www.ncu.edu.jm/weare.

Jamaica,” *Encyclopædia Britannica*, accessed February 4, 2019, <https://www.britannica.com/place/Jamaica>.

Jamaica,” *Encyclopædia Britannica*, accessed January 22, 2019, <https://www.britannica.com/place/Jamaica>.

“Jamaica Union Conference,” *Seventh-day Adventist Yearbook* (Nampa, Idaho: Pacific Press, 2019), 122.

Knight, George R. *A Brief History of Seventh-Day Adventists*. Hagerstown, MD: Review and Herald Pub. Association, 2012.

**Land, Gary. *Historical Dictionary of Seventh-Day Adventists*.
Lanham, MD: Scarecrow Press, 005. Page 151-152**

Loughborough, J. N. *The Great Second Advent Movement: Its Rise and Progress*. Nashville, Tennessee: Southern Publishing Association, 2015.

Miller, Errol. 2015. 'The Church and its Impact on Nation-Building: Real or Imagined' Bethel Baptist Church, 60th anniversary lecture, November 11, 2015.

<https://news.illu.edu/health-wellness/paper-explores-global-influence-of-seventh-day-adventist-church-diet>

Schwarz, Richard W. *Light Bearers to the Remnant: Denominational History Textbook for Seventh-Day Adventist College Classes*. Mountain View, CA: Pacific Press Pub. Association, 1979.

The Blue Zone: Lessons for Living Longer from the People Who've Lived the Longest. Washington, DC: National Geographic.

Additional Source- <https://adventist.news/en/news/book-chronicles-adventist-church-history-of-cayman-islands>.

**SHOULD MINORS HAVE
EQUAL RIGHTS TO THOSE
OF THEIR PARENTS?**

Joan Pinkney

PhD

Introduction

Local and international laws, charters, sociology, psychology, Scripture, philosophy, and anthropology mandate rights for children. Children are viewed as vulnerable, defenseless, and incapable of providing for and protecting themselves. As a result, legal, moral, and other special systems are put in place to protect them from neglect, abuse, and exploitation. On the other hand, parents are generally viewed as individuals who are legally responsible for children and possess greater rights within the parent-child relationship. As custodians, parents have a wide range of control over their children, as well as the right to make all the decisions concerning their physical and social welfare, including their cultural experiences, economic well-being and continuing development. This paper seeks to examine

the rights of children and the rights of their parents. It also aims to support the argument that the rights of children should be equal to that of their parents.

Defining Rights, Child, and Parent

The Stanford Encyclopedia of Philosophy described rights as entitlements, and categorized rights as moral privileges that are grounded in reason. In addition, rights are important normative rules which express what is allowed or owed to people. These are usually based on some legal system, social convention or an ethical theory. Rights are very important in several disciplines including law and ethics (Wenar, 2015). William R. Thomas posited that a right is basically an individual privilege. It pertains to everyone and not just some members of a particular group. Thomas added, that fundamental rights do not conflict; they include “the basic right to life, liberty and property” (Thomas, 2013). The Children Guardianship and Custody Act, Jamaica 2004 (2017), defined a child or a minor as “a person under the age of eighteen years but does not include a person who is, or has been married,” as is stated in other literature that deals with the rights of parents and children. It is recognized that some jurisdictions, for example the United states of America, utilize the term “underage” to refer to individuals who are below the legal age for voting, drinking, or sexual consent. Interestingly, the age of sexual consent in Jamaica is 16, the “drinking age” is 16, while the driving and voting age is 18 respectively. The Child Care and Protection Act Jamaica (2004) designated the age of criminal responsibility as 12, while the Legal Dictionary made the distinction between persons under the age of 14, and minors under the age of 18 years (Criminal law, n.d.).

The Children Guardianship and Custody Act Jamaica 2004, (2017), defined the “parent” of a child as “any person at law, liable to maintain such child or entitled to its custody,” which in most cases are the biological parents. Legal guardians, step parents, adoptive parents, and even grand-parents are recognizable by law as having these rights over children in their custody and care” (The Children Guardianship and Custody Act, 2004). In addition, definitions.net defined parent as, “a father or mother; one who begets or one who gives birth to or nurtures and raises a child; a relative who plays the role of guardian; one of the two persons from whom one is immediately biologically descended; a person who acts as a parent in rearing a

child; a step-parent or adoptive parent” (Parent, n.d.).

Rights of the Child

So, what rights do children and parents have? Can those rights be equated? The internationally accepted rights for children are entrenched in the United Nations Convention on the Rights of the Child (UNCRC, 2015), and has been ratified by all countries worldwide, except one up until 2015. That one country is the United States of America (Mehta, 2015). The UNCRC has been described as providing the most complete statement of children’s rights and is the most widely ratified international human rights treaty in human history. Its 54 articles cover all aspects of a child’s life and specify the civil, political, economic, social, and cultural rights to which children everywhere are entitled (UNCRC, 2015).

The Child Care and Protection Act Jamaica 2004 (2017), Jamaica, that aligns with the UNCRC has encapsulated the rights of the child in three groups:

- 1. Protection Rights: Rights that protect children from all types of violence, abuse, neglect, and exploitation;**
- 2. Provision Rights: Rights that guarantee the basic things that children need for survival, growth, and development; and**
- 3. Participation Rights: Rights that ensure children’s views are considered when adults are making decisions that affect them, and that opportunities are provided for them to share their views**

(The Child Care and Protection Act Jamaica 2004 (2017)).

The rights of children are inalienable (UNCRC, 2015). These are rights which are bestowed on all children even if the parents are unable or unwilling to apportion those rights to their children. Rights are accorded to children because they are human beings. The United Nations International Children’s Emergency Fund (UNICEF) asserts that “children are neither the property of their parents nor are they helpless objects of charity. Children are human beings who are the subject of their own rights.”

The Rights of Parents

Jamaica’s Child Care and Protection Act Jamaica 2004, (2017) acknowledged that “a family is the preferred environment for the care

and upbringing of children and the responsibility for the protection of children rests primarily with the parents.” The rights of parents merge into their responsibilities and obligations to the children under their care, in a set of activities that spontaneously result in trust, affection and intimacy that cannot be re-distributed. Children raised by their biological parents in a stable, intact home, usually have distinct advantages when compared to children raised by adoptive parents, step-parents, divorced parents, cohabiting parents, or other parental arrangements. To augment this, the Children’s Rights in Wales.org, (1990), lists the most important parental roles as:

- i. Providing a home for the child;**
- ii. Protecting and maintaining the child;**
- iii. Disciplining the child;**
- iv. Choosing and providing for the child’s education;**
- v. Agreeing to the child’s medical treatment;**
- vi. Naming the child and agreeing to any change in name; and**
- vii. Looking after the child’s property (Children’s Rights in Wales.org., 1990).**

The rights of parents to implement control and care over their children have been inviolable in the USA. The liberty guarantee of the due process clause of the Fourteenth Amendment that is held by the Supreme Court includes “the right of the individual to establish a home and bring up children.” The Courts have traditionally reflected Western civilization in terms of a parent who is an adult and a minor child who is with an adult parent. Under the US constitution, the State can conclude that parents and those with primary responsibility for children’s wellbeing are entitled to and usually receive the support of laws designed to assist them to discharge that responsibility (Calvin, et al. 2009, p. 33).

Brennan & Noggle (1997) reported John Locke’s claim that parental rights rest on the principle of parental power which gives parents the privilege to govern and make rational decisions for the good of their children. In support of Locke’s statement, Brennan & Noggle (1997) referred to parental rights as stewardship rights. These rights include the responsibility to protect and secure someone considered worthwhile of being cared for and preserved. Additionally,

Article 488 of the USA Civil Code, paragraph 1, specifies the duties that parents should uphold in raising their children and the conditions which should foster the development of spiritual, moral and social harmony (Munteanu, 2014, p.703).

Arguments Supporting Parents' Rights as Superior

Writte & Browning (2012) supported the rights of the parent over those of the child. They contended that rights in the parent-child relationship should be reserved for adults exclusively until the child becomes an adult. This argument claimed that the UNCRC did not adequately consider the stages of development of the child that is characterized by specific needs and interests; and that without parents those needs and interests would not be administered as the child does not have the capacity to order them. Writte & Browning (2012) reinforced the belief that sanctioning equal children's rights jeopardizes the rights that parents have to nurture their children in keeping with the parents' beliefs system and children's obligation to conform. Provisions such as the child's right to privacy, the right to express views freely, and the right to freedom of association are positioned to restrict parents' efforts to shape the value system, conscience, religion, relations, and the necessary life skills which are fundamental to a child becoming a fully functioning adult (pp, 993 & 996).

Moschella (2014) opined that the rights of parents are embedded in the special obligations, duties and responsibilities by virtue of being parents of the child. These special obligations, responsibilities and duties correspond with the needs of the child, and parents should be free to guide and direct the upbringing of their children on their commitment to do so. Parental authority and the right to exercise that authority would be compromised if the rights granted to the child are equal to or supersede those of their parents. Put another way, equating parents' right with their children would contravene the principle of authority and leadership which parents seek to uphold. (Moschella, 2014).

Brennan & Noggle, (1997) advanced 'the commonsense thesis' which refers to the immature state of the child in various areas of development and which in turn ratifies the need for parental guidance and nurturing. Those immature states depicted limited cognitive powers, and inexperience to make informed decisions and

judgements. Brennan & Noggle, (1997) also contended that it was only reasonable or commonsense, that parents be endowed with the authority and the rights to give that guidance and nurturing during the child's vulnerable years (pp. 3). Nature's contribution has also been a part of the discussion that is in favor of superior parental rights. To demonstrate this, Condie (2003) declared that bonding and imprinting, are important activities that nature establishes between human parents and child. Parent and infant are impelled into strong emotional connections so that the infant will seek proximity to the parent in order to be fed and protected (pp. 89-91). According to Condie (2003) parental rights are fundamental in accomplishing the responsibilities for food and protection, and should not be changed by un-natural societal policies.

Arguments Supporting Minor's Rights as Equal

Wattenberg et al, (2001) conducted a study in Minnesota, United States of America (USA) with 103 children who were in state care, and presented arguments from the study, that supported the equal rights of the child. The study also explored the circumstances relating to the parents who neglected and abused their children, which was the rationale for the termination of their parental rights. Additionally, the study revealed that more than 80% of the mothers and more than 60% of the fathers had multiple problems including mental disorders such as, personality disorders, depression, bipolar, and schizophrenia, were engaged in high-risk behaviors such as substance abuse, had criminal records and were abused during childhood. The evidence of severe damage to the children of these parents, most being 3 years and younger, underscored the argument that adequate provisions under societal laws must be enforced to protect the rights of the child (pp. 408-421). The study concluded that if parental rights are left unchecked; some children would be at the mercy of abusive and mentally depraved parents. If the rights of the child were unequal and inadequate in those circumstances, the chances of the children being rescued would be totally impossible. In addition, the Minnesota study supported several other studies which were conducted in the USA, and which produced similar results and conclusions.

Brian Howe, (2001) expounded that the United Nations Convention on the Rights of the Child, posited that it is children who have 'basic rights,' not their parents. Basic or fundamental rights are

claims that are valid and should be considered highly important in public policy, laws and the institutions of a state. The rights awarded to parents are conditional and not fundamental. Parents' rights are inherently allied with their obligations to their children and they are obliged to act in the best interest of the children in all circumstances (Howe, 2001, pp. 61-62).

The "Equal Consideration Thesis" is another argument that supports the equal rights of the child. This thesis recognized that children's rights' entitlement should hold similar moral respect as adults.' This argument is not claiming that parents and their children should have the same rights and duties, rather it is submitting that as appropriate rights and duties are conferred on children, they must be treated with the same measure of respect and value as parents and should not be relegated to an inferior moral status (Brennan & Noggle, 1997, pp 3-4).

A study on Parenting and Family Structure in Jamaica and the wider Caribbean Islands, noted that general child-rearing methods in Jamaica have been highly repressive, severe, and abusive and that parents' disciplinary measures were developmentally inappropriate (Smith & Mosby, 2003, pp. 370-381). The study further stated that physical punishment was culturally sanctioned, and generally viewed as the norm, having the support of parents, relatives, teachers, and some religious leaders. The practice of inflicting corporal punishment, found credence in Proverbs 13:24, (New King James Version) "He that spareth his rod hateth his son: but he that loveth him chasteneth him betimes." To discredit this as a rationale for physical and other abuse to children, David in Psalm 127:3, (King James Version) affirmed that 'Children are a heritage from the Lord...' God having invested a great legacy in children, expects that this legacy should be safe guarded and valued (Bible Hub, 2017). Awarding value to children should be through credible means such as equal rights accorded to children by parents as they direct their development. Where abuse and denial of equal rights exist, these mitigate against God's divine plan for His children (Writte & Browning, (2012).

Since children have unique needs, are human beings and valued citizens, as adults, they

should have a significant input towards the positive growth and development of society, currently and in the future, and should not be deprived of a similar spectrum of rights as adults or parents. Children deserve to be heard so that when they become adults, they will willingly invest similar level of regard for the children of their generation. While the rights of children and parents may differ in some respects, children's rights should proportionately and adequately contest the rights of parents in anticipation of conditions where the opportunity for exploitation, manipulation and other kinds of abuse exist (Ndofirepi, & Cross, 2015, p. 236).

Conclusion

The Convention of the Rights of the Child (CRC) defined children as human beings deserving dignity and respect, having rights to survival through the provision of adequate health care and other basic needs for food, clothing, shelter, education, and security. The UNCRC expects countries that have ratified the Convention to ensure that systems and mechanisms are implemented and maintained to fulfill the obligations to children. The discussion on the rights of children usually includes parental rights as it may be difficult to discuss one without the other. The fact that both sets of individuals are humans with moral values, they should be viewed as having equal respect despite the differences of their developmental stages, responsibilities, duties and the rights conferred on them by law (Mama, 2010). To say that children do not have the same basic human rights as adults or parents is to deny their status as viable human beings.

Calvin et al., (2009) articulated that the US Courts have acknowledged that children are vulnerable and as such are often exposed to abuse, violence, and neglect particularly by parents who have also suffered similarly at the hands of their caregivers. The Courts considered the role of the state as central to ensuring that children develop in an environment that is safe, and free from harm, that engenders positive psychological, physical, intellectual, emotional, and spiritual development. Children are important to the future of any nation and the state has reserved the right to regulate, limit, or revoke parental rights in circumstances in which children are at risk. To facilitate this role, the rights of the child must supersede or at best be equal to the rights of the parents. A democratic society must seek to preserve the health and well-rounded growth of its

children by guiding them toward becoming mature and responsible citizens, who can contribute fruitfully to that society. To secure this, the society must regulate against impeding restraints and dangers regardless of the source (Calvin et al, 2009, p. 34). If the rights of the child are less than commensurate with that of their parents, the society may fail at rescuing what matters most.

Works Cited

- Bible Hub, (2017). Psalm 127:3. In Matthew Henry Concise Commentary Retrieved from <http://biblehub.com/commentaries/psalms/127-3.htm>**
- Brennan, S., & Noggle, R. (1997). The moral status of children: Children's rights, parents' rights, and family justice. *Social Theory and Practice, 23*(1), 1-26. Retrieved from <https://search.proquest.com/docview/199306459?accountid=40162>**
- Calvin, J., Colon, M., & Houston, K., (2009). *The Michigan Child Welfare Law Journal. XII, (IV). pp. 33-34. Child. (n.d.) Burton's Legal Thesaurus, 4E. (2007). Retrieved September 19 2017 from <http://legal-dictionary.thefreedictionary.com/child>***
- Children's Rights in Wales.org, (1990). *Why Children's Right? United Nations Convention on the Rights of the Child; Retrieved from: <http://www.childrenrightswales.org.uk/why-childrens-rights.aspx>***
- Condie, L. O. (2003). *Parenting Evaluations for the Court: Care and Protection Matters. New York: Springer.***
- Criminal Law. (n.d.) *West's Encyclopedia of American Law, edition 2. (2008). Retrieved September 19 2017 from <http://legal-dictionary.thefreedictionary.com/Criminal+Law>***
- Government of Jamaica. *The Child Care Protection Act (2004). Retrieved from: http://www.moj.gov.jm/sites/default/files/laws/Child%20Care%20and%20Protection%20Act_0.pdf***
- Howe, R. B. (2001). Do parents have fundamental rights? *Journal of Canadian Studies, 36*(3), 61-78. Retrieved from <https://search.proquest.com/docview/203555363?accountid=40162>**

Thomas, W.R., (June, 2013). What Are Rights? *Atlas Society*. University of Michigan.

Retrieved May 12, 2016 <http://Atlasspcoetu.org/objectivism/atlas-university/what-are-rights>

Mama, R. S. (2010). Needs, rights, and the human family: The practicality of the convention on the rights of the child. *Child Welfare, 89*(5), 177-89. Retrieved from <https://search.proquest.com/docview/866205745?accountid=4016>

2

Mehta, S. (2015), *There's Only One Country That Hasn't Ratified the Convention on Children's Rights: US*. American Civil Liberties Union. Retrieved September 20, 2017 from: <https://www.aclu.org/blog/human-rights/treaty-ratification/theres-only-one-country-hasn-t-ratified-convention-children>

Moschella, M. (December 2014). Natural Law, Parental Rights and Education Policy, *The American Journal of Jurisprudence, 59*(2), 197-227. Doi: [org/10.1093/ajj/auu010](https://doi.org/10.1093/ajj/auu010)

Munteanu, C. (2014). The Child's Education – Object of Parental Arental Authority Regarding The Child's Personality. *Contemporary Readings in Law and Social Justice*, 6(1), 701-710. Retrieved from <https://search.proquest.com/docview/1550172309?accountid=40162>

Ndofirepi, A., & Cross, M. (2015). Child's voice, child's right: Is philosophy for children in Africa the answer? *Interchange*, 46(3), 225-238. doi: <http://dx.doi.org/10.1007/s10780-015-9250-x>

Smith, D. E., & Mosby, G. (2003). Jamaican child-rearing practices: The role of corporal punishment. *Adolescence*, 38 (150), 370-381

The Children Guardian and Custody Act of 2004, Jamaica V1 (2017)

UNICEF. (19, May, 2014). *Protecting Children's Rights. Convention on the Rights of the Child*. Retrieved from:

http://www.unicef.org/crc/index_protecting.html

United Nations Convention on the Rights of the Child (1989). Retrieved 18/3/2016.

<http://www.ohchr.org/en/professionalinterest/pages/crc.aspx>

Wattenberg, E., Kelley, M., & Kim, H. (2001). When the rehabilitation ideal fails: A study of parental rights termination. *Child Welfare, 80*(4), 405-31. Retrieved from <https://search.proquest.com/docview/213809466?accountid=4016>

2

Wenar, L., (2015). "Rights", *The Stanford Encyclopedia of Philosophy*, Edward N. Zalta (ed.), URL = <https://plato.stanford.edu/archives/fall2015/entries/rights/>

Witte, J., Jr, & Browning, D. S. (2012). Christianity's Mixed Contributions to Children's Rights: Traditional Teachings, Modern Doubts. *Emory Law Journal, 61*, 991-1014. Retrieved from <https://search.proquest.com/docview/1037800113?accountid=401>

62

**AN ARGUMENT
FOR ETERNAL
SECURITY**

Leroy Williams

Dip Th; BA

Two of the most debated views in Christendom concerning Salvation are John Calvin's *Perseverance of the Saints* (Eternal Security) and Jacobus Arminius' *Fall from Grace* (Saved & Lost). John Calvin (1509 – 1564) was one of the leading reformers; he developed the 5 point teaching known as Calvinism TULIP Theology. Jacobus Arminius (1560 – 1609) countered Calvin's arguments and presented 5 opposing views that gave rise to Arminianism.

Perseverance of the Saints is the last point in Calvin's TULIP Theology. This (eternal security) is the subject with which we are contending. Calvinism says once a person is truly saved, that salvation cannot be lost. On the other hand Arminians say it is possible to fall from Grace (lose your salvation). Both groups have salient passages of scripture to support their viewpoint. The key difference however between the two schools of thought is how they understand the act of salvation and also on whom the emphasis is placed.

Calvinists place the emphasis of eternal security on God's Sovereignty. They believe that God has to produce in us the decisive desire for Christ. The Apostle emphasizes this sovereign choice in *Romans 9:6 – 29*. He says in verse 6, "It does not, therefore, depend on human desire or effort, but on God's mercy." This act of Grace

moves a person from a condition of spiritual unbelief to a condition of heartfelt belief or faith in Christ; and from God's perspective it is lasting faith. There are several other passages in the New Testament lend support to this argument (we will look at some of these verses later).

On the other hand Arminians place the emphasis on man's responsibility. They believe man must produce in himself the decisive desire for Christ. God offers salvation to everyone; it is everyone's responsibility to choose that offer of salvation. That is the starting point of salvation they say. So, the big difference then is whether God produces the desire for Himself in man or whether man creates that desire in himself for God.

It is important to note that everything begins with God and ends with God. Before the beginning, ie before anything existed, God thought of creation then brought it into being (read John 17:5). Then He made man (Gen 1:26, 27), sinless, to have continual fellowship with Him. God placed Adam in the Garden of Eden to take care of it but commanded him not to eat of the tree in the middle of the garden or he would die (Gen. 2:16 – 17). Theologians say the moment Adam disobeyed and eat the fruit two (2) aspects of death took place. Firstly, man died spiritually, that is, he lost fellowship with God (*“Therefore, just as sin entered the world through one man, and death through sin, and in this way death came to all people, because all sinned”* (Rom. 5:12). Secondly, the process of physical death began (man's body was now corrupted) the very moment man sinned (Gen. 3:19) and he would eventually die physically one day.

So everyone born after Adam is born spiritually dead (out of fellowship with God) and condemned to eternal death (Ps. 51:5; Rom. 6:23). Only God can change such a person's condition, so He made a plan to bring man back into fellowship (be made alive again) with Himself. This is what the bible calls an act of Grace. A careful reading of Ephesians Chapter 2:1 - 9 shows what God did and that He did it to last forever. He *“made us alive with Christ even when we were dead in transgressions”* (v. 5). *Then comes the most central verse in all of Ephesians concerning salvation; “For it is by grace you have been saved, through faith—and this is not from yourselves, it is the gift of*

God” (Eph. 2:8). Not only does this verse relate to salvation, it relates also to eternal security (*it is the gift of God*). It is important to note that God would never take back this “gift of Grace” He has given to us.

The Bible says, “The gifts and calling of God are without repentance” (Romans 11:29). This means He will not take back His gift of salvation. A number of Bible Commentators comment on this verse of Scripture, and in particular on the word “without repentance”. The following are some of the comments:

***Ellicott:* Not to be revoked or withdrawn, not even to be regretted**

***Gill:* “ without repentance; that is, they are immutable and unalterable; God never revokes them, or calls them in again, or takes them away from the persons to whom he has made such a previous donation”**

***Meyer:* “*Unrepented*, and so subject to no recall, *are the displays of grace and* (especially) *the calling of God.*”**

***Vincent:* Not subject to recall.**

All these commentators seem to support the point that salvation is a perfect work of God, not man, never to be altered. Someone cites a Quote from R.C. Sproul, “writing to the Philippians, Paul says, ‘*He who has begun a good work in you will perfect it to the end*’ (Phil. 1:6). Therein is the promise of God that what He starts in our souls, He intends to finish. So the old axiom in Reformed theology about the perseverance of the saints is this: If you have it—that is, if you have genuine faith and are in a state of saving grace—you will never lose it. If you lose it, you never had it.”

Concerning saved and lost, some of those who hold to the teaching of Arminians say that although God will not take back his salvation, one can voluntarily fall from grace. They say if you backslide and do not return to the Lord you will lose your salvation and end up in hell. Those who hold to Eternal Security use as a key passage of scripture Jesus’ words, “*My sheep listen to my voice; I know them, and they follow*

me. I give them eternal life, and they shall never perish; no one will snatch them out of my hand. My Father, who has given them to me, is greater than all; no one can snatch them out of my Father's hand. I and the Father are one" (John 10:27 – 30). It stands to reason that if no one can pluck us out of the Father's hands, then we cannot jump out either. Other passages that support Eternal Security are John 3:16 (think of what the word *eternal life* connotes); John 6:38 – 39, 65; 11:25 – 26.

Some theologians use the parable of the Loving Father (*The lost/prodigal son*) in Luke 15:11 – 32 to show the spiritual relationship between God and the Christian. Although the son in the story went off track he still remained SON of the father. The question is, If the son had died before he returned to the father, would he still be the son of the father? Those who hold to eternal security answer this question in the affirmative. The difference here is *relationship* as against *fellowship*. One can be a son (related to the father) but yet out of fellowship with the father. So is it with the Christian who is born of God, irrespective of the condition, that person is still a child and God will never condemn His children. Nevertheless, unconfessed sin can keep the Christian out of fellowship with God.

Fellowship with God is an important feature in a Christian's relationship with Christ. Look at John's argument in chapter one of his 1st Epistle to Christians. He says, "***God is light ... (and) ... if we claim to have fellowship with him and yet walk in the darkness, we lie and do not live out the truth"*** (vv. 5 & 6). He further says, "***If we claim to be without sin, we deceive ourselves and the truth is not in us"*** (v.8). We can conclude then, that sin keeps us out of fellowship with God. So the key to remain in fellowship with God is to confess our sins. "***If we confess our sins, he is faithful and just and will forgive us our sins and purify us from all unrighteousness"*** (v.9). So the point is this: To be related to God and continue in fellowship with Him is to acknowledge that we are not without sin, appropriate the blood of Jesus (confess sins) and thus walk in the light (fellowship with God). "***But if we walk in the light, as he is in the light, we have fellowship with one another, and the blood of Jesus, his Son, purifies us from all sin"*** (v.7).

Regarding the dynamics of fellowship and relationship I wish to use a two-sphere imagery to illustrate the argument of eternal security. Imagine there are two spheres. Sphere one is called “the age”, whose god is the Devil. Only unbelievers are in this sphere. The bible says, *“The god of this age has blinded the minds of unbelievers, so that they cannot see the light of the gospel that displays the glory of Christ, who is the image of God”* (2 Cor.4:4). Sphere two is called the Kingdom of Light (Col.1:12) and heavenly realms (Eph.1:3, 20; 2:6). The God of this sphere is Christ Jesus, and only believers reside here. Scripture says, *“For he has rescued us from the dominion of darkness (sphere 1) and brought us into the kingdom (sphere 2) of the Son he loves”* (Col. 1:13).

So here we have two separate spheres, those who have been transferred by the Spirit to sphere two cannot go back over to sphere one. Every person in sphere two is bound for heaven because the Spirit has brought them into a relationship with God. We read in Ephesians, *“And God raised us up with Christ and seated us with him in the heavenly realms in Christ Jesus”* (Eph.2:6). However, not everyone is walking in fellowship with God, although bound for heaven. Seated in Christ Jesus speaks of being in a relationship with Christ and having God as our Father. Nevertheless, we can be living away from God – out of fellowship with him. Christians living in disobedience to God can attract discipline, although not condemnation (in hell). The Apostle Paul bears out this aspect of Christian discipline in his letter to the Corinthians.

In 1Corinthians 11 Paul was addressing the communion service (vv. 23 – 34) and issued a warning. You would recall that the Corinthian church seemed unashamed about their sinful behavior (living out of fellowship with God). They failed to examine themselves, so Paul said, *“That is why many among you are weak and sick, and a number of you have fallen asleep”* (1Cor. 11:30). The “fallen asleep” is actually physical death. Paul says they should examine themselves and confess their sins or else be judged. *“But if we were more discerning with regard to ourselves, we would not come under such judgment. Nevertheless, when we are judged in this way by the Lord, we are being disciplined so that we will not be finally condemned with*

the world (vv. 31 – 32). Sickness and death can be a form of judgment/discipline for the sinning believer (but they will not be condemned).

John's letter to the church at Laodicea in Revelation 3:14 – 22 also highlights the importance of fellowship with God. One of the central verses (v.3:20) in the passage is used by evangelists to invite sinners to Christ. However that interpretation does not seem consistent with the passage. It seem clear that the passage is addressing the church (Christians). The picture is Christ standing at the door of the church (believers), desiring that we would open the door so He can come in again and have fellowship with us: ***“Behold, I stand at the door, and knock: if any man hear my voice, and open the door, I will come in to him, and will sup with him, and he with me”*** (Rev.3:20 KJV). One of the most controversial questions regarding the doctrine of eternal security is the question of someone who does not come back into fellowship with God making it to heaven?

This question is best answered by the Apostle Paul's argument about the ***Judgment for Christians*** at the Judgment Seat of Christ (the Bema). Paul says, ***“For we must all appear before the judgment seat of Christ, so that each of us may receive what is due us for the things done while in the body, whether good or bad”*** (2 Cor 5:10). Good and bad works are in view here. 1Cor. 3:10 – 15 elaborate on the experience at the judgment; this is where all works will be tested. The works are represented by ***“...gold, silver, costly stones; wood, hay or straw”*** (v.12). They will be tested by fire. It must be noted that the first set of works (gold, silver, costly stones) are not generally burnt up by fire. However, the second set of works (wood, hay, straw) can be burnt up. ***“If what has been built survives, the builder will receive a reward. If it is burned up, the builder will suffer loss but yet will be saved—even though only as one escaping through the flames”*** (vv.14 &15). Specific mention is made of the man living in sexual immorality and not repenting. Read 1Corinthians 5:1 – 5. Paul says to, ***“hand this man over to Satan for the destruction of the flesh, so that his spirit may be saved on the day of the Lord”*** (v.5).

Bible Scholars say the builder whose work represents gold, silver and costly stones is the Christian who remains faithful to the Lord. His work survives and he receives a reward. On the other hand the builder whose work represents wood, hay and straw is the Christian who once ran well but fell out of fellowship with God. His work is burnt up and he loses his reward, *“but yet will be saved ... only as one escaping through the flames”* (v.15). Of course the one escaping the flames represents the one who is truly born again, the one whom the Holy Spirit confirms/testifies with his spirit that he is a son of God (*Rom.8:16*). The Holy Spirit is the central Witness confirming a person’s genuine relationship to the Father. *“For those who are led by the Spirit of God are the children of God. The Spirit you received does not make you slaves, so that you live in fear again; rather, the Spirit you received brought about your adoption to sonship. And by him we cry, “Abba, Father.” The Spirit himself testifies with our spirit that we are God’s children* (*Rom.8:14 – 16*).

Notwithstanding the convincing arguments for and against eternal security from several theologians who have defended their views with careful exegetical studies, the contending views will, I believe, outlast this age. However, in my opinion it is good to hold to one of these views without claim that the other is in error. Hebrews 6:4 – 6 is one of those central passages heavily debated on the subject. For what it’s worth I will present a footnote on the passage from Dr. Charles C. Ryrie. *“It is impossible for those who have once been enlightened, who have tasted the heavenly gift, who have shared in the Holy Spirit, who have tasted the goodness of the word of God and the powers of the coming age and who have fallen away, to be brought back to repentance. To their loss they are crucifying the Son of God all over again and subjecting him to public disgrace”* (*Heb. 6:4 – 6*).¹

CONCLUSION:

¹ On this passage, see the Ryrie Study Bible.

One of the most important arguments communicated in the foregoing is the correlation between relationship and fellowship. Relationship with God is formed only once and cannot be broken or come to an end. On the other hand fellowship can be broken. A person can go off track or off the path and then return to fellowship with God a number of times within that person's Christian journey. From the perspective of relationship, two salient points have been made. One is about Jesus' words of assurance, "*My sheep listen to my voice; I know them, and they follow me. I give them eternal life, and they shall never perish; no one will snatch them out of my hand*" (John 10:27-28). The other is his parable of the prodigal son in Luke 15:11-32. God produces in the unbeliever the decisive desire for Christ, and brings that person into a relationship Himself. This act of sovereign Grace is purely on God's part.

After discussing God's sovereign choice of both Jews and Gentiles in Romans 9 to 11, The Apostle Paul concluded: "*Oh, the depth of the riches of the wisdom and knowledge of God!*

How unsearchable his judgments, and his paths beyond tracing out! Who has known the mind of the Lord? Or who has been his counselor? Who has ever given to God, that God should repay them? For from him and through him and for him are all things.

To him be the glory forever! Amen. (Ro.11:33 – 36).

Finally, I would presume that those who hold to the teaching of Saved and Lost ought to be unsure if they will make it to heaven seeing one cannot guarantee that one will NOT be tempted by the world, the flesh or the devil and fall away. As 1Corinthians 10:12 states, "*So, if you think you are standing firm, be careful that you don't fall!*" This thought must create a measure of fear and uncertainty. On the other hand my encouragement to those who hold to the other view, is not to see the doctrine of Eternal Security as a free pass to gain heaven, although heaven is already secured for the believer (if he is truly born again), but rather remain faithful so they will receive a reward (a prize, a crown) and not have their works burnt up and lose the reward (1Cor. 9:24 – 27.

**THE CHRISTIAN BRETHREN
MOVEMENT AND ITS
CONTRIBUTION TO THE WEST
INDIAN LANDSCAPE**

Vincent Ross

MA (cand.)

THE BEGINNING

The word is that in the 1820s, two groups of men began meeting in their homes simply to ‘break bread’, and do Bible study. One group met in Dublin, while the other met in Plymouth, unconnected to each other. Eventually they got to know about each other and discovered that they were of the same persuasion; thus the start of the Brethren Movement.

They had become disillusioned with the established church because they believed that the church had lost focus and had become

‘worldly’, due in part to its close connection with the State. The aim of these brethren was to provide a fellowship in which all true believers could worship together, gathered around the Lord’s Table, and study the Scriptures without being divided by differing denominational allegiances.

Among the early leaders were J.N. Darby (1800-82); Benjamin Willis Newton (1807-99); George Muller (1805-98); Anthony Norris Groves (1795-1853).

Darby was a member of the clergy when he first joined the Brethren in 1827. He eventually left the Established church of Ireland to work with the brethren to strengthen the movement. He was a bible scholar (there are Darby translations of the Bible in French, English, and German), bible teacher and evangelist. The brethren was opened to anyone who expressed faith in Jesus Christ, but in later years it was thought that false doctrines were creeping into the movement and so Darby thought that some amount of exclusivity was needed. This led to disagreement among the brethren, causing a split in the movement in 1848. On the one hand there were those who were restrictive about who to receive into the fellowship and which church groups to associate with and are referred to as Exclusive or Closed Brethren; these lean mostly to Darby’s influence. On the other hand there are those who are, to varying degrees, Open. It is to this group that the writer of this paper belongs, now identified as the Christian Brethren Assemblies Jamaica (CBAJ).

JN Darby travelled all over the world spreading the movement and strengthening the small groups. In 1850 Darby along with G.V. Wigram, another outstanding man of the movement, are said to have visited, preached and set up the first Brethren assemblies in Jamaica. It is unclear how many brethren assemblies existed by 1900 but all seem to have been Exclusive.

THE Early DAYS IN JAMAICA

The first Christian Brethren Assembly was established in Jamaica in the early 20th Century. The exact date is unknown, as these believers are not noted for keeping records. They met at Hanover Street, Slipe Road, West Race Course and finally 188 Orange Street, the present home, known as Assembly Hall.

It started as Exclusive/Closed brethren, but as the saints committed themselves to the study of the word (Sola scriptura) they became more and more convinced that exclusivity was not how the church should go. Brothers Eustace Mais, Bryan Caws, Alexander Daniels, James Green, Herman Thorn, along with their wives, led the walk out, being joined later by brothers Herbert Harris, George Foster, Vincent Foster, and others, this according to Leo Smith, former elder, now deceased. All told, about fifty (50) of them left and started to meet at 81A Slipe Road, about half mile above where they presently meet. As can be imagined, they were struggling, but in 1923, Leonard and Irene Bewick, Missionaries from the USA came and began serving

among these brethren. The Bewicks also, by the grace of GOD established a Back to The Bible office in 1958.

The effort was strengthened with the coming of two more Missionaries, William and Grace Gibson from Canada, in 1925, who were also primarily responsible, by GOD's grace, for the founding and establishing of Maranatha Gospel Hall, in 1929.

In 1928, another missionary, George Henry Hale, wife Edith and three sons, from New Zealand, were instrumental in starting the Elim Assembly in the Shortwood Road, Kingston 8 area, after serving in Guyana for three years. He served at Elim until 1949.

The man who impacted the movement the most in Jamaica is identified as Harold Wildish, a Missionary from England, along with his wife Marion. Under his ministry through tent crusades, in crusades, and other gospel meetings across the island, thousands came to know the LORD JESUS as their own personal Saviour. The involvement of the foreign missionaries cannot be overlooked as men and their wives came to our shores for the purpose of preaching the gospel and planting churches.

THE WORK PROGRESSES

Through crusades and Street meetings, Assemblies were raised up in the Corporate Area, gradually spreading out into the rural areas. The present number of Assemblies stands in the mid eighties.

The mantra for the Brethren Movement was gospel presentation, and so the first set of these meeting places were known as Gospel Halls, not to be confused with the Associated Gospel Assemblies. In more recent times some identify themselves as Fellowship, Gospel Chapel, and Chapel; incidentally, the gospel focus is not as strong as it used to be.

EDUCATION

The Brethren started the Midland Bible Institute in about 1971, serving to train believers, particularly from among the brethren, in Bible education and missionary work. This work, spearheaded by Emile Turner and Frank Fenton was late in coming to fruition because of the view of the leading brethren of the day that Christian education is the responsibility of the church and so there was no need for saints to go to ‘Bible school’, and therefore no need to establish any such institution.

Some of the students are Jamaicans while a few are from the Caribbean and other foreign countries. Notable graduates are Dr Monica Burgher, Dr. Adrian Thomas, international church planter, Bro Gordon Vance Soutar, to name a few.

These men as well as other graduates like Donahue Collash, Colin Gray, Hugh Richards, Monica Burgher, Maureen (Lue) Bailey et al., have been serving in local and foreign churches, foreign missions, as

well as para-church organisations. Some of them have been and are lecturers in Seminaries, both local and foreign.¹

SCHOOL ANYONE?

The brethren have been very involved in education and so have established and maintained a number of Basic and Preparatory/Primary schools in both Corporate and Rural areas. Many outstanding professionals, both at home and abroad, started their educational journey in some of these brethren operated schools. There are names that come readily to mind but who will not be mentioned for there are many others, equally successful, whose names are not readily remembered, and so the paper would not show a true reflection of the schools' ministry and achievements.

SOCIAL INVOLVEMENT

The Brethren started a football team in about 1976 that goes by the name, Christian Ambassadors Footballers United (CAFU). The purpose of the team, which has become inter-denominational, is to use

¹ In 1995 Rev. Anthlone Wade [a Jamaican graduate of MBI] . . . became [Carver] College's fourth President. An academician with a passion for the ministry of the church of Jesus Christ, Rev. Wade directed the college to keep pace with the advancing educational standards in the United States. He won approval from the Board of Trustees to chart the bold course towards initial accreditation with the Association of Biblical Higher Education (formerly the Accrediting Association of Bible Colleges). In 1997, the college was awarded applicant status with the ABHE. Under Dr. Wade's leadership the main campus underwent several major renovations including remodeling the administration building, the gym and opening a new campus bookstore. A five-unit apartment complex was purchased on Nelson Street and remodeled to become Ripley Hall, an 18 bed men's dormitory. In 1998 an athletic program was launched and the Carver Cougars men's basketball program began their first season playing in the National Christian College Athletic Association (NCCAA).
<http://www.carver.edu/contents/Home/CarverHistory.html>. accessed 18.6.21.

the sport as a channel through which the gospel can be shared with men who would normally not be ‘going to church’, to hear the word. Numbered among former players are former National coaches Carl Brown and Rene Simoes. The driver of this ministry is Bro. Frederick D. Hemmings, a deacon at Assembly Hall.²

MISSION FIELD

The Brethren have been involved in Missionary work as well, commending some of their members to serve as missionaries in local and foreign fields. Brother Randall Taylor of Maranatha, in 1941 became the first Jamaican among the Open Brethren to become a commended full time worker. He and his wife Eldora worked in the Balaclava region from the 1940s for years, and through their ministry, the Emmaus Gospel Hall was established.

The first on foreign soil as a missionary was Roy Campbell of Maranatha, going to British Honduras, now Belize, in 1946. He was later joined by Richard Saeurlander, also of Maranatha. There he was able to plant four Brethren churches, now being overseen by another Jamaican ‘brethren’ missionary, Gordon ‘Dickie’ Soutar from the Harbour View Chapel. Stanford and May Kelly of Maranatha went to Haiti in 1940, apparently not as ‘commended’ workers.

Not to be outdone, several sisters have gone on the foreign mission field; Gloria Amritt (Colombia), Gloria Edwards, Celile Carey, Vera Jones (all to Belize), Georgia Rankine, Jean Wong (Haiti), Elaine

² For more on CAFU, see *Acts: A Contextual Commentary* (Kingston: EMI, 2020), APPENDIX 2..

Huie, twin sisters Daphne and Lilla (all to Africa), Audrey Haynes (Guadeloupe) and Linda Lowe (Hong Kong). These sisters, for the most part were able to use their professional training (nurses, teachers mainly) while they shared the gospel. Of course there were others who served and are serving on local soil, too numerous to mention.

The latest of the Missionaries to venture unto the foreign field is Sis Donna-Ree Maitland, of Ensom City Gospel Chapel, serving in nearby, sometimes volatile, Haiti, since 2017. She admits that it is not easy going but is convinced that this is where the Lord wants her to be.

There were other brothers who, despite not being commended to the work but were burdened for Americans, left Jamaica and got involved in ministry, especially among the blacks. Numbered among them are: Arthur Fitz-Ritson, Keith Bogle, Carl South, Harry and Len Chang, Audley McLean, Aubrey McGann, to name a few, some of whom have been called home to be with the Lord.

Among the local 'non-commended' workers were Hugh Clacken, reported to have planted ten (10) assemblies by age 24, Clinton Webb, Berley Adair, to name a few. These were men who travelled all across the island preaching the gospel, with a few foreign excursions, to do the same. Clinton Webb led successful team ministry crusades to Bahamas, St, Kitts and Nevis, Dominica, Guyana, Belize and Trinidad. He also spoke in several cities in the USA, Canada and England.

With the Chinese presence being very prominent in the island, Bro. Eli Ho of Maranatha was one of the teachers of English to this group. He used the opportunity to share the gospel with them and many of the converts became members of the Maranatha Assembly. It was from among these that the nucleus of Swallowfield chapel came.

CAMP MINISTRY

Summer Camps, Week-end Camps, Easter Camps and Ministry retreats have factored greatly in the annual agenda of the Assemblies.

Outside of the camps of individual Assemblies, there was the Teen Time Camp which for years was the 'must go to' camp for teens and young adults in the brethren. For years the Camp Director was the late Dave Ho of the Maranatha Assembly and Swallowfield Chapel, ably assisted by the late Ray Wynter of Carmel, Errol Beecher and the late Pat (Eaves) McKenzie. On retirement from camp, the baton was passed on to John Keane of Bethany who ran well with it until it phased out.

A lot of talents were unearthed at these camps, and of special note, the Teen Time Quartet, which later, teaming up with some sisters, became known as the Sunshine Singers. For years this was the gospel group of choice, their music ministry extending beyond the shores of Jamaica.

With more and more Assemblies deciding to hold their own camps, it was evident that the Teen Time Camp ministry had done its days. A few years later, the Corporate Area youths decided that they needed a corporate area brethren camp and so Assemblies which were doing Summer Camps gave way to Corporate Area Assemblies Summer (CAAS) Camps which, after a few years, gave way to a camp for the region, South East Youth Arm (SEYA) Camp.

MEDIA

Through the vision of Clinton Webb, Kenn Fullerton, and Billy Hall, a number of magazines and other literature were produced, but each lasted only for a short while. Out of all this, Kenn Fullerton managed to influence the brethren to start the Christian Publications book store, which was more than a book store; producing plaques, greeting cards, etc.

The media ministry entered Radio-land in early 1950s, when Arthur Hart got permission from Radio Jamaica, to produce the “The Master’s Time” Programme aired on Wednesday nights. RJR was the only broadcast station in Jamaica at that time. This programme ran for years.

Roy Campbell, on his return from his tour of duty in Belize, launched Food For Thought, on behalf of the Assemblies. Billy Hall, a journalist by profession, was instrumental in getting on radio, firstly

the programme, 'Stop and Think', which ran for about a year, and then 'Look at Life', which continues to be aired on Sunday mornings at 7:05, after the 7 o'clock news. It has been rated by independent secular surveys as the best listened to religious programme in Jamaica.

THE BIG PICTURE

The Caribbean Brethren Assemblies Conference (CBAC) has been raised up in recent times with stated goal as shown in the quotation from their official page below,

A Caribbean Brethren Assemblies Conference (CBAC) was held in St Kitts from July 13th to 17th, 2014, with participants from 12 Caribbean territories (including Bermuda and Guyana) and from the USA, UK³ and India. At a closing session, the participants agreed that similar CBAC's should be held, one in 2017 and, thereafter, at four-yearly intervals.`

The Caribbean Brethren Assemblies Conference Committee (CBACC) *exists to serve and strengthen the Brethren movement in the Caribbean**, thereby enabling it to play its part in carrying out the mission given to the church by the Lord Jesus Christ more effectively.

The clause in italics is crucial because the Movement needs to put into effect the well known fact that there is strength in numbers and also that unity is strength. The strengthening and numerical growth of the Movement is directly related to the strengthening of the Brethren 'corpus' in the region. Herein is the key to the Brethren Movement taking its rightful place among the denominations of the

³ The most famous Brethren scholar is undoubtedly the late F.F. Bruce, whose biography is now available, and reviewed in the following: <https://www.thegospelcoalition.org/themelios/review/f-f-bruce-a-life/>:

**world and in particular and more importantly, spreading the gospel,
“...to the uttermost part of the earth”.**

=====

Acknowledgements

I must acknowledge the various sources which contributed to making this paper a reality.

Firstly, the magazine ‘Assembly Affairs’ (January 1989) from which much of the material was taken, played an integral role in my search for information. In mentioning this magazine, I must thank Dr Billy Hall, not only for putting it together but also for his articles on the beginning of the ‘Brethren movement’ and its local history 1920-1988.

Thanks to Dr. Barrington Houston for his assistance in making his research, in particular as it relates to Maranatha Assembly, available to me.

Thanks to Aulous Madden for his input concerning the ministry of Eli Ho among the Chinese folks which led to the establishing of the Swallowfield Chapel.

Thanks to Berley Adair (Jnr.) for making available the history of Assembly Hall, the first Open Brethren Assembly.

The assistance of the above is very greatly appreciated for had it not been for these contributions, this paper would not be a reality and if it was a reality it would be largely fictitious.

**THE GOSPEL MANDATE
AND THE
JEW-GENTILE COALITION**

D. Vincent Palmer
Dip Th

INTRODUCTION

We wish to pursue the thesis that the Matthean (Jewish) and Lucan (Gentile) concept of Bio-Narratives¹ as a way of attempting to write a piece of history could serve as a useful tool to aid in the repositioning and rebranding of the project of Contextual Theology. Contextual Theology may be defined as that which “invites the Christian faith and theological reflection to the crossroads of human existence in the public square and the public domain.”¹ The discipline

¹ The literary genre of both Lucan volumes. See Martin Hengel, *The Four Gospels and the One Gospel of Jesus Christ* (Harrisburg, Pennsylvania, 2000), 2; and D. L. Turner, *Interpreting the Gospel and Acts: An Exegetical Handbook* (Grand Rapids: Kregel, 2019), 49-52.

takes as its chief concerns the well being of the populace (i.e., putting people first) as well as the political dimensions of culture and society (issues of governance). In other words, the business of the public theologian, like Dr Luke's, is about human flourishing physiologically (and otherwise)—through sustainable good governance. If we define psychology as the study of human behaviour, then theology—broadly speaking—is the quest to understand God's behaviour relative to his sentient creatures in particular. For the writer of the Third Gospel, the quintessential public theologian is none other than the Lord Jesus Christ whose manifesto Luke artistically published² in chapter 4 of his Gospel: 1 Garnett Roper, *Caribbean Theology as Public Theology* (Kingston: GLR, 2019), 25. 2 "Luke exhibits careful attention to structure at several levels.... Structural organization is apparent

The Gospel of Luke, in particular, the longest book in the New Testament, has been long since recognized as the Gospel of the poor, the disenfranchised, and the marginalized—themes which resonate with the theological objectives of Majority World theologians.

Both Matthew and Luke shaped the Jesus tradition handed down to them to meet the needs of their Jewish and gentile constituents, with the latter providing a sequel with a universalizing literary format with no less persuasive rhetoric. Luke, of course, has been approached by many with a hermeneutic of suspicion because "one of the curious features of the Third Gospel is that, having been anointed to proclaim good news to the poor (4:18), Jesus is found, repeatedly, frequenting the homes of the wealthy (e.g. 5:29; 7:36; 14:1; 19:5).... Indeed, one searches Luke's Gospel in vain for any narration of Jesus' preaching good news to *the poor*".² Also, the extent to which Luke is seen to be a reliable historian is still hotly debated.³

²J. B. Green, "Good news to whom? Jesus and the Poor in the Gospel of Luke," in *Jesus of Nazareth, Lord and Christ: Essays on the Historical Jesus and New Testament Christology* (Carlisle, UK: Paternoster, 1994), 59.

One response to Professor Green comes from Dr David Cheung: "If you want to help the poor, you must disciple the rich; if we want to help the rich, you must understand their poverty;" cited in *Bethel Journal of Christian Theology and Ministry*, vol. 2 (February 2012), 5.

³But see Craig Keener's reflections in the following works: *Acts: An Exegetical Commentary*, vol. 1 (Grand Rapids: Baker, 2012), 320-382; and *Christobiography: Memory, History, and the Reliability of the Gospels*. Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 2010.

These perceived weaknesses notwithstanding, we find the evangelists' historiographical strategy attractive because they wrote not just to theologize and inform but to subvert the worst features of Empire. Although Contextual Theology is for the most part postcolonial, its potential as a tool to ensure that the Lucan corpora of the poor and the marginalized permeate every stratum of the society is yet to be fully realized. Like the nations of the majority world, Luke, we believe, was a Gentile. He along with the other gospel writers also saw quite clearly the power of storytelling (with a focus on *bios*) as a way to effect meaningful cultural change. Writing the only Gentile Gospel treatise then (Luke-Acts), one can discern efforts of excellence in his work.

Minority status can be a motivating factor in this regard. While this may explain the quality of his work, the anxiety to outdo himself could be an explanation for the quantity of his output (cf. the following: of the 7, 947 verses found in the New Testament, the Gospel of John accounts for 1407; Paul's epistles, 2032; and Luke-Acts, 2157, over 25 percent of the New Testament).⁴ Luke has shown keen interest in Gentile conversions and congregations (Acts 9-28). He also appears to epitomize and illustrate the *dictum* that all our theology must become biography, that is, a lived-experience of faith within community. But this to some extent, was an emphasis of the other Evangelists. Where Luke differs from them was to highlight the Messiah's interest in the plight of widows in particular (7:11-17; 18:1-5) and women in general (Luke 7: 36-50; 8: 1-3; 10: 38-42; 13: 10-17; 21: 1-4).

There are two other Lucan emphases that we need to examine. In the Third Gospel, one finds quite a number of references to prayer. What is very revealing is that a significant number of these references surround the prayer life of the Messianic Figure. This Figure not only prayed regularly; he is also portrayed by the Third Evangelist as one who allowed the Spirit of God to control and guide him, and this is precisely how he becomes an ideal role-model. In the sequel of Lucan Gospel which has come down to us as the Book of Acts, the writer appears eager to show that the early followers of the Messianic Figure not only sought to understand their world, but engaged it by the power of the Messianic Spirit in an effort to introduce other-worldly life transforming values. In other words, the theological relevance in terms of a radical social ethic that some

⁴ . D. Bock, *A Theology of Luke and Acts*. (Grand Rapids: Zondervan, 2012), 27.

insist should become a part of God-Talk in any geographical or historical context was already a Lucan burden shared with Theophilus and company. The conviction here is that the Lucan plot is no mere narrative, but a story which invites us to share its world, the commitment of its leading characters, and its enthusiasm for life. We now turn to Luke's exemplar.⁵

MATTHEW'S COMPOSITON

The theological emphases of the Evangelists are outlined as follows:

Matthew: The revelatory discourse of the Sovereign (Incarnate Royalty)

Mark: The revelatory discourse of the Servant (Incarnate Ministry)

Luke: The revelatory discourse of the Son (Ideal Humanity)⁶

John: The revelatory discourse of the Shekinahⁱ (Incarnate Deity)⁷

⁵E.g., only Matthew and Luke provide us with genealogies, the Nativity, the *Pater noster*, and, arguably, a somewhat fulsome Passion and resurrection narratives. Luke also appears to pattern some of artistic works after Matthew's as we will try to show below.

⁶The 'Word' that became flesh (John 1:14) was a theological and redemptive necessity; the Son of God had to become the Son of Man (i.e., human) in order to die as the spotless Lamb of God (John 1:29). And he had to retain his divinity (John 1:1c), in order to give global and eternal value to his sacrifice. If Jesus were a sinner, he could only have died for his own sins (Rom 6:23a); if he were only a perfect human, he could only have died for one other person—most likely for someone in the Caribbean (conventional substitution)! But being the unique (*monogenēs*) member of the God-head, the only one to have taken on permanent human status, his death has value for all humanity, and his resurrection by the Spirit (Rom 1:1-4), the Father (Rom 6:4), and the Son of Man (John 2:19) makes available a right relationship with God (Rom 4:25). "'Tis mystery all!"

⁷ *Acts: A Contextual Commentary* (Kingston: EMI, 2020), 51. See also, D V Palmer, "Chiastic Contours and the Book of Acts," CJET 17 (2018): 94-112.

Interestingly the canonical arrangement of the Gospels appears to have a fortuitous chiasmic shape, with the two apostolic writers flanking the couple of apostolic associates:

A Matthew
B Mark
B¹ Luke
A¹ John

There are those who observe that the First Gospel not only has a few instances of ring composition⁸ but is artistically and structurally shaped that way as well. For example W.D. Davies and Dale C. Allison, Jr.⁹ shared the following, which we have adapted:

A GENERATION 1-4 (Narrative)
B BENEDICTION 5-7 (Discourse)
C INVITATION 8-9 (Narrative)

D INTERLOCUTION 10 (Discourse)

E REJECTION 11-12 (Narrative)

F CIRCUMLOCUTION 13(Discourse)

E' RECEPTION 14-17 (Narrative)

D' INTERLOCUTION 18 (Discourse)

C' INVITATION 19-22 (Narrative)

⁸ Ring Composition (used as a synonym for Chiasmus here) may be defined as: an “inverted sequence or cross-over of parallel words . . . sentence, or larger unit.” Richard N. Soulen, *Handbook of Biblical Criticism* (Atlanta: John Knox, 19--), 40. Ring Composition/Chiasmus belongs to an author’s surface structure; therefore, as J. P. Louw (*Semantics of New Testament Greek* [Atlanta: Scholars Press, 1982], 77) puts it, “This means that if an author wishes to say something (deep structure), he will choose a specific form (surface structure) in which to say it.”

⁹ *The Gospel according to Saint Matthew* (London: T&T Clark, 2004), 60; citing C.H. Lohr.

B' MALEDICTION & DOMINION 23-25 (Discourse)

A' EXPIRATION AND REGENERATION 26-28 (Narrative)

John Nolland speaks about the narrator's

LUKE'S COMPOSITON

That the narrator of the Third Gospel used sources is widely acknowledged (cf. Luke 1:1-4). That one of these sources is Matthews Gospel is the conviction of very many NT scholars. So it comes as no surprise to discover that Dr Luke himself constructed similar ring compositions for his two-volume corpus as a literary artist in his own right. According to Bruce:

Whatever truth there may be . . . that Luke was [also] a painter; he certainly was an artist in words. Many will endorse the verdict ... that his Gospel 'is the most beautiful book there is.' How immensely poorer we should be without his description of the herald angels with their *Gloria in excelsis*, the parables of the Good Samaritan and the Prodigal Son, the story of the Emmaus Road!

Bruce continues:

It is the same artist who in his second book depicts for us in vivid, unforgettable words the scene where Peter stands and knocks at Mary's door, the earthquake at Phillipi, the uproar in the Ephesians theatre, the riot in Jerusalem when Paul was arrested, the appearance of Paul before Agrippa, the storm and shipwreck on the voyage to Rome, the fire of sticks and the viper of Malta. Renan also said of Lk. that it was 'the most literary of the Gospels'. We may extend this judgment to [Acts] and call the combined work the most literary part of the NT. We [consequently] find more really Classical Greek in Luke's writing than anywhere else in the NT...."

The following structure of Acts, rightly perceived, bears testimony to the above endorsement:

A. DOMINION MATTERS 1:1:7:59¹⁰

B. DISPERSION MATTERS 8:1-14:28¹¹

C. DELIBERATION MATTERS 15:1-41¹²

B.' DISPERSION MATTERS 16:1 -28:16

A' DOMINION MATTERS 28:17:31

The artwork of Jesus' programmatic pronouncement recorded in Luke 4 also informs the book of Acts:

A. synagogue (16a)

B. Jesus standing (16b)

C. Jesus given the scroll (17a)

D Jesus' reading from Isaiah (18-19)

C'. Jesus giving back the scroll (20a)

B'. Jesus sitting (20b)

A'. synagogue (20c)¹³

Therefore, at the beginning of Jesus' ministry we get an inkling of what his public theological engagement looks like; it is:

- **Pneumatic (*The Spirit of the Lord is on me*)**
- **Messianic (*because he has anointed me*)**

¹⁰ Here Luke records crucial matters regarding the *Dominium Dei* (divine lordship) relative to Jesus' perspective on the kingdom, his promise of power from the Spirit, his precept for world evangelization, and the prayerful waiting on the Lord on the part of the apostolate for the day of Pentecost.

¹¹ These chapters show how the gospel reached Samaria, Ethiopia, and Asia Minor (Turkey).

¹² This crucial chapter, like the ecumenical church councils it anticipates in the following centuries, points to the profound importance of theological reflection under the Spirit's guidance.

¹³ David Pao, *Acts and the Isaianic New Exodus* (Eugene, OR: Wipf & Stock, 2016), 71-72.

- **Evangelistic** (*to proclaim good news to the poor*)
- **Philanthropic** (*He has sent me to proclaim freedom for the prisoners*)
 - **Therapeutic** (. . . *recovery of sight for the blind*)
 - **Salvific** (*to set the oppressed free*)
- Prophetic** (*to proclaim the year of the Lord's favour.*)

Although the precise nature of Luke's two-volume work is still being debated, few can question his purpose in producing a Gospel and its sequel as his contribution to the thrust of social re-engineering at a time when slavery was an accepted norm. If as Gordon points out that Luke and "quite a number of biblical texts are autobiographical while ironically pointing beyond the authors through the uniqueness of biblical textual intent . . . [and] read as moments of divine intervention,"ⁱⁱⁱ the writer of the Third Gospel must have composed his work with the intention and anticipation of the kind of divine intervention that was familiar to him in his reading of the LXX/Hebrew Bible (*e.g.* Exodus 1-12). And if the stories of liberators such as Moses and the Messiah were familiar to him, Luke drew his greatest inspiration from the latter whose exploits he researched diligently and whose manifesto and mission he published confidently.

LUKE'S COMMISSION

Acts 1:8 introduces the programme of global blessing: "*But you shall receive power when the Holy Spirit has come upon you; and you shall be witnesses to Me in Jerusalem, and in all Judea and Samaria, and to the end of the earth.*" The form of the imperative ("you shall be witnesses to Me"), I think, should be carefully noted.^{iv} It is the same form of that found in Deuteronomy 6:5, and there is a possibility that Luke wants his hearer (Theophilus and any other 'lover of God') to make the link, especially in a treatise that, inexplicable, does not carry the popular word (*agapan*) for love (neither noun nor verb);¹⁴ only the love of God can truly motivate the people of God to carry out this mandate (cf. Luke 10:25-37 that segues into the Good Samaritan story, and is preceded by the mission of the 70, too, and its sequel [17-24]).

¹⁴ James Dunn, *The Acts of the Apostles* (Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 2016), xxii.

The mission of Luke 10 is definitely a localized one, but the one in Acts 1:8 is global in scope.^v Any discussion of the purpose of Acts must factor this in. And however we understand the baptism of the Spirit (1:5-8 vis-à-vis Acts 2:1-3, 38 [?]; and chapters 10 and 11), what is unmistakable is that the boldness and empowerment for the mission is tied to it. This is ably demonstrated by Luke's catalogue of power-encounters throughout.¹⁵ If chapter 1 verse 8 mandates witnessing, then the first act of witnessing is to be seen in chapter 2 which we will examine later. Acts 1:8 is an integral part of the so-called Great Commission which envisions Christ's disciples witnessing to the ends of the earth.

MATTHEW'S COMMISSION

Many churches today seem to treat the Great Commission (Mt. 28:16-20; Mk. 16:15; Lk. 24:45-49; Jn. 20:21 and Acts 1:8) as if it were given to a select few. But the Great Commission is for all of God's people and one does not need a call to obey it.¹⁶

At the beginning of Matthew's Gospel Jesus calls his disciples to become fishers of folk. When the period of training shall have run its course, the disciples' responsibility will take on global proportions. In 10: 5-33 we get a glimpse of what their practicum looks like, complete with a parting word of authoritative wisdom and warning (vv. 16, 32, 33). The first century apprenticed disciples were empowered by their Master not only to proclaim the truth and good news of the kingdom but to conduct healing clinics that would include various kinds of exorcism and the raising of the dead. Eventually Jesus later joined them (11:11; 12:22-23) in their philanthropic endeavors (with an offer of rest to the hurting in verse 28: "come to me all those who are deeply depressed, and I [*kagō*] shall refresh you"). He had also warned them to expect some negative reaction (10:22-25), which was

¹⁵ On some of these, then and now, see Craig Keener (*Miracles: the Credibility of New Testament Accounts*, 2 vols. [Grand Rapids: Baker, 2011]); on 1:30 he observes, for example: "Luke does not describe miracles in Corinth, [but] Paul reports them as a dramatic and observable part of his ministry there (2 Cor 12:12). Whereas Luke mentions miracles merely in several locations, Paul seems to believe that they occurred virtually whenever he preached (Rom 15:18-19)."

¹⁶ The Caribbean's Response to the Great Commission,"

exemplified in his own encounter with the Pharisees (12:24-26). The commission at the end of the book may be divided into three parts:

Girls' Testimony and Commission: *We held it!*

It has often been pointed out that the testimony of women in first century Palestine was considered inadmissible;¹⁷ so for Mark and company to have privileged them in the passion and resurrection stories is remarkable. Matthew, unlike Mark, begins his gospel by including women in his genealogy. One would think that if he is doing such a thing, he would have included more reputable characters like Sarah or Deborah or Huldah, but this was not to be. But come to think of it, none of the prominent men he documents fare any better. He begins with David, Abraham; he even named Judah. If none of Judah's siblings is mentioned by name, it is understandable that Dinah is missing in action, genealogically speaking. The last woman mentioned in the genealogy takes the spotlight. She is even linked to Isaiah's young maiden (Isa 7:14) of seven centuries earlier. Peter's mother-in-law is also foregrounded in Matthew 8, primarily because she became the recipient of the healing touch of Mary's firstborn. Peter's own mother¹⁸ suffers the anonymity of Eve and other matriarchs like Rebecca. In chapter 28, Matthew apparently follows Mark in including Mary Magdalene and the "other Mary" but drops Salome. It was to these women the first commission was given. [Is Mk 16:5 and adumbration of messiah's enthronement? They came to anoint a body (τὸν τάφον) but saw none! What they saw instead was an angel. It was he who gave them the first installment of a two-part commission for the benefit of the male disciples; this much was gleaned from Mark's gospel. What Matthew added was the other part of the commission issued by the Lord himself, where "fear not" is repeated, along Galilee as the rendezvous setting (over 70 miles away, where the northern trajectory of his ascension will continue). Whereas the message is for "his students/disciples" in v. 7, "my brothers"—a more intimate term—is used in v.10.¹⁹ Both the promise continued in the injunction (*apangeilate*) and the place of its fulfillment were successfully delivered by the female disciples.

Guards' Testimony and Commission: *The Disciples have it!*

¹⁷ C. Chisholm,

¹⁸ Rumour has it that she had three sets of twins: Pete, Repete, Kate, Duplicate, and finally, Max and Climax—hardly names that were common at the time,

¹⁹ Quite often in the NT *adelphoi* may be translated 'sisters and brothers'. Here, as elsewhere, it refers only to the male apostles.

While the sisters were on the way to carry out their mandate (*apangeilate*), the sentry made its way to the high priests to give their report (v. 11; ἀπήγγειλαν). It was about the missing corpse. The guard's report generated a new mandate (Εἶπατε)—a mandate that was handsomely underwritten by the ugly religious authorities (v. 12). The message the guards were paid to convey rivals the incredible and unsponsored announcement of the messenger in verses 5-6. With the kind of assurance given to the guards (and the full realization of their new found wealth), the success of their assignment was almost guaranteed (vv 14-15).

Guys' Commission and Test: *"We beheld it but what shall we do with it?"*

There is a sense in which Matthew agrees with the guards, but not in the way the authorities intended it (the guards knew better!); for him the disciples were in possession of the *Corpus Christi* in ways in which the people of the day would come to understand later, if only they would believe. So playfully, he interrogates his readers by his elaboration of the following queries:

CARIBBEAN APPROPRIATION

CAFU

Chronological Survey

Forty years before Pogba and company won the World Cup, the Christian Ambassadors Footballers United (CAFU) came into being with the express purpose of reaching other men with the Gospel. The movement first started with a group of Christians from Maranatha Gospel Hall in the Vineyard Town-Franklyn Town community, who was desirous of entering a team in the local corner league competition. Later Christians from other churches were invited to participate to strengthen the team and before long a ministry of rich inter-denominational endeavour was born.

Over the years CAFU has engaged Manning Cup, Major League, Premier League and other teams in order to spread the word. CAFU has also entered a few competitions, namely, the former Red Label league, as well as the Tourers and Masters League competitions, all under the auspices of the JFF. Twice in the 80s the squad travelled to Washington D.C. to enter the annual Bob Marley tournament. In October 98 CAFU toured Cuba, and in 2003

And 2006, Orlando.

Today the group is now divided into two squads, one bearing the name M V (Men of Vision) Exodus and the other bearing the original Christian Ambassadors label. This has resulted in a more effective witness. Both squads are made up of pastors, lecturers, physicians (one of whom is a Jew), engineers, students, attorneys, artisans, accountants, business men, technical directors (formerly Rene Simoes and Carl Brown), a translator, one scientist and a few unemployed. A chapter of CAFU was established in Florida in the 90s and there are plans afoot to do the same for Boston, Toronto and New York. Another tour is also planned for Orlando in short order. Like the local church, CAFU seeks to be always self-governing, self-supporting, and of course, self-propagating in its auxiliary ministry.

Canonical Support

Superficially, CAFU is encouraged by a text like John 4 which talks about the 'fields' (football, that is) that are white and ready to harvest. Members of both squads are also impressed with the 'beautiful feet' which are mentioned in connection with the evangel expounded in Romans (10:15).

Substantially, it is recognized that reaching men is a much more daunting task than is first realized. Ever since the 'seed' (masculine in the original) was announced in Genesis 3:15 there has been a conspiracy of the enemy to madden some males (like Cain) and murder others (like Abel; ever wondered why Cain killed Abel, without cable?

Check out 1 John 3:11). Either way there was an attempt to prevent the ‘Bruiser’ from carrying out his work. Witness as a well the work of Pharaoh in Exodus 1 and the move of Herod in Matthew 2.

Of course Satan did not prevent the Seed from accomplishing his task (Colossians 2:15), but this does not prevent the enemy from unleashing his fury against all who have the same gender of his Bruiser. After all, the more youths he kills the fewer will benefit from the salvific achievement of Calvary. I very well believe that this dynamic goes a far way in explaining the spiralling murder rate in our country—and elsewhere (a case of *caan ketch Quaku yu ketch im shuf?*). It may also partially explain why males are marginalizing other males and why the educational system does not seem to be working for ‘mankind’ in Jamaica. Most certainly the prevalence of illegal drugs particularly among the male population is more than a pharmaceutical matter. It is spiritual to the core.

If the forgoing thesis is correct it is understandable why Christ laid such emphasis on the calling and training of men, why he concentrated his efforts in the area of Galilee, which could be considered the ‘ghetto/inner-city’ of Palestine in those days. A similar emphasis for women was hardly needed, since they routinely came for help (Luke 7:36ff) and readily understood his mission (John 12:1ff). The contrast of the male disciples would have been hilarious if it was not so serious (John 18:1ff). It is no wonder that James likens the disobedient to a male who looks in the mirror and promptly forgets to make the requisite adjustments (James 1:23ff). Neither 1st females nor 21st women are in the habit of doing that.

The thesis also adds meaning to the enigmatic phrase, ‘the disciple whom Jesus loved.’ Why was this disciple given this special privilege? Was he that special? Was it because his family was wealthy? When I first made my probe of these questions I knew from the outset that there was no partiality on the part of the Master. So why then was John known as the disciple whom Jesus loved? The answer to this question I found revealing.

When John and his brother James first met the Lord they were nicknamed sons of thunder. The new name was hardly complimentary. It was more descriptive of their fiery and misplaced zeal more than anything else. In a fairly objective profile of these sons of Zebedee, the gentile Gospel writer, Luke, enlightens our darkness in chapter 9 of his first volume. In verse 46 we are told of a heated discussion among the disciples concerning bragging rights. (It is Matthew's gospel that informs us as to what precipitated the quarrel. The boys' mother had come requesting special (cabinet?) privileges for her sons. And the other disciples were indignant.

Possibly, James and John must have openly supported and defended mom's request. What exactly Jesus perceived in their hearts we are not told. But whatever it was warranted a mild rebuke (Luke 9:46-48). What I find intriguing is that it was John who stood to give the 'vote of thanks' in the following verse. Well not quite. Verse 49 appears to present John as making some attempt to redeem himself. After all, if *yu trow stone inna pigpen di fus wan whey bawl out a im get lick!* But John should have kept his mouth shut. Here comes another rebuke in verse 50.

Jesus and his disciples are now on their way to the capital city. Needing visas to pass through central Palestine, messengers were sent to the Samaritan embassy (v. 52). The application was promptly turned down. No surprise here, for Jews have no dealing with Samaritans (today it is the Palestinians!). 'And when his disciples James and John saw it, they said, "Lord, do you want us to command fire to come down from heaven and consume them?"'(v. 54). Sons of thunder indeed! Needless to say another rebuke follows (vv. 55-56).

Personally speaking, if I were Jesus John could never be a part of my apostolic band in training much more to be known as the disciple whom I love dearly! Neither James nor Peter who completed the unholy trinity. All three were from Galilee known in those days for its pugnacious and foul-mouthed citizens. If Peter's denial of his

Master was accompanied with expletives, we are not surprised. He was Galilean. If Peter was aiming for the head of Malchus, we are not surprised. He was brought up in Galilee, and can anything good come out of any of its towns (John 1:46)?

So why then was John so privileged? To reach men in general special effort must be made. But to reach really bad men like Peter, James and John special effort must be doubled. Whenever the Lord went on a special mission he would take three of his students with him (guess which three?) for at least two reasons: 1) it was too much risk to leave them behind, and 2) because his brand of love is tailor-made for sinners (Rom. 5:8).

This means that the Gospel writers did not necessarily follow the sometime popular tradition of Israel, to conveniently forget the barbarity and disreputable incidents of David's reign, and focus instead upon those elements which appealed to the political and religious aspirations of each succeeding age. They too were also well aware of the matriarchs and patriarchs who provided the necessary biblical role-modeling for their day and whose lives were handled in such a way as to highlight certain episodes which would serve as encouragement for people of faith. We have in mind here people like Sarah and Abraham. Fitzmyer for instance, comments on how Paul in Romans 4 "passes over the fact that Abraham was convulsed in laughter at the thought that he might beget a son."²⁰ In fact, both Abraham (Gen 17:17) and Sarah (Gen 18:12) appear to have gained some measure of comic relief from the promise, and not at their own expense. So both incidents are, to use Fitzmyer's language, "passed over" in what may be called paschal silence. This literary phenomenon is not limited to Paul. We see it, for example, in 2 Chronicles where another man (David) to whom righteousness is credited and eulogized not because he was perfect but because he was justified. Here then, we see 'that historical memory is highly selective and interpretive'. John's Gospel (cf. 1:29 with 13:10-11; 17:6) as well as Priscilla's homily (Heb 11:3-40) will employ the same literary strategy. This literary strategy stands out in bold relief against the aforementioned discourse regarding James and John, and the following backdrop.

²⁰ J. A. Fitzmyer, *Romans* (NY: Doubleday, 1993), 387.

The holy books of no other religion depict their followers so negatively as the Bible does the Jews and the Christians. Scripture describes very graphically the doctrine that Jews and Christians are also sinners and capable of the most dreadful sins, and denounces not only the atrocities carried out by the Gentiles, but also those of the supposed (or true) people of God. This pitiless self-criticism is integral to Judaism and Christianity, in contrast to other religions. No other faith criticizes itself so severely as Old Testament Judaism or New Testament Christianity. Scripture exposes the errors of the leaders very clearly, and God often employs outsiders to recall His people to obedience.²¹

Conclusion: The Model of Matthean and Lucan Theology and Historiography

Matthew and Luke, then, have paved the way for all who would seek to do theology in their own context by underscoring, first and foremost, the value of *bios* and narrative for such an enterprise. In fact, they invite to us to write a counter-narrative to the prevailing hegemonic spirit that has dominated the lives of majority peoples for centuries. The Gospels in general and Matthew and Luke in particular, demonstrates beyond the shadow of a doubt, the observation that “when God sets people free, He doesn’t set them free for their own ends and their own means; it doesn’t become self-indulgence, it’s a ‘giving awayness’”.²² Now what is proposed here regarding the employment of the Lucan Bio-Narrative genre as one effective way to carry forward the worthwhile enterprise of Contextual Theology should not be thought of as writing mere eulogies or hagiographies of the ancestors/practitioners of our faith.

²¹ T. Schirmacker, *Toward a Theology of Martyrdom* (Bonn: VKW, 2008), 43.

²² J. Edwards, *The Jamaican Diaspora* (Kingston: Morgan Ministries International, 1998), 18.

What we mean by this is that whatever is written should be realistic enough and faithful enough to the lives that are chosen for scrutiny and paradigmatic value. When Luke, for instance, recorded the strong disagreement between Barnabas and Paul, we see a type of boldness in his literary endeavor that reminds us that theology concerns our lived-experience and the human condition of which we are a part.^{vi} The creative author of Luke-Acts has recorded for us some of the best lyrics of all time; for instance, Mary's magnificent and the nunc dimitis both found in the Third Gospel.^{vii} What is not well celebrated—at least in the Caribbean—is the way how Dr Luke has appropriated the songs of Israel in his sequel to his Gospel, in order to enrich the redemptive story he tells. We will look at some of these in due course. For our author, then, singing is at its best when it is the expression of redeemed hearts (Acts 16). Therefore, the inclusion of Isaiah's most famous Servant Song is certainly not fortuitous.

One, however, should not overstate the potential of any strategy to effect long and lasting change within a society, within a region. This *caveat* notwithstanding, we are optimistic that what has been suggested allows us to echo, "I have a dream" (Martin Luther King) that a "change is going to come" (Sam Cooke): a change in doing Caribbean theology as a just and justifiable response to regional reality, including the painful experience of dysfunctional family structures, the challenges of violent crime, gender struggle, issues of regional governance and mimicry, poverty, and the like.

BOOK REVIEW

by

**Anicia Bennett MA
(cand.)**

In his book, *From Fragmentation to Wholeness: Race, Ethnicity and Communion* (Valley Forge: Judson, 2017), Dr Neville Callam explored how ideologies regarding race, ethnicity and communion have affected the human race and invariably cause fragmentation within society. The book consists of four chapters that also systematically discuss how race, ethnicity and communion have influenced the human identity and Caribbean Theology.

The first chapter of the book focused on Race. Callam presents a plethora of literature that ultimately conclude that race is a social construct formulated by man in an effort to segregate human beings and in so doing perpetuate the notion that one genus of people is better than others, based on biological factors. Callam also explores the life of Sam Sharpe, one of Jamaica's National Heroes, and once a staunch opponent of racism. The author adequately conveys Sharpe's convictions against slavery as well. Sharpe's belief that all human beings are made equally was in accord with Biblical teachings regarding human freedom. Sharpe believed that slavery denied humans their value and dignity and as such humans had the right to take non-violent actions to secure and free themselves from any form of bondage. Using Sam Sharpe's ideology regarding slavery, Callam laid a firm foundation that colors the institution of slavery as a monstrous injustice and challenges the reader to demythologize the undergirding race ideologies of the superiority of the white people over the blacks.

While many will argue that institutionalized slavery all started with the European powers in their quest to dominate the New World or it was an institution that existed long before the Europeans, the fact remains that there were and are many proponents for racism and a Eurocentric status quo. Callam highlights key figures such as Swedish Scientist Carl Linnaeus, zoologist Jen Leopold, English producer Charles White and Scottish historian Thomas Carlyle who believed that racism was imbedded in strong biological factors that deemed the white race superior to all races especially to the blacks. Callam, through his sound discussions, called his readers to think about how this distinction in the human race has significantly divided and segregated humanity. The hard work of institutions such as the United Nations (UN) and the United Nations Educational Scientific and Cultural Organization (UNESCO) have not gone unnoticed as they have worked to debunk the myth of biological claims to race superiority. While these institutions have denounced every act of racism and discrimination, Callam believes that actions to combat racism have not significantly succeeded in eliminating the problem. He instead urges the Christian community to take a more active stand against all acts of racism as it goes against God's plan for humanity. He believes that churches need to "deconstruct the notion of race and register progress on the road to people truly loving each other by following the pattern Jesus taught and exemplified".

Like Callam, the reviewer believes that the Christian community must take an active part in exposing the ills of racism and to actively show how this acts as a direct contradiction of God's divine providence for humanity. Callam also believes that "ecclesial organizations need to declare *status confessionis* to their member churches that endorse racist ideologies and encourage racist practice". He contends that every congregation has the responsibility to play their part in deconstructing the foundation on which prejudice, racism, discrimination and hate was built as these negative constructs continue to be too ubiquitous. Instead, we need to embrace the fact that we all belong to one race; the human race.

In Chapter two, Callam explores the concept of ethnicity and how it has been used to create borders of exclusion within society. Callam categorically declares that the terms "ethnic" and "ethnicity"

are often used to negatively characterize people in such a way that they diabolically oppose the ethics of *agape* outlined in the Bible. He referenced the European Baptist Conference on Ethnic Churches that took place in June 2006. From this conference, presentations were made about Ethnic Churches and what constituted same. Callam concluded that the use of the term “Ethnic Churches” was a social construct that was established to create boundaries, separate identities and serve as a means of classifying people over others although we all share a common bond in Christ Jesus. Subsequently, use of the term ethnicity by the Alabama Baptists was also highlighted by Callam. He noted that the use of the term was popularly used to designate groups deemed to be made up of people classified as minorities; it has some of its origins in the United States. The reader continues to see this culture being perpetuated around the world and more often than not used in a derogatory way.

Callam also explored ethnicity and social differentiation; here he presents two main viewpoints: Primordialism or Essentialism and Constructivism. Primordialism or Essentialism postulates that “ethnic collectiveness are natural and permanent” and are “bound together by ties such as race, language, religion and customs”. On the other hand, constructivism purports that ethnic groups are “artificial social constructs that have no exact correspondence in actual society”. Sociologist Ann Morning was a major proponent of this basic taxonomy approach to enumeration and of the two views presented, she believed that much of the constructivism approach is reflected in society. This reviewer agrees with Morning and believes that much needs to be done to erase or dull the lines of these social constructs if we are to truly experience significant forms of human flourishing. Like Callam, the reviewer also shares the view that the terms “ethnicity” and “ethnic” are really mythical concepts that “play a major role in social differentiation and serve to promote negative stereotypes that need to be abandoned”. These concepts and their criteria are highly subjective.

Callam also presented some Biblical perspectives on ethnicity that are likely to convince the reader that the descriptor “ethnic” assigns an inferior category to a particular group and in so doing devalue and exclude those deemed outsiders and outcasts. In this

regard, he encourages readers to view the human being as a being created in “the image of God’ (Genesis1:26) as this assigns value and dignity to human existence. He reiterates that we all belong to “one human family, one race originating from one ancestor”.

In Chapter three entitled *Communion*, Callam examines the sacrament of Holy Communion. It was presented as primarily “a worship event in which past, present and future collide in the formation and nourishment of Christian identity”. He explored and drew a parallel between eating a meal with someone and actually sharing the Lord’s Supper. He provided historical and Biblical evidence to support the belief that sharing a meal with someone reflects and contributes to an individual’s identity in their social context as significant. He referenced the three Biblical Feasts of Ancient Israel; the Feast of Unleavened Bread, the Feast of Weeks and the Feast of Tabernacles, and how these commensalities implied shared beliefs about people and their relationships with each other and God. Likewise, when Christians share in the Lord’s Supper they are expressing a shared belief in Jesus and reaffirming their inclusion in the Kingdom of God. By partaking in this communion, Callam purports, there is a twofold anamnesis. It is a remembrance of the past events of the Christian story and it is an indication of one entering into the experience of a new age. Like Callam, the reviewer believes that “in the Lord’s Supper, the present is filled with memories of the Lord’s self-offering and with hope for the future fulfillment of the promise of the Kingdom”. As Christians share this meal, they encounter and celebrate the Lord’s presence, a compelling reminder and confirmation of who they are and who they have become in Jesus. It is on this premise that the reader come to the realization that the meal is meant to build a sense of belonging and community and affirm Christ’s teaching that we are all a part of one family-the family of God.

Regrettably, the Lord’s Supper often breeds disunity and segregation within the Body of Christ as a result of matters relating to race, ethnicity and to a larger extent, doctrinal matters related to the application and interpretation of the sacrament. Callam has presented a host of historical and hermeneutical data that show various ways in which churches have allowed issues related to doctrine, race and ethnicity to devalue and distort the Communion meal. He believes that

as Church members grow and experience God's grace and increase in wisdom, they should work to overcome any moral and social issues that seek to undermine and destabilize participation in the meal of Communion. He charges "churches in ethnically diverse communities to consider whether they can claim to celebrate the Lord's Supper with integrity when they welcome as congregants only those who are segregated on the basis of their ethnicity". The discerning reader will almost certainly share the author's perspective that the Lord's Supper should be an inclusive meal for all who are a part of the Body of Christ. It should be for all Christians "a sacred meal event that is a celebration of grace, a banquet of love, a festival of solidarity and a commission of witness and service in the name of the God of love and justice".

The final Chapter of the book speaks to *Avoiding Fragmentation*. It expositis how Caribbean theology must be explored within its context so that Caribbean people can better relate to their history and God. Callam discusses the risks of fragmentation and how this can disconnect Caribbean people from fully experiencing their own culture thereby creating a "foreign" concept of theology. He urges theologians to make Caribbean theology more relatable and contextual, so that Caribbean people can fully appreciate the liberation that God offers. Of special interest to the reviewer is Callam's reference to the paucity of female representation, roles and work in Caribbean theology. Callam noted that "in the development of Caribbean theology, females voices have not been adequately heard, and women experiences, based on the integrity of the female as bearer of God's image appears to be ignored or undervalued". This speaks to the reader as more often than not, a more patriarchal approach is taken when exploring Caribbean theology. While the aim is not to create a male versus female situation, inclusion and presentation of all those involved allows for the theology to be without biases and as such the fullness and richness of that which is presented will be fully explored. After all, Caribbean theology has been influenced by so many different personalities and we never know which encounter will provide a means through which an individual may encounter God.

Through his book, Callam call the readers to move from fragmented thoughts that facilitate disunity and discord especially

relating to matters of race, ethnicity and communion. Instead, he charged humanity to exude wholeness where expressions of love, peace, joy, kindness and togetherness will bind us together. The book reminds us of Christian principles that should be the hallmark of our existence regardless of the existing social orders that are in conflict with them. Additionally, the author challenged Christians to act in the spirit of Christ where we acknowledge that we were all made in the image and likeness of God and in this regard, we are to all work to advance the welfare of the whole human race and move from fragmentation to wholeness.

Rethinking the testosterone conundrum facing African female athletics through the intersectionality of disability and critical race theory:

Horace Stephen Williams (Independent Scholar -formerly with Institute of Caribbean Studies University of the West Indies Mona)

Abstract

In a word, the aim of this research project is to redress the problem of alterity. The term, whatever the register used, has come to be apprehended generally as: the quality or state of being radically alien to the conscious self or a particular cultural orientation (Merriam-Webster 2021). Viscerally, its graphic manifestation may be made to coincide with Maximilia Imali's evocation: "*Even me wanted to know myself, who am I. If I know myself, what else can I do to make me to be the Max they want me to be?*" This when herself and other Differently Sexually Developed (DSD) African women fell under the panoptical gaze of International Athletics and the European Court of Justice (IAF/ECJ) after the failed Caste Semenya appeal. This intersection of the veridical and the visceral to apprehend alterity should be further apprehended as a synecdoche of intersectionality itself and its emphasis on a radical empiricism cum activism – as critical weaponry - in the ethno-class man versus human struggle. Here the critical research question "*is the intersectionality of race and disability, an effective redress to the stand-off between Africa's elite intersex athletes and World Athletics through its potential surrogacy/agency for the distillation of a new humanism?*" will set the tone for our investigation into the struggle of these women athletes from the global south against empire. Finally black feminism and its rather tenuous relationship between the cultural subject and the self will hopefully through the instrumentality of polymath Sylvia Wynter provide some salient answers for us as subalterns in our quest for new humanities beyond this struggle

Keywords: Differently Sexually Developed, visceral, veridical, ethno-class man versus human struggle, Sylvia Wynter, Horace Williams.

Introduction

A conundrum that my sixty odd years has bequeathed me with a ring side seat to observe, is the transmogrification of the blind in their relation to socio-cultural spaces. Etched in very early memory are the still vivid pictures of this cohort struggling with pavement apertures and other such major aberrational reminders of our two-thirds world status, as they sought to feebly make their way around the world of the

physically abled, as if that world was one of walking on eggs. I fail to remember chronologically when the mutation took place, but what I do recall is the kairotic experience at about the turn of this century, of standing at a bus stop and the mutual sense of awaiting passengers diving for cover, as two members of this cohort pummeled their way through us on foot. The veridical (bourgeois) sense of unwanted disturbance in/of my personal space very quickly gave way to a visceral sense that some kind of revolution had been far advanced in the disabled (read here as blind) community. As subalterns we have been conditioned by the Judeo-Christian matrix to accept the impairments (disabilities) derived from in excess of four hundred years of colonial oppression, in order that we might be enabled by the coming resurrected body. The blind reminds us that there is an alterity that of necessity, must be released in the present, with dysabling (running for cover) effects, in order for the reparation of justice to begin for those who currently live in misery outside of the gates of empire.

Disability as a social construct

A standard definition of disability is likely to follow the regiment of: a physical, mental, cognitive, or developmental condition that impairs, interferes with, or limits a person's ability to engage in certain tasks or actions or participate in typical daily activities and interactions. (WHO 2002, 2017). The author's attempt to apprehend an induced or naturally occurring biological phenomenon (testosterone levels in the human body) through the intersection of disability – an Everest in its own right in terms of determining root cause/s- into/with race as a social phenomenon; is very much the proverbial search for a needle in a haystack. However, we contend that what makes this rhizomorphic relationship – testosterone levels, disability and race and intersectionality – a potentially promising partnership, is: i) the radical repositioning of disability studies from being a signifier of impairment to being one indicative of society's abdication of its responsibility to the disabled ii) the role of cultural philosopher Sylvia Wynter – and indeed others of this transdisciplinary ilk – in reclaiming hybridities of this nature (disability/race) from the detritus of the non/sub human classification iii) redeploing the disability/racial hybrid as a trope of the global south and its synergy with interpretative/transcendental phenomenology from the North to forge what is generally apprehended as new humanities. Our attempt to contextualize this tripartite project from the point of view of disenfranchised persons, is epically captured in the Sartre's aphorism (existence precedes essence) and Fanon's quintessential prototype from his Algerian revolutionary case study:

It is in this moment when the native has his back to the wall, a knife at his throat, electrodes at his testacies that – in psychoanalytical jargon – his/her black inferior alter is liberated from the incarceration of its creole superior ego in his decision to take his destiny into his own hands or die trying (Fanon 1961).

This signature of black revolutionary identity emergence, as a synecdoche of the global south from the long shadow of ethno-class man, has been at the cutting edge of disability/race studies in excess of forty years, through the instrumentality of Sylvia Wynter. Black feminists like Bell Hooks and Audre Lorde have taken their psychoanalytical cues from Fanon about reclaiming the black inferior alter as a trope of resistance to white supremacy; this is while circumventing his misogynistic demurrals. In the following poetic insight, we apprehend Hook's reclamation:

Beloved community is formed not by the eradication of difference but by its affirmation, by each of us claiming the identities and cultural legacies that shape who we are and how we live in the world (Hooks).

In regard to Lorde, her own musings tropically capture the concept of intrinsic violence surrounding the experience of slavery and colonialism that, in Fanon's assessment, can be expunged only through the purgative of revolutionary violence:

You cannot use someone else's fire. You can only use your own. And in order to do that, you must first be willing to believe that you have it (Lorde).

The emergent narrative from the global south¹ in regard to the native (male or female withstanding), is that self-discovery (being-ness) emerges out of the crucible of unprecedented: crisis, struggle and survival. This is not a being-ness that allows immediate access to *being in general* (as Heidegger's *da-sein* does, that is, in facilitating entry to the universal as a metonymy of modernity, and reason, its enlightenment focal point). In contrast, this kind of being-ness is a recognition of a revolt against modernity and reason. We will argue that the hijacking of this heuristic of African athletic women, a form of autopoiesis, is being evidenced in International Athletics' sanctioning of the female athletes concerned from 2012 Olympics to date, who have been deemed to be characterized by differences in sexual development (DSD), that this action taken may be apprehended as an act of epistemicidic proportions, where international athletics has used the veil of meritocracy-in-athletics, and its concomitant -colour-blindness - as a means of furthering the agenda of whiteness (Gillborn 2015). However paradoxically, we assert that this existential crisis – as an obstacle/inhibitor to African female athletic progress; is concomitantly, the elixir to the continued journey to the unshackling of western societies from their enlightenment/modernist binary predilections. This insight has been effectively drawn from one of the feminist harbingers to post-humanism, Simone de Beauvoir:

Feminist philosopher Simone de Beauvoir's pronouncement "One is not born, but rather becomes, woman" could rightfully mark the birth of an existential feminism. Indeed, de Beauvoir's *Second Sex*, originally published in 1949 in French and first translated into English in 1953 and again in 2009, remains the founding work for an existential philosophical approach to examining the condition of women. Existential feminism takes as its point of departure the notions that (1) woman is the product of social and cultural construction (of the seventeenth century enlightenment and the concomitant Manichean-atheistic humanism that attended it (my interpretation)) and [therefore] (2) woman is Other, but this approach also explores how freedom can only be achieved through the freedom of all human beings (Quinan 2016, abstract).

CRT and Intersectionality (Gillborn 2015, par.1-13):
<https://journals.sagepub.com/doi/full/10.1177/1077800414557827>

There is no single unchanging statement of the core tenets and perspectives that make up CRT but most authoritative commentaries identify a similar set of characteristic assumptions and approaches (cf. Crenshaw, Gotanda, Peller, & Thomas, 1995; Delgado & Stefancic, 2001; Gillborn & Ladson-Billings, 2010; Tate, 1997; Taylor, 2009); key among these perspectives is an understanding that "race" is socially constructed and that "racial difference" is invented, perpetuated, and reinforced by society. In this approach, racism is understood to be complex, subtle, and flexible; it manifests differently in different contexts, and minoritized groups are subject to a range of different (and changing) stereotypes. Critical race theorists argue that the majority of racism remains hidden beneath a veneer of normality and it is only the more crude and obvious forms of racism that are seen as problematic by most people:

Because racism is an ingrained feature of our landscape, it looks ordinary and natural to persons in the culture. Formal equal opportunity—rules and laws that insist on treating blacks and Whites (for example) alike—can thus remedy only the more extreme and

¹ The phrase "Global South" refers **broadly to the regions of Latin America, Asia, Africa, and Oceania**. It is one of a family of terms, including "Third World" and "Periphery," that denote regions outside Europe and North America, mostly (though not all) low-income and often politically or culturally marginalized (Sage Journal 2012, 12-13).

shocking forms of injustice, the ones that do stand out. It can do little about the business-as-usual forms of racism that people of color confront every day. (Delgado & Stefancic, 2000, p. xvi)

CRT challenges ahistoricism by stressing the need to understand racism within its social, economic, and historical context (Matsuda, Lawrence, Delgado, & Crenshaw, 1993). Scholars working within CRT place particular emphasis on the experiential knowledge of people of color and challenge common assumptions about “meritocracy” and “neutrality” as camouflage for the interests of dominant groups (Tate, 1997, p. 235). Similarly, CRT adopts a view of “Whiteness” as a socially constructed and malleable identity:

“Whiteness” is a racial discourse, whereas the category “white people” represents a socially constructed identity, usually based on skin color. (Leonardo, 2009, p. 169). White-ness, in this sense, refers to a set of assumptions, beliefs, and practices that place the interests and perspectives of White people at the center of what is considered normal and everyday. Critical scholarship on Whiteness is not an assault on White people themselves; it is an assault on the socially constructed and constantly reinforced power of White identifications, norms, and interests (Ladson-Billings & Tate, 1995). It is possible for White people to take a genuine, active role in deconstructing Whiteness but such “race traitors” (Ignatiev, 1997) are relatively uncommon. A particularly striking element of CRT (and one seized upon by conservative critics during the Breitbart attacks in 2012) is its understanding of *White supremacy*. In contrast to commonsense understandings of the term (which denote the most extreme and obvious kinds of fascistic race hatred) in CRT White supremacy refers to the operation of much more subtle and extensive forces that saturate the everyday mundane actions and policies that shape the world in the interests of White people (see Ansley, 1997).

For all of its emphasis on the central role of racism in shaping contemporary society, many CRT scholars are keen to explore how raced inequities are shaped by processes that also reflect, and are influenced by, other dimensions of identity and social structure: This is where the notion of intersectionality is crucial.

“Intersectionality” is a widely used (and sometimes misused) concept in contemporary social science. The term addresses the question of how multiple forms of inequality and identity inter-relate in different contexts and over time, for example, the inter-connectedness of race, class, gender, disability, and so on. The term originated in the work of U.S. critical race theorist Kimberlé Crenshaw (1995) but has been deployed widely across the social sciences to the point where it is sometimes viewed as a “buzzword,” whose frequent iteration often belies an absence of clarity and specificity (Davis, 2008). In an attempt to bring some clarity back to the discussion of intersectionality, it is instructive to look at how Crenshaw has applied it to real-world problems. In addition to being a professor of law at University of California, Los Angeles (UCLA), Crenshaw is co-founder and executive director of the African American Policy Forum (AAPF; <http://aapf.org/>) and the AAPF’s (n.d.) approach to intersectionality is especially useful:

Intersectionality is a concept that enables us to recognize the fact that perceived group membership can make people vulnerable to various forms of bias, yet because we are simultaneously members of many groups, our complex identities can shape the specific way we each experience that bias.

For example, men and women can often experience racism differently, just as women of different races can experience sexism differently, and so on.

As a result, an intersectional approach goes beyond conventional analysis in order to focus our attention on injuries that we otherwise might not recognize . . . to 1) analyze social problems more fully; 2) shape more effective interventions; and 3) promote more inclusive coalitional advocacy. (p. 3)

So, intersectionality—as envisaged by Crenshaw and other critical race activists—has two key elements: first, an *empirical* basis; an intersectional approach is needed to better understand the nature of social inequities and the processes that create and sustain them (i.e., to “analyze social problems more fully”). Second, and this connects to CRT’s earliest roots as a movement of engaged legal scholars, intersectionality has a core *activist* component, in that an intersectional approach aims to generate coalitions between different groups with the aim of resisting and changing the status quo.

The AAPF’s concise and direct statement on intersectionality is valuable in cutting through the layers of debate and obfuscation that often surround the concept. In particular, the AAPF highlight the importance of intersectionality as a tool (of analysis and resistance) rather than as an academic tactic or fashion. Similarly, Richard Delgado (like Crenshaw, one of the founder’s of CRT) has highlighted the need to remain clear sighted about our goals rather than become engaged in never-ending academic games of claim and counter-claim. As [Delgado \(2011\)](#) notes, intersectionality can be taken to such extreme positions that the constant sub-division of experience (into more and more identity categories) can eventually shatter any sense of coherence:

. . . intersectionality can easily paralyze progressive work and thought because of the realization that whatever unit you choose to work with, someone may come along and point out that you forgot something. (p. 1264)

As Delgado points out, identity categories are infinitely divisible, and so the uncritical use of intersectionality could lead to the paralysis of critical work amid a mosaic of never-ending difference. In contrast, I want to return to a more critical understanding of intersectionality—as a tool of critical race analysis and intervention. To understand how racism works, we need to appreciate how race intersects with other axes of oppression at different times and in different contexts, but we must try to find a balance between remaining sensitive to intersectional issues without being overwhelmed by them. In an attempt to explore this further, in the following sections I draw upon empirical data gathered as part of a qualitative investigation into the experiences of elite Black African athletes who from 2012 until now have been disaffected by the sanctioning strategies of International Athletics. The analysis explores the day-to-day life of these Black athletes as they negotiate the social construction of dis/ability within international athletics and, in particular, the processes of labeling in relation to so-called “differences in sexual development (DSD) (Gillborn 2015, par:1-13): <https://journals.sagepub.com/doi/full/10.1177/1077800414557827>).

Race and Humanisms

Modernity, and its notion of the freedom of the human being as natural and inalienable, through its conjunction with enlightenment philosophy, has sought to craft a humanism with cherished notions of autonomy, responsibility, self-determination, solidarity, community-bonding, social justice and principles of equality (Braidotti 2013, 29). However, because these philosophers built this model of humanism upon a putative racialized capitalist model, this unitary universal subject of freedom has emerged as the white man’s burden; with women being relegated to the pole of un-reason, passions and emotions, keeping them in the private sphere’ (Ibid: 34); men – specifically black men – irreducibly characterized by their irrational (subhuman) sexual proclivities (Fanon 1952; 1967; 1986), while being denuded of an executive function in regard to the capacity to reason. This problematic humanism that Sylvia Wynter has associated with the ethno-class - white,

Christian, heterosexual, able-bodied - male, versus the human struggle (the synecdoche of the latter being the black working-class unemployed/underemployed male), encapsulates liberal capitalism's game of winners and losers. It is within this apprehension of the ethno-class subject that a different -heteroglossic - humanism emerges to disturb/displace the unitary/uniform/monistic nature of the modernist (enlightenment) variant. Here using the work from disability/queer/lesbian/transgender/gay studies, Wynter and others have led the way out of the enlightenment/modernist wilderness through reveling in a poetics of difference (differance²). Palimpsestic to her theorizing on this poetics of difference, is her assertion that Frantz Fanon's aphorism in *black skin white masks*, beside ontogeny and phylogeny, there is sociogenic, was the harbinger to this poetics of difference; the Deus ex Machina to the march of Western Capitalist progress and its debilitating impact on the colonial outpost. However, subsequent attempts to build upon this platform has been derailed by man's arrogation of his role in history. This has resulted in the disintegration of such promising movements like the Black Power Movement of the 1960's, with its three arms of black arts, black aesthetics and black studies, as well as the anticolonial struggles in the Third World. (Joseph 2009, 1001 – 1016).

It is in pursuit of the exhumation of this black poetic tradition, – referring specifically to the verbal play on disability as: an 'unbearable wrongness of being', désêtre or dys-being (representative of ill/abnormal/bad), the direct opposite of contemporary interests of Western, White, Bourgeois Man. – that we locate our female athletes from the African continent (Wynter 2006, 114; Goodleigh, Lawthom, Lilliard, Runswick-Cole 2020, 125-144).

Racial Primacy

It was on Enlightenment grounds³ and its putative relationship to anti-colonialism that Wynter apprehends the heteroglossic perturbations to the ethno-class (bio-economic/ unitary/uniform/monistic) versus human struggle.⁴ In relation to the former she references the work of Renaissance thinkers going back to Greece and Rome to find an alternative secular model of being human that was beyond the theocentric one. Here we invoke the view of Stephanous Geroulanos that humanistic atheism has never really gotten over its theological tendencies; so, the result of the death of God was the divinization of Man; this is the platform from which Foucault begins his Greek/Roman Safari in search of an anti-humanist atheism (Geroulanos 2010). In relation to the latter – anticolonialism – Wynter references what became popularly known as the Negritude movement (the French Caribbean) as its global south flash point. She declares:

....so too (reference being made to the enlightenment as anti-colonialism's copartner in this safari), in order to find an alternative model to our present biocentric and ethno-class one, our intellectual revolution will begin by going back to the continent of Africa where the event of singularity to which I give the name the first emergence – that is, our emergence from subordination to the genetic programs which prescribe the behaviours of purely organic life, and our entrance instead into the behaviour programming mechanisms of the Word / of myth - first took place. Doing so to bring into existence what Aime Cesaire first proposed in 1946 as a science of the Word, in which the study of the Word, will condition the study of nature (Cagne 2007, 259).

This science of the word, and its emergence from subordination as a conditioning point to the study of nature, was dramatically evident, in the launch of the journal *L'Etudiant noir*, in 1934–1935 by the three conceptualizers-: Aime Cesaire, Leopold Sedar Senghor, and Leon Gontran Demas. Here, the coinage of the term, *L'Etudiant noir*, was intended to be a provocation. Negre from the Latin word “niger”, meaning black, is employed uniquely in French in relation to black people in an “art negre” (Diagne 2016). Applied to a black person, it has come to be charged with all the weight of racism to the point that the insult “*sale negre*” (dirty negre) would be almost redundant; sale being somehow usually understood in negre; what we apprehend here in its promulgation through the launch of *L'Etudiant noir* is the reclamation of negritude

² We refer here to the work of Jacques Derrida (1982, 3-27) and Mikhail Bakhtin

³

⁴ These perturbations have been referred to by Sylvia Wynter as the unsettling of the coloniality of being/power/truth/freedom (Wynter 2003, 257-337)

from its detrital understanding, and its recasting as a different self-validating norm. In Senghor's attempt to position negritude as a cosmopolitan contribution; that is, as a style that is identified with a unique notion of rhythm, and – in the cosmos of styles - is strictly African. He attempted to crystalize these ideas in a published essay, “Ce que l'homme noir apporte”, translated “What the Black Man Contributes” (Senghor 1939). As part of his zeal to find the seal of approval to his work within Enlightenment architectonic; Senghor discovered a book by the Reverend Father Placid Temples proposing a clear Bantu philosophy, as resting upon this [same] notion of rhythm (Diagne 2016). Temples had the view that to more efficiently preach the gospel to Bantu people, he had first to understand the principles underlying their belief system, their customary laws, their cultural habits and so on (Diagne 2016). Temples further concluded, that one ought to go beyond mere ethnographical description of those characteristics of the people's lives and dig out a set of ontological principles on which they were founded (Diagne 2016).

Needless to state that Senghor embraced this – Templesian – *sine qua non* for African legitimacy within the pantheon of Enlightenment philosophers and thinkers; indeed giving – white (translated here veridical) – support to his “Ce que l'homme noir apporte” as the metonymy of blacks having full human status within a white universe, via Temples' philosophical blessing. On the other hand, Césaire rejected Temples' work because he recognized this maneuver as another instance of the Manichean allegory at work; that is while accepting his ontological assertions on Bantu, it should be seen also as his excuse to perpetuate the colonial order (Césaire 2000b, 58; Diagne 2016).

For both disability/dysability and negritude studies, it is this neurotic inhibitor/elixir, a Janus face: encapsulating the desire for acceptance within a white universe on one hand (circa disability), and a demand to put an end to this colonial legacy on the other (circa dysability), that have given it, disability/dysability, its potency as a liberating trope. Indeed, its motive force lies in its taxidermic quality, honed on lost pride through slavery and colonialism, and created from the ashes of these past experiences (Emenyonu 2006, 1). It therefore, represents the fountainhead of this new direction in post-colonial literature, while not solving our aesthetic problems – indeed some would argue, even worsening our identity instability by pointing at the most pertinent syndrome of our morbidities – providing a paroxysmal and paradoxical therapy (Bernabe, Chamoiseau, Confiant, Taleb Khayar 1990, 886 – 909).

The difference between an anticolonial tropic understanding and that of the postcolonial as apprehended in this work, is primarily encrypted in the claim of Kamau Brathwaite: “that in the place of the ‘failure to achieve consensus around the two primary cultures of Africa and Europe as contiguous-geo-linguistic reference points’, (in the aftermath of colonization and national independence in the English speaking outpost), there is a ‘watered-down’ Creolized resultant that is constitutively imitational, (acculturational), and native creational, (indigenizational)” (Brathwaite 1974,16). For Brathwaite this assimilationist cultural model of outpost development would constitute the creative imagination's attempt to leverage a moment of native resistance in the face of a ubiquitous colonial presence (Brathwaite 1974, 16). In regard to the postcolonial moment of intersectionality, we discard the assimilational/indigenizational oppositional vectors as representations of an antinomic space and replace it with Lacan's understanding of the unconscious being structured as a language. Here, the: inhibitor/elixir relationship drawn from existential phenomenology above, and its liberating power on woman-as-Other, Bios/Logos relationship of Césaire, assimilation/indigenization relation of Brathwaite, indeed Fanon's phylogenic/sociogenic relationship are all collapsed into Jacques Lacan's signifying chain and his construction of the Symbolic Register. Any contiguous relationship between signifier and signified (a de Saussurian enlightenment retention), is severed, in the face of the Lacanian/Derridean aphorism: there is no outside text – referring here to everything being a written text and there is nothing outside context ⁵(Hendrix 2016). Further to Brathwaite's anticolonial encapsulation above, it is within the ambiance of this

⁵ According to Saussure's theory, the linguistic system in each individual's brain is constructed from experience. The process of construction depends on the associative principles of contrast, similarity, contiguity and frequency.

signifying chain that we apprehend the process of Sylvia Wynter's dis-abling/dys-abling/de-godding of Western Capitalist Society through a kind of narratology of poetics. The inner stories of Wynter's embedded narrative, are – in part - effected through Jacques Derrida's deconstruction of Logocentric Metaphysics (destroying the Western Societal Citadel from within) as well as (the re-presentation of polyvalent alternatives to the residual enlightenment/modernist monovalent approach to the Occident); coming via the work of Michel Foucault and his microphysics of power. Here, the latter's definition of power and its relationship to the art of government (governmentality) is deceptively simple: it is a strategy evident primarily in relations between people. Power relations, in this sense, operate and exist through people, going right down – in a capillary like manner of increasingly minute complexity – into society.

Wynter's engagement with Foucault

Thomas Lemke (2007) examines the relationship between government and the state from the perspective of the methodological and theoretical insights that Michel Foucault had developed in his lectures of 1978 and 1979 at the College de France on the history of governmentality. Here he, in presenting this relationship as a set of unsorted odds and ends (in contrast to the gourmandisable homogeneity asserted with the sovereign-state and its power), sought notwithstanding, to identify three theoretical dimensions associated: a) a nominalist account that stresses the central importance of knowledge and political discourses in the constitution of the state b) a broad concept of technology that encompasses not only material but also symbolic devices, including political technologies as well as technologies of the self c) a strategic account that conceives of the state as an instrument and effect of political strategies (Lemke 2007). These power plays/seizures on society – otherwise apprehended by Foucault as the normalizing of society carry with them significant adjustments to sovereign-judicial authority and to the sovereign's traditional right to kill (Coleman and Grove 2009, 489- 507). They are: i) the biopolitics of the individual - anatomo-politics of the human body, where individual bodies are kept under carceral observation, and if necessary, subject to punishment (Coleman and Grove 2009, 493) ii) the biopolitics of the social - "biopolitics of the human race" (Foucault 2006, 243). Foucault explains this as a remote and aggregate form of management which has as its goal making populations live in productive ways as well as insuring against the "random element inherent in a population of human beings" (Foucault 2006, 246; Coleman and Grove 2009, 493) iii) state racism- the return of a (decentered) sovereign right to kill at the heart of biopolitics, "unleashed throughout the entire social body" (Foucault 2006, 253; Coleman and Grove 2009, 493). These set of Foucauldian power relations cannot be possessed, acquired, seized or shared, but has purely structural origins. ... However, Foucault's point is that we must indeed presuppose the free act in the analysis of power relations. The resistance fly in the power ointment is the multiplicative factor, the heteroglossia in the social body arising from these three adjustments. Here this polyvalency associated with heteroglossia, we will argue is coterminous with a muted Foucauldian concept of agency. (Foucault 2006, 253; Coleman and Grove 2009, 493, Williams 2021, 30)

It is among the multivalent voices of this Foucauldian power-relational-paradox, apprehended as (*pouvoir/savoir*) or power/knowledge that race and disability enters the cultural/postcolonial stage in the person of Sylvia Wynter. In terms of a broader contextualizing of her entrance, Foucault argued, from the perspective of his epistemic construct, that in the Classic era (episteme), the concept of Man was not yet defined – though – spoken off. Man was not the subject of a distinct epistemological awareness⁶. So, his

⁶ In distilling this concept of epistemological awareness from the famous painting *Las Meninas*, we apprehend the painter, at the same time, being seen on the picture where he is represented, and also able to see that upon which he is representing something."^[7] This tension between the field of semiotic representation and one's positionality in the field may be more easily explained by the academic website to which you upload your academic work for public scrutiny and the platform's creators/sustainers validation of your uploads in terms of readership. If perchance you have a run-of-the mill name shared by multiple authors then the accounting of the publications (cognition) must coincide with your documentary acknowledgment of them (recognition). If there is no coincidence then, technically you do not exist, this is

presentation of himself as the apotheosis of the humanization process was apprehended to result from the harbinger to Judeo-Christian world view (Aristotelian Philosophy), its concept of the world as non-homogeneous, and its impact on the concomitant Roman Catholic cosmology of the day. Here the act of Pope Alexander VI issuing a papal bull or decree, "Inter Caetera," in which he authorizes Spain and Portugal to colonize the Americas and its Native peoples as subjects, provided the *Quad Est Demonstrandum* of this scandalous arrogation; an act tantamount to insanity and/or drunkenness (Wynter 1996, 17-41). It is therefore a project in pursuit of the destruction/disabling/degodding the Aristotelian/Judeo-Christian hegemony and its deleterious impact on those who live in the two-thirds world outside of the Euro-American metropolitan center; this has been the Wynter Project for over forty years. In regard to specifics, Wynter has identified two critical historical milestones in what, following Wynter, may be regarded as human arrogation manufacturing. The first was associated with the requisition statement of the pope mentioned above as a direct legitimization of racism by the church as an arm of the state, referring to the Western European enclave using the brand "enemies of Christ" to establish the precedent for native exploitation. This racist arsenal that Wynter has apprehended as Man1 emerged out of the Renaissance as *homo politicus* and – as intimated above - was reinvented in response to the European encounter with the inhabited geographies of the Americas. At this time the representation of human-as-religious was compelled along a secularizing route to Man1 as the rational political subject. The second, a revision of humanness later gave rise to the liberal man-as-economics, *homo oeconomicus*, or Wynter's 'Man2', formulated within the colonial episteme's Darwinian distortions as divided between the naturally enabled (Europeans) and the naturally "dysabled (those racialised as naturally inferior). (Wynter 1996, 17-41).

Wynter's destabilization of Foucault

Foucault's "destabilization of the uni-vocal subject remains philosophical... ..black feminist and indeed Wynter however accords subjugated groups and individuals historical and political agency, although affiliations are always shifting and unstable." (Radhakrishnan 1996, 27-61; Wynter 2003)

Sylvia Wynter's work destabilizes Foucault's critique of Man, in that she centers the Colombian encounter of 1492 as being vital to the formulation of European representations of the Human. This vitality would epistemologically foreclose ways of being Human otherwise (Tilley 2021). It is within the context of the release of the papal bull therefore, that we apprehend the Cenu Indians, in speaking from within the quite different categories of their still polytheistic and divinized/ natural/religious cultures, could only interpret the discourse of the Requisition, as pronounced by the subjects of the Spanish State, as non-sense, as the speech of "drunkards" or "madmen." Here we observe vernacularity as a critical tool of her counter poetic narratology, and therefore, employed as part of a disabling subversion to the veridical communication associated with *homo economicus*. Indeed, Wynter appears to carry this stigmata/stygmata of a sacrilegious vernacularity within her own taxidermy, that has been characteristic of her cultural-script-re-writing on the superaltern/subaltern imperialist North/Global South territorial clashes (Wynter 1995 17-41).

However, the Foucauldian cynic may argue that all of these Wynter perspectives of the reimagination of the human and the employment of a counter poetics, are just other modes of subjectification to power. In other words, for them, power is ubiquitous so a subject can come into being only as a construct of a regime of power/knowledge. No society, culture, or practice possibly could be free of power (Bevir 1999, 5). Further, he/she may argue that one's view of the subject as an autonomous agent derives from their having so internalized the technique of confession that they see it falsely as a way of unlocking their inner selves rather than rightly as a way of defining themselves in accord with a social formation. The Foucauldian may argue further: "the obligation to confess is now relayed through so many different points, is so deeply ingrained in us, that we no longer perceive it as the effect of a power that constrains us; on the contrary, it seems to us that truth, lodged in our most secret nature, demands only to surface." (Bevir 1999, 5).

in relation to the platform designated. The Foucauldian problematic lay in Man's cognition, but no self-recognition (Foucault 1994).

Kalpana Wilson presents a potent rejoinder to the Foucauldian cynic and his/her attempt to disregard this vital staple of the cultural subject-as-agent in global south collective survivability:

She examines how concepts of women's 'agency' have been appropriated and transformed by neoliberal discourses. Within this framework, the exercise of agency is sought in women's strategies for survival rather than struggles for transformation, and at the level of the individual rather than the collective. Post-modern preoccupations with the subject and the recognition of 'difference' have been incorporated alongside liberal definitions of the 'rational individual exercising free will' to pursue and legitimize neoliberal economic policies involving intensified exploitation of poor women's labour in the name of 'women's empowerment' (Wilson 2011, 315-331).

Interpretative Phenomenological Analysis: DSD Athletes against International Athletics (Smith and Osborn 2015). (<https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pmc/articles/PMC4616994/>)

Interpretative phenomenological analysis (IPA) is a qualitative approach which aims to provide detailed examinations of personal lived experience (*erlebnisse*). It produces an account of lived experience in its own terms rather than one prescribed by pre-existing theoretical preconceptions and it recognizes that this is an interpretative endeavour as humans are sense-making organisms. It is explicitly idiographic in its commitment to examining the detailed experience of each case in turn, prior to the move to more general claims. IPA is a particularly useful methodology for examining topics which are complex, ambiguous, controversial, and emotionally laden. DSD is a prime exemplar of such a phenomenon: elusive, involving complex psycho-somatic and politically controversial interactions and difficult to articulate. (Smith and Osborn 2015, 41-42). In regard to this particular case under investigation no interview schedules are involved, rather the life worlds of the specific athletes under consideration are interpreted virtually, rather than in real time. The additional hermeneutical dimension, provided by Sylvia Wynter as supplanter to *homo economicus*, is significant fodder for our abduction of World Athletics and its attendant apparatuses (*dispositifs*) as the emergent site of the struggle between juridical-sovereign and bio power; this as warfare become part of the daily-life-experience of these athletes. Using the basic research question to which we have been alerted in the abstract: "*is the intersectionality of race and disability, an effective redress to the stand-off between Africa's elite intersex athletes and World Athletics through its potential surrogacy/agency for the distillation of a new humanism?*" we i) present the web pages constituting the issue that has resulted in the sanctioning of African Athletic Women from 2012 to today; their *Difference of Sex Development*. There is then ii) a roll out of the full narrative surrounding the event in the format of the CNN network interviewer's presentation of the issue and a segue to the reflective input of the women red-flagged⁷ iii) the researcher will draw on the apparatuses of interpretation such as thematic analysis; here I wish to make a distinction between the regular themes arising

⁷The sanctioned athletes, as categorized above, are: Caste Semenya (South Africa), Francine Nyonsaba (Burundi), Margaret Wambui (Kenya), Maximilia Imali (Kenya), Annet Negesa (Uganda), Christine Mboma (Namibia) and Beatrice Masilingi (Namibia). Of all of these athletes Annet Negesa (Uganda) provided the researcher the longest byte of reflective information for possible thematic analysis, with Miss Wambui providing a much shorter byte. However in deference to the process of bracketing as a critical Husserlian device to mitigate researcher bias we will resist any further attempt at disclosure.

from the personal reflection of the athlete (Smith and Osbourn 2007 53-80) versus juridical/biopolitical themes that relate to specific objects in a space representing modalities of governance of bodies; finally iv) the researcher will turn to Sylvia Wynter the counter cultural polymath who de/valorizes the triple adjustment theme guaranteeing subjectification due to the ubiquity of power , to rearticulate the respective theme in the context of a disabling/degodding global south cultural framework, we refer here to a kind of black metamorphosis as a exoticizing force upon ethno-class man (Smith and Osborn 2015): (<https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pmc/articles/PMC4616994/>) .

Text of the reports

Web 1: <https://www.11alive.com/article/sports/olympics/black-women-disqualified-olympic-races-high-testosterone-levels/85-af3447b3-493e-40c9-9f67-0fae0daa3bbf>

Web title: Black women primarily impacted by new testosterone rule for Olympics

News-analyst 1: The Rule in relation to athletes having a *Disorder of Sex Development* was put in place in 2019 by World Athletics which is the international governing body for world athletics. The rule states:” women competing in the 400m or longer distance races must have testosterone levels lower than 5 nanomoles per liter. While it is difficult to prove if there is a racial intent, sports commentator Idy Uyoe explains how the rule has impacted black female athletes in the Olympics 2016 800 meters.

Idy Uyoe Sport Commentator: The gold medal was won by Caste Semenya and the silver medalist was Francine Nyonsaba (Burundi), and the bronze by Margaret Wambui (Kenya), all three athletes tested for high levels of Testosterone and will be absent from Olympic games 2020. The rule indicates if these athletes should take medication to lower their testosterone levels, then they will be able to take place in the Olympics and other international events. This ruling is kind of ironic because world athletics is against doping, against all things of this nature (altering your natural state) so for an international organization that prides itself on drug testing to now ask athletes to take drugs is a little bit ironic.

Dr S Ready (eleven alive medical analyst): The five nanomoles per liter is a high reading for any woman. I can tell you that 99 percent of the women that I see are going to have a reading lower than five nanomoles per liter.

Dr. S Ready: We just don’t have enough information to say whether or not testosterone at that level whether or not there is an advantage.

Web2: <https://edition.cnn.com/interactive/2021/07/sport/athletics-testosterone-rules-negesa-imali-running-as-equals-dsd-spt-intl-cmd/>

Depth Interviews

Web Title: [Running as equals-Elite athletes fighting for acceptance](#)

Christiana McFarlane (CNN Sport): Five years ago three women topped the podium in the Rio Olympics. It was a silver medal for Margaret Wambui (Kenya), bronze for Francine Nyonsaba (Burundi) and a second gold for Caste Semenya. However, they will not be in Tokyo due to international athletics’ sanctioning them, sparking one of the biggest controversies in sport: *who can compete as a woman?*

Margaret Wambui (insert): We are just natural, just natural.

Semenya (insert): It is no longer about sports. It is about human dignity, human pride.

Christiana McFarlane (CNN Sport): All three have been impacted by rules for athletes for *Different sex Development (DSD)* which are ascribed to women who have higher than average levels of testosterone in their bodies. According to international athletics. This gives them an unfair performance advantage in certain events. In 2019 catastrophe struck for athletes with DSD when their most high-profile advocate Caste Semenya fought the governing body in court and lost.

Matthieu Reeb Court Secretary General (insert): Such discrimination is a reasonable, and proportionate means of preserving the integrity of female athletics.

Christiana McFarlane (CNN Sport): The damage to other athletes was immediate.

Maximilia Imali (Insert): When I heard that Caster lost her case, I knew that they were going to test me or I knew that they were going to remove me from the team, that's what I knew.

Christiana McFarlane (CNN Sport): Kenya's Maximilia Imali had been previously asked to undergo a physical exam and blood test by her federation.

Maximilia Imali (insert): They removed my clothes, they removed the blood, after that they told me you know Maxi you have high testosterone, we cannot accept you to run 800m.

Christiana McFarlane (CNN Sport): The high stakes questioning of her identity profoundly affected her.

Maximilia Imali (insert): Even me wanted to know myself, who am I. If I know myself, what else can I do to make me to be the Max they want me to be?

Christiana McFarlane (CNN Sport): World Athletics effectively give women with DSD, three basic options to continue in international sport. They can take hormone suppressing medication, have surgery, or switch to an event they consider less affected by high testosterone. According to human rights watch, this is a violation of international human rights law, and one that disproportionately affects women from the global south.

Maximilia Imali (insert): I call my mom and tell my mom I need to do surgery. She tell me Max you will never do surgery. Be the way you are. At the time my mom was just hospitalized because of me, because of the pressure.

Christiana McFarlane (CNN Sport): In 2012 Annet Negesa was preparing to compete for Uganda at the London Olympics, when she was abruptly pulled from competition by World Athletics.

Annet Negesa (insert): I travelled a lot from Uganda, and when I went to Nice, my international manager had to go with me to the hospital. They first needed blood samples then they took me to MRI. Then they brought the measurement, like the shoulders, the chest.

Christiana McFarlane (CNN Sport): To run again, she was told she must reduce her testosterone levels.

Annet Negesa (insert): I did not understand anything. I was still a teenager. I had no choice and I had a love of the sport

Christiana McFarlane (CNN Sport): Desperate to compete again, Negesa chose to go to this hospital (Women's Hospital International Fertility Center) in her native Uganda, where she was told her excess testosterone would be drawn out with a needle. But that is not what happened?

Annet Negesa: The following day I wake up having cuts under my belly. I wake up asking myself what they had done to me. Because I was in shock. The doctors had removed the testes inside me. I had a terrible headache. I had a problem of depression.

Christiana McFarlane (CNN Sport): Negesa said she grew weak and never completed at a league level again

Negesa (Con't): Because when I was still doing competitions, I was able to support my family, myself, but after that I was unable to help my family. I felt my life is over and I reached a time whereby I wanted to commit suicide because I am tired of everything on earth,

Christiana McFarlane (CNN Sport): Yet she would loose even more. In 2019 she spoke for the first time about her plight to the media. But going public made it worse in Uganda, where having DSD or being LGBT can lead to persecution or death. Soon after she was forced to flee her homeland and seek asylum in Germany. She lives alone, trying to rebuild but still not regretting speaking out.

Negesa: The more I talk about it the more I become strong. Very many others are going through and some of them are losing their lives because they are lacking people to talk to.

Maximilia Imali (return): It totally affected everything.... everything.... everything. Because you know we come from a poor family. I don't know where this high testosterone assisting me. I don't run the time that I want, I have not broken any records.

Depth interview with Activists/World Athletics

Christiana McFarlane (CNN Sport): While the science behind these rules is still debated, activists say the damage to women with DSD remain hidden and awful.

Payoshni Mitra (activist): I have worked with athletes who became alcoholic, went into severe depression, families who have lost their daughters. No rule should lead to human rights violations, and these rules are leading to human rights violations of athletes

Christiana McFarlane (CNN Sport): Payoshni Mitra has been working with DSD women athletes for over a decade. She says World Athletics has designed these rules to eliminate women with these conditions women's sport.

Payoshni Mitra: It is what they want. They just want these people to go. It is just like ethnic-cleansing in sport. They just want a purified notion of women's category.

Christiana McFarlane (CNN Sport): World Athletics provided Jonathan Taylor their lawyer to answer our questions.

Jonathan Taylor: We are not trying to ethnically cleanse anything; it is just an offensive stupid remark. What we are trying to do is to allow a level playing field for all women from whatever color so that they can aim to excel.

Christiana McFarlane (CNN Sport): How much of a concern is it to World Athletics, that the repercussions of these regulations could be damaging to their personal lives.

Jonathan Taylor: There is deep concern. This is why the regulations make it very clear, that there is no challenge to gender, there is no challenge to an athlete's dignity. And everything has to be done with confidentiality and respectful of their dignity. You have to make a distinction between male and female competition. To draw the line, you have to classify people.

Christine McFarlane: Negesa blames World Athletics for what happened to her.

Annet Negesa: They violated my rights as a human being. They treated me as a guinea pig

Christine McFarlane: She also has questions about her aftercare based on this medical report from the hospital in Kampala. It states Negesa's doctor in Kampala was waiting further discussions with the doctors from World Athletics before starting her hormone therapy. The doctor would not verify the letter to CNN

citing patient confidentiality, Negesa said she never received the long-term hormone treatment she needed in Uganda. What would you wish to tell World Athletics?

Annet Negesa: They should stop tampering with our athletic bodies.

Christiana McFarlane: World Athletics deny any involvement in what happened to Negesa. Saying they did not recommend surgery. They told CNN that treatment must be prescribed by a physician who is independent from the World Athletics. And they are no way involved in the process. We repeatedly asked both hospitals for a response and Negesa's manager and the Ugandan Athletic Federation for a comment, but they gave us none. Today, alone but surviving, Negesa is trying to regain her health and the chance to do the only thing that she has ever wanted; to run.

Annet Negesa: I am very happy that I am back in the sport. I pray God that I will continue making the improvements, so that I will fulfill my dream...

Christine McFarlane: What is your dream now?

Annet Negesa: It is going to the Olympics. It was smashed from me in 2012. I don't want to miss it again.

Christiana McFarlane: Semenya, the most famous champion of women with DSD is trying again to have her case heard; this time at the European Court of Human Rights. There she will argue that women with DSD have the right to run free.

Maximilia Imali: Caster is not doing it for herself. She is doing it for the generations that are coming.

Christiana McFarlane: One last roll of the dice for those fighting to be accepted as women in sport

Thematic Analysis based on personal interviews and cable-network reports

The theme of *Alterity-codependence* (referring to the inner self being licensed in the terms of the machinery of destructive/self-negating desire, is overridingly evidenced in this narrative. Here, in the contest of World Athletics (WA) sanctioning of DSD athletes and the concomitant impact-interviews and reports, we see evidence of a pathological desire for acceptance, resulting in a range of autopoietic capitulations on the part of African DSD women athletes. These range from apoplectic shock at the sanctions leveled against her (Margaret Wambui) to a chronic desire for self-erasure, evidenced in the Annet Negesa (self-admission of suicidal predilections) and Maximilia Imali (desiring to become whatever WA wanted her to become). This conscription to self-invalidation evidenced in the Imali/Negesa disclosure to CNN could imaginatively be applied to the Native American Indian Community under the duress of the Pope Alexander and King Ferdinand's Manichean ultimatum to accept Roman Catholicism or be conscripted for slave labor; this with the exception being that we do not have available any interview transcript of the latter's wholistic response to the ultimatum. In the face of this data deficit, we will momentarily attempt instead, to draw on the social ecology of the two groups – native Indians and Africans – along with the fragmented communication we have available to eke out probable analogical arguments that may be adaptable to such an (Indian/African) conjunctural relationship.

Foucauldian Apparatuses of interpretation

The question must be asked as to why we have taken this trajectory of interpretation; that is our attempt to link the calamitous situation of athletes that have been disenfranchised by their sexual classification to the cultural polymath Sylvia Wynter, as the critical linchpin in this research exercise on women of different sexual development (DSD), with the concept of apparatuses. In response to this query, the term as captured by Michel Foucault and its meaning: the various institutional, physical and

administrative mechanisms and knowledge structures, which enhance and maintain the exercise of power within the social body (Lemke 2007: 43-64) is his attempt primarily to devalorise western man and his progress as an oracular point of archaeological interpretation. Further, this de-valorization opens the vista of understanding of relationships in the social body as a kind of warfare; that is one directly consequential to the de-valorization exercise. This human decentering allows us primarily, to highlight: i) the deconstruction of the state government as a necessarily unique type of governmentality; opening World Athletics to be recognized as just one of many such forms ii) the disaggregation of power as juridical state and bio formats in order to adopt this multiplicative frame as a point of departure to our data representation. Finally, our human decentering facilitates – as we shall see in our discussion of our research findings – more complex ways of being cultural subjects to subvert Foucauldian homo-economicus with the realities of global south poetics in the humanization safari. For the purpose of clarity we invoke three definitions to this ongoing research investigation exercise: a) power/knowledge as “how discourses organized and systematized by the task of stating the truth exist in relation to organized and systematized forms of practice” (Coleman and Grove 2009, 492) b) biopower: [A] power that exerts a positive influence on life, that endeavours to administer, optimize, and multiply it, subjecting it to precise controls and comprehensive regulations (Foucault 2008) c) juridical state power: simply defined as the right to kill in defense and protection of the social body ⁸ (Erlenbusch 2015).

Black women primarily impacted by new testosterone rule for Olympics

<p>Apparatuses of sovereign power: The right to a Manichean separation of the abled from the damaged or disabled</p>	<p>Apparatuses of Bio power The multiplication of the modes of power expressed in the social body as a positive approach to life</p>	<p>Comments in regard posing the 'domination ^ repression' couplet as a corrective to the 'contract ^ oppression' model of power</p>
--	--	--

⁸ The caveat here is that modern societies rely on practices of sovereignty, discipline, and biopolitics, which are made to work in concert. This means, however, that practices of power traditionally attributed to sovereignty are modified because they serve a new purpose: once a society operates in a bio-power mode, killing can no longer be exercised in defense of the sovereign, but can only be justified if it serves the protection, defense, and salvation of the social body.

<p>News Analyst (unknown): The Rule in relation to athletes having a <i>Disorder of Sex Development</i> was put in place in 2019 by World Athletics...The <i>Disorder</i> reference here fits into Sylvia Wynter's notion of selection/dis/selection in evolutionary terminology. This anti-black racial trope is apprehended as inherent to juridical-sovereign power.</p>	<p>CNN interviewer: All three have been impacted by rules for athletes for <i>Different sex Development (DSD)</i> Unlike the term used overleaf, the reference to difference/over disorder is intended to exert a positive influence on life of DSD athletes by marketing news differently from competitors.</p>	<p>As Foucault argues the distinctions (disorder/difference) are just a more effective way of administration of subjectification: a way of moving quotidian warfare from the centre to the periphery.</p>
<p>IAAF assertion is that as an organization, it is benignly invasive; using testing techniques to determine aberrations from the requirement such as the athlete's use of performance enhancing drugs or having higher than average testosterone.</p>	<p>Idy Uyoe Sports commentator points to the irony of the employment of drugs (the altering of the DSD athlete's natural state) to determine if they are aberrations of nature constitutes tautological reasoning and is therefore ironic.</p>	<p>Again, Foucault argues, as he does above that this is just another means of decentering the warfare, a more effective way of subjectification. The European Court where Caste Semenya is only a broadening of the administrative ways or stratagems of compliance and conformity.</p>
<p>Lord Sebastian Coe: rules that the bans on female athletes with high levels of testosterone from participating in events between 400m and a mile are "here to stay"(inferred rather than stated in the above translated text).</p>	<p>Dr. S Ready: We just don't have enough information to say whether or not testosterone at that level whether or not there is an advantage.</p>	<p>Stratagems for subjectification through broadening/increasing the sphere/scope of the administration of power</p>

In doing a thematic analysis of *Black women primarily impacted by new testosterone rule for Olympics*, the power/knowledge interactions would suggest that what biopower does is that :a) it may be apprehended as a muted form of resistance in the social body by virtue of what Bakhtin would describe as heteroglossia. We apprehend this (heteroglossia) through the war in the social body. In the case of the apparatuses of sovereign power, if we should apprehend the grid above as encapsulating a 3*3 matrix (3rows by 3columns), row1/column1, points to the DSD condition as reported by the cable networks (unknown but more likely in Fox News Tradition) as Disorder in Sexual Development. This contrasts with CNN News that references DSD as Difference/s in Sexual Development. This (dis/order versus dif/fERENCE), in the latter case, a kind of deferring from judgment on the DSD classification in Derridean vernacular, is an example of what Foucault would describe as voyeuristic versus exhibitionistic resistance; where the former applies to sovereign power and the latter to biopower. Further, in comparing 2*1 and 2*2 (employing the matrix algorithm), international athletics is claiming that their integrity as an organization stands on the fact that their action into the athletes' bodies is for detection of violations. Idy Uyoe Sports commentator, apprehends the logic, and hence the morality of this invasion as indeed questionable; that is the altering of the natural state of DSD athletes through the mediation of drugs, on the presumption that

they are indeed aberrations of nature, constitutes tautological reasoning, and is therefore ironic. Finally, in regard to 3*1 and 3*2, though inferred rather than stated from the depth interview scripts, Sebastian Coe has unambiguously stated that the 2019 rules of international athletics are here to stay; we assume stay here to infer that these rules are without suspicion in regard to their credibility, in the judgment of IA. On the other hand, Dr S Ready (eleven alive medical analyst) poses stay/ing; as in staying away from making a definitive judgment/statement, such a disposition precipitated by doubt and suspicion, because science is yet (or unable) to speak to the specific impact of testosterone on DSD women athletes' performance particularly. One may, with caution therefore, make three probable inferences from this war in the social body; i) a deficiency in IA's judgment due to acting on insufficient evidence ii) a deficiency in science due to a largely binary epistemology of judgment (not able to assess the messy in-betweens) iii) a deficiency in interviewees as special resource persons, because of the political impact full authentic disclosure may have on their personal lives and careers or conversely, playing to the trendy biopolitical gallery/episteme to get some personal mileage. Beyond the pale of muted resistance however b) biopower, augments juridical power to increase *stratagems for subjectification through broadening/increasing the sphere/scope of the administration of power*, this broadening of strategies is evident in the resultant vector AA₁⁹. In other words, according to Foucault, western capitalist society employs ever more sophisticated neoliberal strategies to produce compliance and conformity, needless to state that this poses sinister implications for the disenfranchised. Roger Deacon sums it up very well: "we in the West, in our arduous and incessant search for truth, have also built into and around ourselves, intricate and powerful systems intended to manage all we know and do" (Deacon 1998, 113-148).

<p>A Apparatuses of sovereign power: The right to a Manichean separation of the abled from the damaged or disabled</p>	<p>Apparatuses of Bio power The multiplication of the modes of power expressed in the social body as a positive approach to life</p>	<p>Comments in regard posing the 'domination ^ repression' couplet as a corrective to the 'contract ^ oppression' model of power</p>
---	--	--

⁹ The vector AA₁ may be apprehended in the mode of Foucault's dispositive. Though grossly over simplified in relation to his more overdetermined understanding of this concept.

<p>News Analyst (unknown): The Rule in relation to athletes having a <i>Disorder of Sex Development</i> was put in place in 2019 by World Athletics...The <i>Disorder</i> reference here fits into Sylvia Wynter's notion of selection/dis/selection in evolutionary terminology. This anti-black racial trope is apprehended as inherent to juridical-sovereign power.</p>	<p>CNN interviewer: All three have been impacted by rules for athletes for <i>Different sex Development (DSD)</i> Unlike the term used overleaf, the reference to difference/over disorder is intended to exert a positive influence on life of DSD athletes by marketing news differently from competitors.</p>	<p>As Foucault argues the distinctions (disorder/difference) are just a more effective way of administration of subjectification: a way of moving quotidian warfare from the centre to the periphery.</p>
<p>IAAF assertion is that as an organization, it is benignly invasive; using testing techniques to determine aberrations from the requirement such as the athlete's use of performance enhancing drugs or having higher than average testosterone.</p>	<p>Idy Uyoe Sports commentator pointing to the irony of the employment of drugs to reduce hormones, even while the scientific evidence surrounded alleged advantage of testosterone to the intersexed athlete is still a very open issue with no immediate evidence of a resolution</p>	<p>Again, Foucault argues, as he does above that this is just another means of decentering the warfare, a more effective way of subjectification. The European Court where Caste Semenya is only a broadening of the administrative ways or stratagems of compliance and conformity.</p>
<p>Lord Sebastian Coe: rules that bar female athletes with high levels of testosterone from participating in events between 400m and a mile are "here to stay"(inferred rather than stated in the above translated text).</p>	<p>Dr. S Ready: We just don't have enough information to say whether or not testosterone at that level whether or not there is an advantage.</p>	<p>Stratagems for subjectification through broadening/increasing the sphere/scope of the administration of power</p> <p style="text-align: center;">A1</p>

Running as equals-Elite athletes fighting for acceptance

“Even me wanted to know myself, who am I. If I know myself, what else can I do to make me to be the Max they want me to be?” (Imali 2021)

The quotation drawn from Maximilia Imali's response to the panoptical experience of a) hearing the result of Caste Semenya's failed appeal to the European Court of justice b) recognizing the implications for her own fate as a DSD individual c) her ultimate elimination from 800m may be apprehended as part of the collateral effects related to the first of three adjustments of the normalizing society that is encapsulated in Foucault describes as "the anatomo-politics of the human body" (Coleman and Grove 2009, 494). The negative sanctioning, apprehended as part of correct training, is graphically evidenced in the panoptical experience of Annet Negesa also through the debauched treatment that she received at the Kampala hospital in her home country. Secondly, what Foucault apprehended as the second adjustment *biopolitics of the human race*, a remote and aggregate form of management which has as its goal to make populations live in productive ways as well as to ensuring against the "random element inherent in a population of human beings", is metaphorically apprehended in the interview between CNN's Christine McFarlane and World Athletics' lawyer, Jonathan Taylor. Here there is significant juridical/biopolitical dynamics¹⁰ between his attempt to redress the collateral damage to the public relations image of the organization, in the wake of DSD activist Payoshni Mitra's employment of the term ethnic cleansing to graphically represent the human rights implications surrounding World Athletics' 2019 rule implementation against DSD's. Finally, the third adjustment as, described as the return of a (decentered) sovereign right to kill at the heart of biopolitics, "unleashed throughout the entire social body" in the form of neighbors "doing away with the people next door, or having them done away with" is graphically evident in Annet Negesa's flight for her life to Germany in the face of her going live on Uganda radio about her World Athletics debacle (Foucault 2006, 259; Coleman and Grove 2009, 494). Indeed, there is significant fodder here to wade through, in the attempt to comprehend how a body whose head office is in Monaco France, would be culpable for the attempt on an athlete's life in Uganda. However, my point of reference is Western Electronic Media repackaging and selling of information as it related to Miss Negesa's DSD status. While there is an automatic gay/queer/lesbian/intersex coupling in neo liberal discourse, this automation does not necessarily hold true for global south discourse where hybridity/hybridities is/are the negotiated currency. Gray Gundaker (Gundaker 2000), Sylvia Wynter (Wynter 2003), Bell Hooks (Hooks 1984), Stuart Hall (Hall 1984) and indeed other thinkers of/on the global south have been instrumental in articulating the non-guarantee of this coupling in its relation to DSD women in the region (Hall 1984, 38-42)¹¹. Indeed the inductive logic that is being applied here to give the alleged Ugandan homophobia some perspective is that: i) there is overrepresentation in female athletes who have been sighted as having this uniquely distinguishing feature from the South ii) this has been a natural part of its demography iii) many of these athletes – male and female – work closely together in preparation for international competition without any kind of xenophobic repercussions...The fly in the ointment is therefore, not in the naturally manufactured hybridities of African/Asian/Latin American/Caribbean life; it is rather in the media repackaging by broadcasting networks in the metropole who may deliberately or carelessly have people done away with through a malignantly or, benignly but carelessly, packaged mode/order of information on DSD athletes.

Redressing the Foucauldian historical foreclosure, Wynter the polymath, disability/dysability

In our view it is society which disables physically impaired people. Disability is something imposed on top of our impairments by the way we are unnecessarily isolated and excluded from full participation in society (UPIAS 1976:14). This turned the

¹⁰ We refer here to a kind of hidden Nietzschean hand in the process of an expanding administrative framework of apparatuses of power and the concomitant attempt to restore homeostasis to the system in the wake of the rule fallout, this restoration being a systemic self-serving exercise.

¹¹ This politics of articulation (hybridization) eschews all forms of fixity and essentialism; social, political and class formations do not exist *a priori*, they are a product of articulation. Stuart Hall has termed this the politics of 'no necessary or essential correspondence of anything with anything' and it marks a significant break with a Marxism that has assumed an underlying totality to social relations.

understanding of disability completely on its head by arguing that it was not impairment that was the main cause of the social exclusion of disabled people but the way society responded to people with impairments. (Oliver 2004, 18-31).

This evocation from Mike Oliver, and its main pulse, “it was not impairment that was the main cause of the social exclusion of disabled people but the way society responded to people with impairments” is indeed the raw nerve that brings into view the way in which – according to Wynter, - the normal becomes normal and the real becomes real. Here she is refencing the historically disabling/impairing way in which what she has euphemistically referred to as Man 1 and Man 2 has emerged on the scene of history with dire consequences for the remaining two thirds world. Wynter 2003 (257-337) attempts to put in more graphic terms the collateral effects of this emergence when she angles it from the perspectives of Anibal Quijano and Walter Mignolo as the *racism/ethnocentric complex* and the *colonial difference* respectively through which the world of modernity was to institute itself (Quijano 1999,2000; Mignolo 1999, 2000). The collateral effect of this institutionalization has been tragically etched in Walter Benjamin’s Angelus Novus’s (angel of history) debris piled up before him in the wake of his flight backwards into the future:

all our present struggles with respect to race, class, gender, sexual orientation, ethnicity, struggles over the environment, global warming, severe climate change, the sharply unequal distribution of the earth resources (20 percent of the world’s peoples own 80 percent of its resources, consume two-thirds of its food, and are responsible for 75 percent of its ongoing pollution, with this leading to two billion of earth’s peoples living relatively affluent lives while four billion still live on the edge of hunger and immiseration...(Wynter 2003, 260-261; Jeffries 2016)

It is from this point of view of a *not yet human history*, one defined by Darwinian deselection rather than selection, that Maximilia Imali poses the question “Even me wanted to know myself, who am I. If I know myself, what else can I do to make me to be the Max they want me to be?” (Imali 2021). In Fanonian terminology, this not yet human history, a deep declivity is correspondent to the zone of non-being or “the hell”, of blackness honestly confronted with its condition in an anti-Black world; this anti-Black world, the only world we know, hides this non-being to the extent that it ascribes a place and role to abject blackness” (Gordon 2006, 1-43). Jonathan Taylor’s ephemeral attempts to redress the ethnic cleansing ascription to World Athletics’ rule against DSD athletes by suggesting: “this is why the regulations make it very clear, that there is no challenge to gender, there is no challenge to an athlete’s dignity” (Taylor 2021) is at best platitudinal in the face of prior damage. Drawing from the vernacular of disability therefore, it is not regulations that are needed to redress the indignities that have been already tattooed on DSD women athletes – especially those of African hue already disenfranchised by virtue of physical geography – but reparation. This reparation encrypted as a social model of disability has to be envisaged and effected by all within World Athletics’ taxidermy (executive leadership, administrators, athletes, activists, development specialists within the global south and empire) as it is currently, in the disabled cosmos, if it is to reboot for the future and not become a fossil.

Wynter gave veridical understanding to this rebooting metaphor in the context of the ethnoclass versus human struggle:

Empire’s most powerful apparatus is the education system. It initiates us into a culture and knowledge system that instructs us to want to be of a specific ethnoclass of humanity. The tragedy of this is that whilst this particular idea of being optimally human holds us together, as givers/receivers of *colonial independence as gift*¹², it can do so only in terms of the “us” and “the not us.” . . . it is a version of reality in which the Creole elite class¹³,

¹² Emphasis mine

¹³ Emphasis mine

or the “Coe-Sands¹⁴” variants of this, as I wrote in my open letter after the 1992 Los Angeles uprisings, is represented, or rather overrepresented, as the reference point for what a human is supposed to be. We cannot give up writing stories about what it means to be human that displace those that are at the foundation of Empire. There is no order in the world that can exist or hold together, including an empire, without a founding story. Now the question for academia in the twenty-first century is, will you make space within it to be able to write a new foundation? (Bayani Rodriguez 2018, 831-836)

In the context of African athletes of different sexual development, our foundation story begins with the act of Pope Alexander VI issuing a papal bull or decree, “Inter Caetera,” in which he authorizes Spain and Portugal to colonize the Americas and its Native peoples as subjects; the Cenu Indians, in speaking from within the quite different categories of their still polytheistic and divinized/ natural/religious cultures, could only interpret the discourse of the Requisition, as pronounced by the subjects of the Spanish State, as nonsense, as the speech of “drunkards” or “madmen.” If we apprehend the apoplectic shock of the Cenu Indians to be correspondent to that of Margaret Wambui, in her evocative expression: *we are just natural, just natural*; then we may apprehend World Athletics to be working within the same Judeo-Christian matrix as that of the 1492 Papal Bull decree “Inter Caetera,” This correspondence is based on the following inductive analogy: i) the lands of the New World are the result of nature geography ii) any gift of nature cannot be unilaterally taken except by the same motive force of its creation; nature iii) the pope and the king of Spain have both (unilaterally) decided to take the lands of the New World to be theirs iv) the Pope and King of Spain are operating on the basis of laws that defy those of nature geography, Main Conclusion (MC): the pope and king of Spain are speaking as drunk/mad men. In similar manner, i) the bodies of DSD women are the result of nature biology ii) any gift of nature cannot be declassified or discredited except by the motive force of its creation; nature iii) World Athletics/ECJ have both (unilaterally) decided to declassify DSD athletes (overly represented by the global south) from the category of eligibility for events => the 400 meters in international competition iv) MC: the World Athletics/ECJ are behaving as drunk/mad men. It should be made clear that this analogical reasoning has little or no relevance outside of the apparent conjunctural relationship between the Judeo-Christian/Native Peoples’ moment of 1492 and the World Athletics/African (DSD) Woman’s moment of the twenty first century. In search of further correspondence, World Athletics and the Judeo-Christian matrix, both share the antecedent of the Aristotelian view of the world through the harbinger to the current games which ran from 776 BC through 393 AD. Still further, it would appear that the *enemies of Christ* search and capture mission that was precipitated by the outcome of the Sepulveda/LasCasas debate correlates highly with the enemies of a *purified notion of women’s categories* search and destroy mission that has been precipitated by the outcome of Semenya’s 2019 ECJ appeal. Here in positing the Appeals: The Caste Semenya Appeal, is a synecdoche of DSD activists against World Athletics, just as the Subjugation of the Indians Appeal is a synecdoche for Las Casas against the Spanish Crown.

What we may apprehend from our new foundation story thus far, that our attempt to redress the Foucauldian critique of Man, is a legitimate conjuncture, articulated between 1492 and the twenty first century as moments that spawn a notion of the Cultural Subject¹⁵; one that consequently undermines the Foucauldian notion of the absolute and irrevocable death of the subject in the face of the alleged ubiquity of power. Stuart Hall in his interview with Lawrence Grossberg (Hall 1986) has suggested that the post structural notion of the death of the cultural subject is – in typical Hall euphemism – a hasty judgment. This

¹⁴ The Reference is being made here to Sebastian Coe who is head of World Athletics and Mike Sands who is head of North American, Central American and Caribbean Athletic Association (NACAC).

¹⁵ Hall has been careful not to refer to the subject in reductionist (monolithic) terms hence his reference to positionalities instead of position and his apprehension of the cultural subject in quasi-dispositional terminology via Lawrence Grossberg’s attempt to find common ground between Foucault’s epistemes and Hall’s conjunctural analysis in his concept of radical contextualization (Davis 2018: 1-11).

is particularly significant since millions of people have not exited what Jacques Lacan and Roland Barthes has apprehended as the Real (as a metaphor of the relationship between the 17th century enlightenment and modernism). Indeed, the dystopian situation Wynter so clearly articulates in her 2003 work and rearticulated in part above: “20 percent of the world’s peoples own 80 percent of its resources, consume two-thirds of its food, and are responsible for 75 percent of its ongoing pollution, with this leading to two billion of earth’s peoples living relatively affluent lives while four billion still live on the edge of hunger and immiseration” is graphic testimony to hasty Foucauldian judgment (Wynter 2007, 257-337) Hall argues, in attempted corrective surgery to the post-structural assumption of the ubiquity of the text/nothing existing outside of the text, that the postmodern episteme will look very much like the modern episteme except for some very minor changes. Here his assertion is based on the perspective of his Marxism of no guarantees and the Lacanian signifier being accountable to history in as much as it is accountable to the text.

It should be said that Wynter’s open invitation of the global south intellectual to sacrilege or to revolt against Empire and its most potent weapon, its education system, does not end with Stuart Hall or any similar Indian/Negro conjunctural notion of the emergent cultural subject, as a redress to Foucauldian Man’s disappearance from the scene of history. This is due to the fact that her primary focus in this iconoclastic attack is the Judeo-Christian matrix which is perceived by her – in the contest of the 1492 moment – to be the most potent incentive to render impotent, the black metamorphosis; this metamorphosis being the only means to the liquidation to the current order of knowledge. It is in this vein that she as: writer, activist, theorist.... houngan, invokes Vodoun and its cosmological system to transmogrify the African DSD female into the apotheosis of Payoshni Mitra’s impure form of women’s categories – the ultimate antipathy to the Petrarchan/Shakespearean form of beauty. It is in this Bondye (the supreme god in vodoun)¹⁶”christ” encounter that Aime Cesaire’s Word – the logos – will be ascendent/descendent in this its Janus-faced ¹⁷ struggle against bios (ethno-class man), and the ongoing search for new humanities. This (nigger/negre) variant – a further upgrade/further downgrade of the Indian/Negro format may be apprehended as part of the new demonic ground within black feminist reflection (McKittrick 2006: Wynter 2003, 227-253). We eagerly await the Parousia of Maximilia Imali; this time under the full transformative power of the black metamorphosis, as a synecdoche of the new humanism.

Limitations to the research (criticisms of Wynter)

As Delgado (2011) notes, intersectionality can be taken to such extreme positions that the constant sub-division of experience (into more and more identity categories) can eventually shatter any sense of coherence. While Delgado’s use of the phrase *taken to such extreme positions* would imply the exception rather than the rule, in regard to intersectionality, the impact of this sub-dividing of experience is noted to have collateral effects in one’s attempt to ask the question as to what hybridities such as the bios (ethno-class man)/logos relationship would look like beyond the firewall of linguistic tropes in Wynter’s work. In other words, are the necessary fault lines between the social model of disabilities and that of race, pragmatically conceivable to bring about the kind of radically decolonized Maximilian Imali alter that was evidenced in the pummeling blind mentioned at the beginning of this paper? Her critics argue that this

¹⁶ From the point of view of empirical science, Vodouisants would say that the entire cosmos, including all of the principles inherent in its mechanical, biological, and stellar functions, can be reduced to one higher principle, Bondye, who is the ensurer of universal order and the source of all human actions. The highest wisdom consists not only in recognizing the wholeness of the universal order as contained in Bondye, but also in affirming that same wholeness in the human community. (Desmangles, 1992, 96)

¹⁷ We wish here to posit Homi Bhabha’s third space (space of ambivalence) as a way of apprehending Sylvia Wynter’s sacred versus sacrilegious Janus-sic (Janus-face) struggle in pursuit of what she has apprehended as the black metamorphosis – the full re-instillation of the black poetics project in the ethno-class versus human struggle. Here we fully acknowledge the caveats of Jan Mohammed (1985) and Gates (1991) that Bhabha has rendered ignoble the authenticity of the Fanonial revolutionary struggle for a new humanity.

prescription for a ubiquitously supplanting narrative has not been given -though recommended- by Wynter; nor by those who are in support of her forty-odd-year post-colonial project (Serynada 2015). Further, like her harbinger Frantz Fanon, it is said of Wynter that the mode in which she delivers her ideas often evokes the intellectual smugness she critiques in Western philosophers who have overrepresented their idea of the human (Serynada 2015). This criticism of Wynter's mode of delivery is based on the major premise/presumption that academic writing is meant to demystify the world around us and dispense the findings, but is often impenetrable. The value-added purpose of its transformation of those most detritized by the zero-sum game of neoliberalism becomes part of the collateral damage of an exegesis walled in by the occident as well as the academy (Serynada 2015). Finally, Serynada has posited that: a) crucial events prior to the hegemony of Europe are absent from her discussions, for example the trans-Saharan slave trade, which form the foundations of the structure of antiblackness in Asia/MENA even before 1492 b) her analysis is inadequate to the relations of Man's Others and the power dynamics among them. Questions of domination also play out within grassroots activism, in movements and communities (on or offline), in households, in classrooms, in ghettos and on reservations, on the fringes, the margins, and above all in blackness, the exterior of universality.

Redress to Wynter critics and conclusion

In attempting to redress the key concerns stated I would wish to suggest that Wynter's main intention in her forty odd years of work is to examine other ways of becoming human epistemologically, not methodologically. Rather, the latter as an erotic trope, discovers the former in the humanization process. Therefore, the plowing of her new demonic grounds is intended to conjure up the unnamed thing within the African Diaspora and to allow its method of exegesis to find it.¹⁸ This logic of idiosyncratic method finding/co-defining *thing conjured from within Africana people* follows from Wynter's and Toni Morrison's assertion that: we are not resource-seeking animals who speak (a Marxist tropic retention), but speaking subjects who live in language (Kaiser and Thiele 2017; 403-415). In the case of this researcher, the thing found within has been apprehended in psycho-analytic terms of reference, rather than that of neuroscience – the latter being the preference of Wynter, Eudell and Mignolo (Serynada 2015). Here alterity¹⁹ ²⁰as the collateral damage of the idiosyncratic subject-experiences of the global south – chattel slavery, colonialism, neocolonialism, re-inscription within Western Liberalism and its game of winners and losers; - has fostered the feeling of inferiority that lives “in me/us, not in any name” (Mignolo 2015). This researcher has codified in memory this account of the blind's transfiguration as a non-genetic “set of

¹⁸ The dynamics here are deeply erotic as explained by William Michael Parris in his attempt to intersect the concept of invention in the work of Hortense Spillers, Frantz Fanon and Sylvia Wynter (Paris 2018, abstract). Not unlike the dog attracted by the scent of the bitch in heat (during its cycle), the method of exegesis/translation is attracted to the corresponding type of “Thing” (Alter in the context of this work) based on the mode of vulva-violence excreted. Here Paris argues that invention is not in the *fetus resulting from insemination* – historically characterized by theft and exploitation for the global south (the black diaspora as synecdoche) – but rather, by the violent wrenching away from the coital act. It is Janus-faced-like-action of violent penetrating/wrenching that constitutes a radical form of praxis

¹⁹ Fanon addresses the issue of otherness by theorizing a New Humanity that, stemming from and following violent action, overcomes alterity by transcending the dichotomy between colonizer and colonized. ‘To shoot down a European is [...] to destroy an oppressor and the man he oppresses at the same time: there remain a dead man, and a free man’ (Sartre, 1961, p. 19).

²⁰ We invoke the neologism alterity (dependency and codependency interchangeably) in this presentation for two reasons. In the anti-colonial usage by Frantz Fanon, the cultural revolution would obliterate Otherness to set the conditions for the new society. However Stuart Hall has reminded us that this conflation between utopia and the subject is an oversimplification; that there is always some slippage, something left out in this overdetermined relationship (Hall 2004). In regard to codependency we speak to volatile and changing positionalities -Colonial ego/alter – in the context of their inter/intra personal struggles rather than any originary (reductionist) relationship. Here we acknowledge the Hall condition of no/necessarily no connection/s as part of his Marxism of no guarantees to upset the applecart of both traditional Marxism and post- Modernism, and the relation of both to the postcolonial

instructions,” as Wynter terms it, that work intimately with my physical drives: a human code that overrides, gives meaning to, and interpolates itself within my genetic one. The summative effect of this blind saga – from codependency to radical autonomy; (the Logos) and its interpolation with my Bios - is that it has been scripted in this research endeavor as a metaphorical suitcase for re-dressing the historical balance to the nature of the ethno-class (International Athletics) man versus human (African DSD Women) struggle. The mission therefore, is, to contribute to the removal of in-excess of five hundred years of debris at the feet of Walter Benjamin’s Angel of History due to the collateral damage of Global South peoples’ innovation being stolen and commodified by the North In effect therefore, Wynter’s mission is ultimately that of a heuristic enabler and redresser of collateral damage, whose cartographic mission field is the global south. More importantly, it is a heuristic that finds its *raison d’être* in vodoun not in Western Liberalism, and its 1492 Romish Legacy. It is only then – within this black metamorphosis - that the decolonized black alter may emerge like the Phoenix from the ashes.

Reference

- Bernabe, Jean, Patrick Chamoiseau, Raphael Confiant, Mohamed B. Taleb Khayer. 1990. “In Praise of Creoleness.” *Callaloo* 13 (1) 886-909. <http://www.jstor.org/stable/2931390>
- Bevir, M. 1999. FOUCAULT AND CRITIQUE: DEPLOYING AGENCY AGAINST AUTONOMY. *Political Theory* 27. [Foucault and Critique: Deploying Agency Against Autonomy \(escholarship.org\)](http://www.escholarship.org)
- BOTCW Staff, 2020. Honoring revolutionary Audre Lorde the poet who dared us all to be powerful, BECAUSE OF THEM WE CAN, blog, November 17. Accessed November 18 2021, [Honoring Revolutionary Audre Lorde: The Poet Who Dared Us All To Be Po – BOTWC \(becauseofthemwecan.com\)](http://becauseofthemwecan.com).
- Braidotti, R., 2018. A Theoretical Framework for Critical Posthumanities. *Theory Culture and Society* 36 (6): 31-61. Accessed November 19 2021, doi: 10.1177/0263276418771486
- Brathwaite, K 1974. *Contradictory Omens: Cultural Diversity and Integration in the Caribbean*. New York: Savacou Publications.
- Césaire, Aime. 2000. *Discourse on colonialism*, trans. Joan Pinkham, New York: Monthly Review Press.
- Coleman, Matthew and Kevin Grove. 2009. Biopolitics, Biopower, and the Return of Sovereignty in Environment and Planning D *Society and Space* 27(3):489-507, DOI: 10.1068/d350
- Davis, A. (2019) Failure is always an option: the necessity, promise & peril of radical contextualism, *Cultural Studies*, 33:1, 46-56, DOI: 10.1080/09502386.2018.1544264. Publisher version of record available at: <https://www.tandfonline.com/doi/full/10.1080/09502386.2018.1544264>
- Delgado, Richard, and Jean Stefancic. 2001. *Critical race theory: an introduction*. New York: New York University Press.
- Emenyonu, E. N., 2006. *Teaching African Literature Today*. Woodbridge: James Curry.
- Gonsalves, Ralph E. 1983. *The Trade Union Movement in St. Vincent and the Grenadines*. Educational Pamphlet 6, Movement for National Unity. Kingstown, St. Vincent: The Movement.
- Erlenbusch, V. 2015. From Sovereignty to War, Foucault’s analytics of power. *International Relations paper*. <https://www.e-ir.info/2015/12/12/from-sovereignty-to-war-foucaults-analytic-of-power/> accessed November 20 2021.
- Fanon, Frantz. 1963. *Wretched of the Earth*, trans. Richard Philcox. New York: Grove Press

- Fanon, Frantz. 1967. *Black Skin, White Masks*. London, England: Pluto Press.
- Foucault, Michel; Mauro Bertani; Alessandro Fontana; François Ewald; David Macey. 2007. Security, Territory, Population LE C T U R E S AT T H E COLLÈGE DE FRANCE, 1977-1978. London: Palgrave Macmillan
- Gillborn, D. 2015. Intersectionality, Critical Race Theory, and the Primacy of Racism: Race, Class, Gender, and Disability in Education. *Qualitative inquiry* 21(3) 277-287.
- Goodley, Dan; Rebecca Lawthom; Kristy Lilliard; Katherine Runswick-Cole. 2020. "The Desire for New Humanisms. In *Journal of Disability Studies in Education* (1) 125-144. Accessed November 28, 2021, doi:10.1163/25888803-00101003.
- Gundaker, Gray. 2000. "Discussion: Creolization, Complexity, and Time." In *historical Archaeology*, 2000, 34(3): 126-133.
- Hall, S. 1986. On Postmodernism and Articulation: an interview with Stuart Hall. Accessed November 20, 2021, <https://doi.org/10.1177/019685998601000204>
- Hendricks, G. 2016. Deconstruction the end of writing: 'Everything is a text, there is nothing outside context'. *Verbum et Ecclesia* 37(1) , doi. org/10.4102/ve.v37i1.1509.
- Hooks, B. 1995. *Killing Rage, ending racism*. New York: Henry Holt and Company
- Hooks, B. 1984. *Feminist theory from margin to center*. Massachusetts; South End Press.
- Josephs, P.E. 2009. The Black Power Movement, Democracy and America in the King years. *The American historical Review* 114(4) 1001-1016.
- Lemke, T. 2007. An Indigestible Meal: Foucault, Governmentality and State Theory. *Distinktion journal of social theory*, DOI: 10.1080/1600910X.2007.9672946.
- Mignolo, W. 1999. I am where I think: epistemology and the colonial difference. *Speech/Debate* incorporated in *Journal of Latin American Cultural Studies* 8(2) 235-245. Accessed November 20 2021. <https://doi.org/10.1080/13569329909361962>.
- Paris, W.M. 2018. *The Value of Invention: on the Ungendering of Black Life in Sylvia Wynter, Frantz Fanon and Hortense Spillers*. PhD diss., Pennsylvania State University. (Graduate School College of Liberal Arts).
- Quijñanao, A. Coloniality of Power, Eurocentrism and Latin America. *Project Muse* 1(3)533-589.
- Quinan, C.L. 2016: Feminism, existential. In **The Wiley Blackwell Encyclopedia of Gender and Sexuality Studies** edited by Nancy A. Naples (Editor-in-Chief), Renee C. Hoogland (Associate Editor), Maithree Wickramasinghe (Associate Editor), Wai Ching Angela Wong (Associate Editor) New Jersey: Wiley Press
- Senghor, Leopold. 1939. "Ce que L'Homme noir apporte." Published Essay, *L'Etudiant noir*.

Smith, J.A., and J. Osborn. 2015. **Interpretative phenomenological analysis as a useful methodology for research on the lived experience of pain.** *British Journal of Pain* (1): 41-42. Accessed November 18, 2021, doi: : [10.1177/2049463714541642](https://doi.org/10.1177/2049463714541642)

Taylor, E, D. Gilborn, G. Ladson-Billings 2009. **Foundations of critical race theory in education.** New York. Routledge.

Tate, 1997. **Critical theory and Education: history theory and implications.** Jstor 22: 195-247. Accessed November 19, 2021, doi: <https://doi.org/10.2307/1167376>

West, C, K Crenshaw, N Gotanda, G Peller, K Thomas. 1995. **Critical race theory : the key writings that formed the movement.** New York: New York Press.

WHO (World Health Organization: World report on Disability), Annual Report 2002. Switzerland: WHO

Wynter, Sylvia (1995) *The Pope Must Have Been Drunk, the King of Castile a Madman: Culture as Actuality and the Caribbean Rethinking of Modernity.* In A. Ruprecht & C. Taiana (Eds.) *Reordering of Culture: Latin America, the Caribbean and Canada in the 'Hood.* Ottawa: Carleton University Press.

Wynter S. 2003. *Unsettling the Coloniality of Being/Power/Truth/Freedom: Towards the Human, After Man, Its Overrepresentation--An Argument.* *The new centennial review* 3(3)257-337.

Wynter, S. 2015. *On being human as praxis,* editor K McKittrick, North Carolina: Duke University Press. Accessed November 19 2021, doi: <https://doi.org/10.1215/9780822375852>