

Theology on the Web.org.uk

Making Biblical Scholarship Accessible

This document was supplied for free educational purposes. Unless it is in the public domain, it may not be sold for profit or hosted on a webserver without the permission of the copyright holder.

If you find it of help to you and would like to support the ministry of Theology on the Web, please consider using the links below:



Buy me a coffee

<https://www.buymeacoffee.com/theology>



PATREON

<https://patreon.com/theologyontheweb>

[PayPal](#)

<https://paypal.me/robbradshaw>

A table of contents for *The Churchman* can be found here:

https://biblicalstudies.org.uk/articles_churchman_os.php

REVIEWS OF BOOKS.

THE NATURAL AND THE SUPERNATURAL. By John Oman, *Principal, Westminster College, Cambridge. Cambridge University Press.* 18s. net.

Dr. Oman has undertaken a survey of all the elements which go to make up a true foundation for a philosophy of religion. The extent of his researches and the varied character of his knowledge, his powers of analysis, and his skill in detecting sources of error as well as of illustrating the true method by references to many different fields of literature, all go to the production of a work which leaves the ordinary student with a sense of wonder at the vastness of the task and the success with which it is accomplished. His purpose is to show that a philosophy of religion to be adequate must take account of all the facts of environment, but environment must not be limited to the Natural or that of which the senses take cognizance, or Natural Science can analyse. It includes the Supernatural, yet "there is no possible study of anything apart from the Natural, and least of all religion—not only has religion to do with our relation to all environment, but that by its view of the Natural the quality of religion is determined, even if it be also true that the view of the Natural is determined by the conception of the Supernatural." It is this indissoluble connection of the two spheres which is the main and guiding thought of Dr. Oman's consideration of the wide field which he covers.

The subject is divided into four parts. The first explains the Scope and Method of the Inquiry. Various theories as to the nature of religion are considered, and a clear distinction is drawn between the "holy" and the "sacred." The former is "the direct sense or feeling of the Supernatural" and is akin to Otto's conception, with the sense of awe predominating. The "sacred" is "its valuation as of absolute worth" and only "a reality having this absolute value is the religious Supernatural."

The first necessity is an examination of "Knowing and Knowledge," and this forms the subject of the second part. An interesting analysis is made of four types of knowledge: awareness, apprehension, comprehension and explanation, and a vivid illustration drawn from the Poet's and the Child's awareness and apprehension. The Form of Perception, Sensation, Value and Validity are considered, and the various sources of error made clear. Any judgment is rendered false if subjected to misleading limitations.

In the third part the difficult problems of "Necessity and Freedom" come under review. The conflict of views as represented in theories such as Kant's noumenal and phenomenal world, the claims of science which are greatly diminished from the old infallibility; Darwinism, Pantheism, the Cartesian Method, Rationalism and Romanticism are in turn examined and their adequacy or inadequacy tested. All thinking, feeling and acting must be in

accord with the highest environment, and only then can there be true freedom.

Part Four treats of the relation of the "Evanescient and the Eternal." This embraces the great problems concerning the relationship of the Natural to the Supernatural. History and experience contain many warnings against the failure of endeavouring to know a higher environment by learning to live rightly in it, which is the aim of religion. This is the greatest of all experiments—"the endeavour to live rightly in our whole environment—natural and supernatural, the seen and temporal and the unseen and eternal"; and there is a growing knowledge of a higher environment. Religions are classified according to certain definite principles, and they are dealt with under explanatory headings: The Primitive, covering Animism, Magic and Primitive Monotheism. The Polytheistic, where Gods are Anthropomorphic inferences, and property and civilization are associated with Polytheism. The Mystical, of which there are two types, the chief being "redemption by absorption into the Supernatural." The Ceremonial-Legal, which has shown that "what protects, in time imprisons," and Jesus was faced with "a situation in which the external legal embodiment of religion had to be destroyed if the spirit of religion was to be saved." Later, Judaism and Catholic Christianity have a more elaborate ceremonial-legalism than any other form of religion. And even then there is "more of the shell than of the kernel." The Prophetic, Jesus overcame "the idea of the moral order of the universe as the equivalence of action and award; the putting of ceremonial observances on a level with moral fidelity; the sense of the holy as awe, not moral reverence; the dividing of life into sacred and secular." This is seeing the eternal in the meaning and purpose of the evanescent. Thus the Natural and Supernatural are one harmonious whole, and man's life is most fully satisfied when it reaches out with growing knowledge to the highest environment.

Dr. Oman's great work will be read and re-read by students who aim at grasping all the elements necessary in a true philosophy of religion.

THE CARTHUSIAN ORDER IN ENGLAND. By E. Margaret Thompson. [Pp. x + 550. With two illustrations.] S.P.C.K. 21s. net.

A comprehensive history of the Carthusian Order in England has long been needed, and it can be said at once that the need has been well supplied by the present volume. Fortunately for the author, it was not an insuperable task to compress the necessary material into one book, for the Order never spread very widely in this country and the records are often scanty. The solitary ideal of the Carthusian never appears to have found much favour in England. At the most there were only nine houses compared with the far larger number belonging to the better-known monastic Orders. The Cistercians alone possessed seventy-five houses and the Benedictines far surpassed this number. Yet it was the one Order which could boast as no other one could, "Never reformed because

Paulinus of York (p. 115) effected very little for the conversion of Northumbria and East Anglia ; this was done by Aidan and Felix respectively. Paulinus' disconnected work in the north was ruined after his retirement in 633. The influence of the Greek Liturgy was surely present at Rome long before the time of Pope Zacharias (741-52) (p. 133). Paschasius Radbert did not uphold the eucharistic doctrine accepted in his day (p. 241). He was an innovator even in the teaching of the Benedictine houses.¹ Professor Laistner translates "Chorepiscopus" as "Choir-bishop" (pp. 243, 258), whereas that functionary was a kind of "suffragan" in the modern Anglican sense, with special duties in the country around an episcopal centre. On p. 254 the teaching on dialectics assigned to Raban Maur was derived from Augustine. The statement that no metaphysician appeared in this epoch save John the Scot, entirely overlooks Frédegise of Tours, and Candidus of Fulda. Professor Laistner would have been saved from this remark if he had consulted the *Beiträge zur Geschichte der Philosophie des Mittelalters*, a most valuable series of studies, which he does not appear to mention.

There are some very loose expressions which require attention, viz. : p. 149, "his first care had needs to be to reform . . ." ; p. 172, "recourse was had to" ; p. 192, "he knew much more than a smattering." We note that he does not accept (p. 238) Bastgen's conclusion on the authorship of the *Caroline Books*, which assigned them to Alcuin.

But these matters should not prevent any student from buying this valuable book. Reading it as a whole, we have little but praise for it.

THE DAWN OF INDIAN FREEDOM, with a Foreword by the Archbishop of York. By J. C. Winslow and V. Elwin. *George Allen & Unwin*, 1931. 4s. 6d.

THE MORAL ISSUE IN INDIA. By Robert Stokes, with an Introduction by the Rt. Hon. Lord Meston, K.C.I.E., LL.D. *John Murray*, 1931. 1s.

The Archbishop of York says : "I wish to make it clear that I am neither commending nor criticizing the contents of this book otherwise than as a contribution to the English understanding of the Indian mind. But for this, which is the first necessity, I believe that it has a peculiar value." The caution expressed in these words is necessary. As a description of Mahatma Ghandi's teaching, and especially of the non-resistance or non-co-operative principle and movement, *Satyagraha*, the reader will learn much of one phase of contemporary Indian thought. But the attitude of the writers is one-sided, and certain omissions indicate a certain prejudice.

It has become clear that Ghandi does not by any means carry with him the whole of the best elements of Indian opinion. That

¹ Cf. A. J. Macdonald, *Berengar and the Reform of Sacramental Doctrine*, and *The Evangelical Doctrine of Holy Communion*.

never deformed"; and it provided the most spectacular resistance to the will of Henry VIII. The Carthusian ideal was isolation and withdrawal from the world in a sense far more complete even than that which ordinary monastic practice involved. Each occupant of a Carthusian monastery had his own two cells or rooms and his own small garden, and in these he had to spend his time in meditation, reading and prayer. He only met his fellow-monks on Sundays and certain festivals. The community life which was so marked a feature of ordinary Benedictine monasticism was almost entirely absent. One consequence of this was that the Carthusians never fell to be a prey to many of those evils which in the later centuries of the Middle Ages marred the first splendour of the ideals of St. Benedict.

Yet to the uninitiated the Carthusian monastery would appear to be very similar to any other religious house, for even their compact little cells were ranged round a large cloister, as can be seen from the plan of Mount Grace Charterhouse, which the author has included in her book. She has also made clear what is not always known, that very often each cell was built by a particular founder and frequently endowed as well. Thus Sir William Walworth, Lord Mayor of London, helped to build five cells, if we understand aright a rather ambiguous statement on p. 174, in the London Charterhouse. The head of each house was a prior but, as the writer is careful to point out, as the supreme authority in the Order was the General Chapter and not the prior of the Grande Chartreuse, they never were classed as alien priories.

The author has set out to write a careful account based on accurate research of each of the nine English houses. Naturally such a method does not produce a book very easy to read, but it provides the type of work that is required. The volume is divided into three sections, the first dealing with the French origins of the Order, the second with the English Province, and the third with the "English Carthusians under the Tudors," which latter part is mostly concerned with the final scenes of the dissolution of their houses. This arrangement, though satisfactory, gives a rather disproportionate amount of space to the closing years of the Order in England. This, no doubt, is due partly to the amount of material available, particularly in the form of correspondence, dealing with the surrender of the various houses. To these final accounts the writer has succeeded in imparting a somewhat apologetic character based obviously on her profound sympathy with misfortune. At the same time one wonders that, if the writer were describing the events of Mary's reign, the Protestant martyrs, whose sufferings were even more prolonged, would evoke the same amount of sympathy. We are inclined to doubt it. The martyrs of change always seem so much less attractive than the martyrs for the established order of things. We feel, therefore, that the author for an historical work has allowed her obvious sympathies to be far too obtrusive, and thus tending to defeat her own object. The Carthusians were not the only noble martyrs in the sixteenth century. Yet it is easy to understand that feeling of real affection for the Carthusians which

the writer displays. They maintained the purity of their ideals long after the other monastic Orders had evinced obvious signs of compromise and decay. They never invented excuses for avoiding the rule against eating meat and they abandoned the system of oblates when the evils incurred became known. To the end they remained faithful to their rule and so merit the admiration which consistency rightly receives.

The book is equipped with an adequate Index, though we note the absence of a Bibliography, which omission, however, is somewhat rectified by the author's habit of giving references for most of her statements.

C. J. O.

SOCIAL SUBSTANCE OF RELIGION. By Gerald Heard. *George Allen & Unwin, 1931. 10s. 6d.*

The sub-title indicates the nature of the book—"An Essay on the Evolution of Religion." Religion is the product of the human mind; it is not in any sense revealed. Hence, readers of this journal will not find much which is related to Christianity, and nothing which concerns Christ, the revealer of the Word of God. The whole book is of the earth earthy, but for those who are interested in the development of human consciousness and of civilization as a purely human study, Mr. Heard has many novel and instructive things to say. He faces the problem of man's unhappiness, and scans the field of biological and anthropological inquiry in order to define it. The conflict in man's soul is not due to the restrictions placed upon him by society, but to the taking of a wrong turning away back in his primitive cultural development. The result is a fissure in human consciousness. Objective and subjective are not properly synthesized. The subjective is without mind and the objective without power.

In the course of tracing the process Mr. Heard sweeps the whole field of history East and West. He says that the sense of property is very rudimentary. He maintains that a matriarchal preceded a patriarchal organization of society. The family is not the essential group. Religion arises from association in a small group, and psychology is wrong in regarding it as the projection of the unappeasable desire of the individual. It was an initial mistake in the attempt to reach a real goal. The true idea is to make contact with the eternal life of the race. Man must remerge in the group, not emerge from it as an individual. Cultural progress begins with the individual's acute sense of loneliness.

The food instinct predominates over sex instinct in the apes, and the latter has become intensified since the period of the anthropoids—a healthy criticism of Freud. So Mr. Heard makes a shrewd hit at some modern claims to license. We may add that we have long thought that the aspiration to "go native" did poor justice to the apes. Among the anthropoids companionship, not erotic passion, is fundamental. In the human epoch religion was defined and rationalized with the attempt to ensure physical life by life-giving physical practices, and man passed out of the monthly orgy "puri-

fied, blessed and at rest." Here was the prelapsarian paradise! So we get erotic religion. But this proves unsatisfying, and the ascetic movement sets in, accompanied in its early stages by matriolatry, and then magic, followed by survivalism. Sex now becomes pleasure without excitement. Superstition is not the depth of stupidity, but a bad answer to vital facts.

The history of Israel and Judaism is briefly sketched in the light of these assumptions. The conflict of loyalties between family and group, Church and State goes on, and rushes the individual headlong into asceticism. John the Baptist, not Jesus, is the real founder of Catholicism—another shrewd observation. Civilization will take a new line when, if ever, the Jew settles down. The Gospel has nothing to do with orthodoxy; the real problem is not the credibility of the creeds, but the applicability of Christian ethics. The Christians of the Gospel failed when the agape was crushed out by growing episcopal organization. In the original small Christian group of about a dozen was to be found the joy of Eden. The church of the Empire was no more than the ecclesiastical aspect of imperialism.

Catholicism lays emphasis upon the mother-god, whereas the Muhammedan of the desert and the Protestant of northern Europe stress the father-god. The field of the group was being recovered when Holy Communion replaced the Mass. But the Protestant "Communion" has not gone far enough. If the agape should be revived the spirit of the Gospel would return. The individual must be placed back in the group, where energy can escape and be re-charged by the group. The Moravians and Quakers showed the way, but their effort has broken down. Yet the love-religion is coming back and asceticism has failed. The stress should be laid on compassion not *libido*. Economic communism has already revealed its psychic unsoundness. The individual must return to society, then society becomes the race, "the race is re-united with life, and life is one with the universe."

Thus in spite of many accurate observations on the course of religious development on its human side, all Mr. Heard has to offer is God in the group, as Mr. Birch Hoyle has pointed out. This will not help the Christian.

A. J. M.

UNIVERSITIES IN GREAT BRITAIN. By Ernest Barker. *Student Christian Movement Press*, 1931. 3s. 6d.

This excellent little book, by the Professor of Political Science in the University of Cambridge, provides pleasant reading not only for teachers in the universities, but for all interested in higher education and in our national institutions. It is inspired by a healthy English feeling. Professor Barker praises merits and puts his finger on weaknesses. He also clears away some popular misunderstandings. He draws attention to the provincialism of modern universities. One of the many benefits offered by a university education should be contact with students from other parts of the country. In Liverpool or Manchester or Birmingham this is almost

entirely wanting. The solution, of course, lies in the development of the hostel or college system, and the transference of Liverpool men to Birmingham and Manchester men to Reading. The modern tendency to specialization is being overdone, and Professor Barker does well to point out that a good "Pass" course such as exists in Scotland or London affords a better training for an Elementary or Secondary Schoolmaster than a highly specialized course in one subject, "such as Chemistry." On the other hand, the specialized course is of the utmost value to the student entering industry. Professor Barker has something to say about the limitations of a don's life, but he does not suggest a remedy. That surely lies in insisting that before a teacher takes up his life-work at the university he should spend some years away from it, doing a piece of work not necessarily connected with his own subject. The system whereby the brilliant young graduate is appointed to a Fellowship or Lectureship immediately after taking his degree, breeds not only the hot-house atmosphere noted by Professor G. M. Trevelyan, but also a narrow self-centredness which sometimes results in the careless performance of duties. Twenty years ago in a certain famous university the undergraduates in a certain faculty were not taught at all, they were not even guided, and much valuable talent was allowed by those responsible to flounder about without being developed. The author gives deserved praise to the university presses, but he has not noticed the disquietening commercialization of these presses. A private publisher is quite justified in refusing a work which may cause him loss. On the contrary, the university presses exist primarily to promote learning, yet to-day they are preventing much valuable work from seeing the light by refusing to publish what will not be a commercial success. It should be possible to run a university press as a whole, so that the popular works carry some of the less popular by their profits. Professor Barker utters a warning against the increase of university education beyond the point at which the nation can absorb graduate students into useful occupations. That is an important element in the unrest in modern India; and in the West we stand in danger of the "intellectual proletariat," which "is the seed-bed of revolutionary movements." He disposes of the notion that Oxford and Cambridge are the "homes of the rich." The assisted students in these universities are only 2.4 per cent. below that of the modern universities, in spite of the fact that Oxford and Cambridge receive no grants from local authorities. He utters a caution against the extension of extra-mural work, but again he does not go far enough. There is no longer any need to divert university funds towards extra-mural scholarships and bursaries; and with the development of the B.B.C. and cheap editions of the best authors, the extension lecture system is no longer required, especially as the universities need every penny of their funds, for their own intra-mural use. He closes with an admirable tribute to the "Evangelical Tradition" in the Student Movement.

RABBINIC LITERATURE AND GOSPEL TEACHINGS. By C. G. Montefiore, Hon. D.Litt. (Oxford), Hon. D.D. (Manchester). *Macmillan & Co.*, 1930. Pp. xxii + 442. 15s. net.

Here is a book for the scholar, the preacher, and the layman who wishes to understand the Bible better. Dr. Montefiore is known everywhere as a truly religious, genially human scholar, and as a patron of scholarship. Last year he was the elected President of the British Society of Old Testament Study. He, a liberal Jew, was the first scholar to receive the distinction of the honorary doctorate of Divinity of Manchester University.

As Dr. Montefiore explains in his Introduction, his new work is a supplement to his *Commentary on the Synoptic Gospels* (the second edition of which was published in 1927). To be sure, Christian scholars have made attempts to collect illustrations from Rabbinical sayings, but there is nothing really convenient for English students, and the volumes designed by the lamented Jewish Christian Hermann Strack and carried to completion by Paul Billerbeck exist only in German, and have the disadvantage of being almost too conscientiously thorough to be a handy help to busy people. Dr. Montefiore, the liberal Jew, devotes his labours to elucidating the spiritual and ethical teaching of the gospels, and he is able to give many illustrations actually not to be found in Strack-Billerbeck. And all the while Dr. Montefiore presents the material in a clothed and charming form embodying the results of his long years of interest in the subject. It is not to be expected that a Jewish writer will always agree with Christian workers in the same field, but with a rare generosity this author suggests that "in my occasional quarrels with S.-B. and other Christian writers, they may be more in the right than my spectacles enable me to see and to believe." Needless to say a great part of the value of the book is that it is the only such treatise written by a Jew.

Let me quote a few parallels almost at random. St. Matt. vi. 13 (*Lead us not into temptation*). "O lead us not into sin, or transgression, iniquity, temptation, or shame; let not the evil inclination have sway over us . . . let us obtain this day, and every day, grace, favour and mercy in thine eyes." (Jewish P.B., but cf. Berachoth 60b.) On St. Matt. vi. 34 (*Sufficient unto the day*). "The woe of the hour is enough. One trouble at a time." (Berachoth 9b.) Here is a comment on St. Matt. ix. 11 (*Why eateth your master with publicans and sinners?*): "That the physician of the soul should seek out the 'sick' was a new phenomenon. . . . The great significance and importance of this new departure and its effects are obvious." The value of the comment on St. Matt. xv. 11 (*That which cometh out of the mouth, this defileth the man*) is that there is no parallel to this saying of Jesus.

Then there are the interesting explanations of Rabbinical doctrines, as e.g. that of *Kawwana*, i.e. "intention" or "devotion" (pp. 184 ff.). "He who prays must direct his heart" (Berachoth III, 4). "God said to the priests . . . you must bless in devotion of heart so that the blessing may be fulfilled unto them" (Tanbuma,

p. 197a). Such teaching reminds us how great was the gulf between pure Rabbinic doctrine ("Pharisaism" at its best) and anything pagan or savouring of the *ex opere operato* ways of the mechanical Romanist.

The volume would serve well the student who is desirous of being introduced in an interesting fashion to the doctrines of the early Judaism such as the sanctification (profanation) of the Name, "the good" ("or evil") "nature," "measure for measure." And meanwhile the great figures of Rabbinical Judaism—Rabbis Akiba, Hillel, Shammai, etc., are, through their cited utterances, becoming more and more real beings from the past.

Value has been added to *Rabbinical Literature and Gospel Teaching* from the fact that the learned author has secured some useful collaboration from Mr. Herbert Loewe, Lecturer in Rabbinical Hebrew at Oxford, and just recently brought back to his old university as Lecturer in Rabbinics and Talmudic in Cambridge. Material from his hand is interspersed in many parts of the volume.

I notice but one allusion to the Holy Spirit, and some illustrations of the Eucharistic phraseology of the Gospels would have been welcome. The book is confidently recommended as indispensable to the libraries of the Theological Colleges of all denominations.

R. S. C.

THOUGHT AND LETTERS IN WESTERN EUROPE, A.D. 500-900. By M. L. W. Laistner. *Methuen*, 1931. 15s.

Professor Laistner and Messrs. Methuen are to be most warmly congratulated on the appearance of this important and excellent book. It fills a gap in English literature of the Early Middle Ages, and forms a noteworthy contribution to reviving mediæval studies. Historians, philosophers, theologians and men of letters will all find valuable material here, and the way is shown to many sources which cannot otherwise be discovered without laborious research. Not only is the course of thought and of letters clearly traced, but the relative value of the historical, philosophical, theological and poetical writers of the period is appraised. No student of the Middle Ages can afford to omit reading this indispensable work.

Having said this, it is necessary to suggest certain emendations and corrections for a second edition. Is Professor Laistner quite sure that Manicheism was of little moment in western Europe, apart from N. Africa (p. 39)? Was Augustine's theory of Predestination quite so rigid as our author alleges (p. 41)? Were the monasteries the sole repositories of culture and education after Cassiodorus and in the Caroling period (pp. 73 and 161)? He does not appear to have paid sufficient attention to the cathedral schools. Moreover, were the studies in the monasteries of the sixth century wholly theological (p. 96)? On p. 82, the "tropological" interpretation of Scripture should be contrasted with the "moral" interpretation, not equated with it. The statement (p. 106) that Patrick's influence in Ireland was small, appears to have been made without due consideration of the late Professor Bury's book.

is the first qualification to be remembered when reading this book. Secondly, no tribute is paid, as it should have been paid, to the magnificent work of the British civil and military administration in India since 1858. No unprejudiced person who has lived and worked and travelled in India can have failed to observe the results of the unselfish, high-principled, and "Christian" labour of the Indian Civil Service in that land. It is time that this work should receive a more fair estimate at the hands of Christian writers. It is no excuse to protest that the Indian reader does not like it. No permanent gain will be won for him by encouraging him to think ungraciously of his benefactors. Due merit can be attributed to the administration in India, without in any way denying that we have made mistakes, and without denying the right of the peoples of India to a progressive advance towards self-government.

The writers of this book have no doubt absorbed Ghandi's spirit, and so far as that Mahatma's teaching is concerned with spiritual and moral issues nothing but appreciation can be shown towards it. But when this great Indian prophet and his admirers deal with political and administrative questions their limitations at once appear. The Mahatma, like the writers of this book, is in a hurry. That is a fatal defect in statesmanship. He and they have overlooked the fact that if non-resistance and non-co-operation have won certain victories, that has not been solely on account of the ideals behind them or the methods employed. It has been largely due to the fact that agitation which promises a swift remedy of real or imagined evils will always receive a large amount of vocal and active support. But does it last—and can such movements continue to be controlled for good? This is very doubtful. Already *Satyagraha*, as this book makes clear, has got out of hand, on certain occasions. It is still more clear that the movement could, and probably would, easily be turned against its leaders, if ever they secured the complete fulfilment of their demands, and if, as would certainly be the case, it was found that such a development did not at once introduce the millennium into India.

Mr. Winslow and Mr. Elwin are ardent admirers of the "Catholic" movement. They see much in Ghandi's teaching which corresponds with these sympathies. Hence a certain bias in the book. They refer repeatedly and rightly to the need for India's unity. Yet, when they call the Christian Church to advance this cause, they pass over without reference the great achievement already made towards unity among the Indian Christians of the South, by the Re-Union Scheme there. Is the silence of these writers due to the fact that their ecclesiastical prejudices are offended by the union of the Anglican Church with their Free Church brothers?

A healthy and necessary corrective to Mr. Winslow and Mr. Elwin's book is supplied by Mr. Stokes' pamphlet. If his phraseology is at times perhaps too strong, that does not detract from the importance of what he says. He pays a fair, and in these days, much needed tribute to the work of the Government of India and

of the provincial governments. He issues wholesome warnings against the evil results for India which would follow upon any hasty concession to the demands of the advanced reformers. Anyone who is inclined to accept with enthusiasm the conclusions of a book like *The Dawn of Indian Freedom* should read Mr. Stokes' pamphlet before making up his own mind on the questions involved.

A. J. M.

JOACHIM OF FLORA. By Henry Bett, M.A. *Methuen*, 1931. 6s.

Readers of Mr. Bett's valuable little book on John the Scot (Camb. Univ. Press, 1925) will welcome his contribution to Methuen's new series, "Great Churchmen of the Middle Ages," edited by Dr. Binns. English readers have not had an opportunity before of learning much about Joachim of Flora, the apocalyptic writer of the twelfth century. Students of prophecy, of the dispensation of the Spirit, and of the Second Advent will welcome this book. Joachim was the first writer on these matters, of whom we have any knowledge, since the days of the Montanists in the second century. Mr. Bett thinks that some of his doctrines may have been influenced by his contact with the Greeks of eastern Europe. He "had a considerable reputation as a prophet in his life-time." Beginning as a Cistercian, he founded the abbey of S. John of Flora, which became the head of a new order of some thirty or forty houses, mostly in Italy. In the sixteenth century they were absorbed by the Cistercians, Carthusians and Dominicans. His writings are marked by loyalty to the Papacy, in contrast with the critical and hostile attitude adopted by his followers in later times. Joachim died in peace in 1202, but many of his successors suffered at the hands of the Inquisition. He was "a gentle, humble, kindly man," devoted to simple works of charity and sharing in the menial work of his monastery.

Joachim's influence on later times was exerted not through his abbeys, but through his writings, in which the apocalyptic note is always present, sometimes striking fantastic tones. Not until some fifty years after his death did his writings begin to create excitement. They were popular with the Franciscans, and Mr. Bett sketches the dispute between that order and the University of Paris. The teaching of Joachim, popular among some of the Friars, gave the seculars a *casus belli* against them. Joachim's ideas contributed to the rise of the "Spirituals," a development which divided the Franciscans in two. It was prevalent among the Fraticelli, Flagellants, Beghards, Bequines and the Brethren of the Free Spirit. Rienzo was attracted by it; it was not unknown among the Hussites of Bohemia, and through Telesphorus influenced Savonarola. The attacks upon the Papacy in the spurious Joachite writings made Joachim popular among the Reformers, and Mr. Bett traces similar ideas in Schelling and the modern Russian writer Merezhkovsky. The fact is, of course, that the notion of a third and final dispensation under the ægis of the Spirit is a notion which has never for long been absent from European religious thought, since the days of Montanus.

From one point of view it is the belief of the Church. Although no doubt the teachings of Joachim long remained current among the pre-Reformation sectaries of southern Europe and Germany, there is no need to trace its influence beyond them. Similar ideas have broken out again among the Second Adventists of modern times, without any direct connection with Joachim. A. J. M.

CHALCEDON. By J. S. MacArthur, B.D. S.P.C.K., 1931. 6s.

There is no end to inquiry into the first five centuries of the Church's history, and Chalcedon has become a dead-end to British scholarship. Yet great tracts of unexplored country this side of Chalcedon, in the field of historical theology, await investigation by British scholars, who continue to neglect the Middle Ages.

Mr. MacArthur has packed a great deal of information into a small compass. He reviews the Nestorian and Eutychian controversies. Although clearly influenced by Dr. Bethune-Baker, he does not altogether accept that scholar's findings, and so the Nestorian question is again "as you were." The crux of the matter lies in the interpretation given of *hypostasis* by the contending parties. If, as Mr. MacArthur suggests, contrary to Dr. Bethune-Baker, Nestorius used it in the sense of *ousia*, does that not draw him much closer to Cyril than our author allows? He has some interesting comments on Nestorius's eucharistic doctrine, a matter already dealt with in a recent volume entitled *The Evangelical Doctrine of Holy Communion* (Heffer). Eutyches receives more fair treatment than some writers have assigned to him, and the asperities of Cyril's temperament receive well-deserved rebuke. The Chalcedonian definition made no new contribution to Christology, but it adequately combated views attributed to Nestorius and Eutyches. This is a fair judgment. But it means, as Mr. MacArthur points out, that it was not definitive—Monophysitism remained, and developed into Monothelism.

The last chapter contains an excellent review of modern literature on the subject. On the other hand, we must suggest that it is hardly historical to speak of an appeal to Rome (p. 38) as though Rome were already recognized as a doctrinal tribunal. Nor is it accurate to describe Celestine or even Leo I as "Pope." Celestine's action may have been high-handed and therefore pope-like, but with Constantinople, Alexandria and Antioch still vigorous, no hegemony of the Roman Church and its bishops was yet recognized. Even the action of Leo I did not loom so largely in its own day as in later times when it has been interpreted through the spectacles of later papal supremacy. A. J. M.

RELIGIOUS THOUGHT IN PALESTINE IN THE TIME OF CHRIST. By T. Herbert Bindley, D.D. Methuen & Co., Ltd. 6s. net.

It has been recognized in recent times that a knowledge of the period preceding the time of our Lord as well as of the elements of the contemporary life are necessary to a correct understanding of many points in the New Testament. Research has opened out for

us a period almost entirely unknown, and has brought to light a somewhat extensive literature that illuminates many passages in the New Testament. Canon Bindley has brought together in this volume an immense amount of information derived from many sources, and he provides a useful list of books for those who wish to prosecute their studies further. He explains the social and educational conditions in Palestine, and then gives a brief but interesting and adequate account of some of the chief books in Palestine literature. These include the Wisdom Books such as *The Wisdom of Sirach*, and the *Wisdom of Solomon*, the Apocalyptic books such as the *Books of Enoch*, the *Book of Jubilees*, *The Testament of the Twelve Patriarchs*, *The Sibylline Oracles*, *The Psalms of Solomon*, and *The Assumption of Moses*. This section of the work will be found specially useful to students. The remaining chapters deal with varied subjects; the meaning of the term "Messiah" is explained; a fresh account is given of the Jewish Sects—the Scribes, the Pharisees, the Sadducees, and the Essenes. The story of the Septuagint is told; a description is given of Galilee; the origin of the Canon and of the Apocrypha is explained; an interesting account is given of Time, Travel, and Letter-writing in New Testament times, and a chapter is devoted to our Lord's use of the Old Testament. A mass of information is collected in these 170 pages which will greatly help students to a better understanding of the New Testament.

JESUS AND THE GOSPEL OF LOVE. By Charles E. Raven, D.D.
Hodder & Stoughton, 1931. 15s.

People with sensitive temperaments will avoid reading this latest book by Canon Raven. But those who enjoy literary and theological fisticuffs will find several hours of enjoyment provided by this racy book. We might perhaps recommend unreservedly Canon Raven's trenchant writing, if it were always based on knowledge, and if he had the seemliness not to complain when others hit back. "My general results have been attacked, but by assertion and abuse, not by argument," he says, in the preface of his new book. Is Canon Raven never abusive? Let us see: "These little twisted people who set themselves to sneer at the genius and patronize the saint reveal only too clearly the derangement of their own characters." *These little twisted people*—what a phrase to apply to Swinburne, Voltaire, Anatole France and H. G. Wells, all names mentioned by Canon Raven in this context! "Mr. Murry has no right to ignore . . .," "Mr. Robertson (J. M.) possessed the type of ingenuity familiar to us in the underworld of Premillenarianism or of British Israel!" Yet Dr. Raven has the hardihood to inform his readers that "the devil's weapons of sarcasm and superciliousness will not help us." Really, if he would take a little of his own medicine he might find less to complain of in his critics.

But Canon Raven's arrogance becomes even more ludicrous when he is weak in the legs of knowledge. We note that he is

content to quote Loisy and Gardner on the Eucharist. He is not acquainted with the most recent literature on the subject produced by British and Continental writers. Like some other gifted writers who attempt weightier writing, he is caught tripping over the history of the Middle Ages, on which he pronounces with as much confidence as on the Patristic era, which he has thoroughly made his own. We are reminded of the horrors of papal iniquity in the ninth century, when, on the contrary, papal statesmanship and integrity upheld the alliance with the Carolings. He meant to refer to the iniquity of phases of papal history in the tenth and eleventh centuries. He repeats the worn-out statement concerning "the darkness of Carolingian times," and we are informed that it "was not until after the Cluniac revival and by work like that of Lanfranc at Bec that an interest in doctrinal questions was revived." These two statements are as full of errors as a scrap-heap is of rubbish. Reference to Lane Poole's *Illustrations of Medieval Thought and Learning*, to the writings of De Ghellinck, and the *Beiträge zur Geschichte der Philosophie des Mittelalters*, not to mention the fifth and sixth volumes of Neander's *General Church History*, would have shown how far from being dark these early centuries were. The Cluniac revival was not a revival of learning or of interest in doctrine, but of monastic discipline. The revival of learning in the eleventh century took place in other Benedictine abbeys, at the cathedral schools, at centres like Tours, and above all at Liège and Worms, where the renewed study of canon law left its mark on the reformed Papacy. While it is true that Lanfranc revived learning at Bec, and afterwards in England, it is not true that he had any great interest in doctrinal questions. He was a grammarian and a lawyer, not a theologian and a thinker, and even in the Berengarian controversy he played only a secondary part.

But it is when Canon Raven dismisses the teaching of Barth and Brunner with a couple of pages of Philistine scorn, punctuated by one or two footnotes, that we find it most difficult to maintain patience. If Dr. Raven had taken the trouble to read the German editions of these writers, where alone their ideas are adequately set out, we should feel that he was entitled to his opinion, even though we should still regret his trenchant criticism of a school of theologians and philosophers who have done more for the revival of religion in half a continent than the Liverpool school can ever hope to do in half a city. When he says, "For the English reader Barth *The Word of God and the Word of Man* and Brunner *The Theology of Crisis* are a sufficient introduction," he is either misleading his readers, or hiding his own lack of knowledge behind an admonition. When Sir Edwyn Hoskyn's translation of Barth's commentary on the Romans, and a Scottish translation of his first volume of the *Dogmatik* appear, and when we have secured a translation of Brunner's *Der Mitleid*, English readers will perceive what a very unsafe preceptor Canon Raven can be. We are told that Barth's system expresses "the despair of a disillusioned and war-weary

generation." The truth is that Barth's teaching was well developed before 1916, when to any observer in Central Europe the Central Powers were certain of victory, and were by no means war-weary. The charge that to the Barthians "God is wholly and solely transcendent" has already been described by Dr. Brunner as "non-sense" (*The Word and the World*), and in *Zur Lehre vom Heiligen-geist*, Dr. Barth has more than answered his critics on this point, besides confuting the charge that in his teaching there is no "indwelling of the Spirit." If Canon Raven had digested certain passages in the *Römerbrief* on freedom and election, he would have avoided the remark that "such teaching . . . is simply a restatement of Calvinistic orthodoxy in its rigid form." His suggestion that all the Barthian tenets belong to fundamentalism is almost malicious, and is not in any sense tempered by the qualifying clause at the beginning of the passage. The truth is that Barth and Brunner, like Gogarten and Thurneysen, accept the assured results of modern scholarship, psychology, biology and astronomy with as much zeal as Dr. Raven himself, but they more wisely maintain that religion begins where these end. Sir James Jeans has just said something very similar. If Canon Raven finds the Swiss teaching "riddled with inconsistencies," that is because he has had no training in the dialectical method, although he unwittingly pays it a tribute by praising John the Scot. The Scot maintained as consistently as any Barthian that God is unknowable by the mind of man, and when Canon Raven says that "anything less like the faith of Jesus or the evidence of the New Testament can hardly be found in Christian history," and bases his contention on the fact of the Incarnation, he is in the bonds of his own merely human conception of Jesus. The Incarnation took place just because God is unknowable by man, and solely because the revelation must be made through a human person, to meet man's incapacity for direct knowledge of God. It was a revelation of certain qualities of God in a human personality, and the truth of the matter was expressed by Jesus when He said, "No one knoweth . . . the Father save the Son and he to whomsoever the Son willeth to reveal him."

Canon Raven alleges that the Barthian teaching is a creed of despair. We reply that Canon Raven's own creed is one of unbelief. That is the inward meaning of his hurried search along the by-ways as well as the highways of modern knowledge. He has spent much time in the silent watches by the study lamp: has he yet been smitten on the highway at noon by the vision of the divine Christ? If so, he would not call the Barthian Christology Apollinarian, and set up against it his own Adoptionism. We should avoid such an interrogation of a soul obviously in trouble, which has not yet found peace, if Canon Raven would learn to show a similar consideration for the spiritual struggles of others. Away in Germany there is a little calm man, who kisses his children "Good night!" when they come to say "Good morning!" on their way to school. In term-time at 7 a.m. he is in his lecture-room, opening his teaching with a hymn,

and then going straight to the hearts and souls of 700 students. His books have been translated into many languages, and the student assembly of Bonn is multiplied a thousand-fold. Up in the Alps at Zurich there is another quiet forceful spirit, with a countenance refined by classical study, and an eye which has also seen the vision. He also counts his class by the hundred. These two men are to-day supplying mankind with the Evangel, the "message" for which Canon Raven was asking the clergy of Liverpool around the year 1923, and it is a pathetic tragedy that now the message has been delivered, the distinguished author of this book turns from it without even listening to it, and tries to hinder others from receiving its Light, Life and Love!

But Dr. Raven is not at the end of his pilgrimage, and we shall yet see him appraising the merits of Barth and Brunner, and perhaps supplementing their deficiencies from his own keen brain. We see hope for him in the fact that many of his statements have already a Barthian ring. Like the Swiss doctors, he stresses the need for theology, and condemns the anti-intellectuals. Like them he admits that with Christ "a new thing has come into the world." The Incarnation "is the crucial event in an age-long activity." Like them, he allows that we "cannot know immediately." There is a paradox of growth, and "God alone is the gardener." Most of all, in the statement that "creation and revelation are not two conflicting movements, but one" do we hear the note of the new Evangelism. Like it, he admits that dogmatic expression is necessary. We have not the same confidence in his judgment when he says that the concepts of Goodness, Truth and Beauty have been replaced by Light, Life and Love. If so, this does not necessarily indicate progress. It is a return to Fichte's mysticism and terminology.

However, in this book Canon Raven's theology has taken a great leap forward. The section in which he accepts the historicity of the Fourth Gospel will be accepted with grateful appreciation by many readers. They alone make the book worth while. Possibly he will now be able to give us a real contribution on the Person and work of the Holy Spirit. We looked in vain for it in the *Creator Spirit*, but with the problem of S. John settled for our author, he should now be able to proceed. He will find assistance in Barth's latest pronouncement. What he has not yet realized is that the gospel of the Jesus of history is finished, and modern man is asking for something much more. Jesus, approached from the merely human side, does not take us very far. We must let Him approach us from the divine side, and then behold our God. Modern man, in his religion, wants God, not human knowledge or its fruits, not even when they are summed up in the Jesus of history. Canon Raven's fundamental theological mistake is revealed in the teaching that Christianity is a revelation of the true character of the natural, not an intrusion of the supernatural. If this be so, then Christianity is merely natural science, and we shall find its true character in biology and chemistry, physics and astronomy. It is just because

Christianity is an intrusion of the divine that it has the power to lift men up and inspire them with faith, which is vastly more than the hope offered by the Jesus of history theology. When a man realizes that God comes seeking him, he goes "homing" to the Father's call, the more easily since that call is uttered in the Word which is Christ, and is heard in the soul by the indwelling Spirit of God. We are not alone in our response, the Spirit of God is in us and with us—that is Barth's message and Brunner's teaching.

A. J. M.

CHRISTIANITY AND THE CURE OF DISEASE. By George S. Marr, M.A., B.D., M.B., D.Litt. *H. R. Allenson, Ltd., Racquet Court, E.C.* 5s.

The object of the author is to establish the position the Church should adopt with reference to the cure of disease, in obedience to the command of Jesus—"Preach the gospel . . . heal the sick," which command was given through the disciples to the whole Church of Christ. Religion and Medicine before the time of Christ—our Lord's ministry of healing and the healing work of the Disciples and St. Paul, are carefully discussed, and we are taken through successive periods of history—the first Three Centuries and the progress of the healing art—from the time of Constantine to the Reformation. This is followed by an interesting summary of movements since the Reformation for the cure of disease. A chapter is devoted to the influence of mind upon body, and the final chapter—on "Conclusion"—is important, and the author being both a clergyman and a physician, is well qualified for the task he has undertaken and carried out so effectively. The index greatly adds to the utility of the volume.

S. R. C.

VITALITY. By Malcolm Spencer, M.A. *London: Student Christian Movement.* 3s. 6d.

This book will be found decidedly out of the ordinary. One of the Appendices sets out the aims of what is known as the Auxiliary Movement. This is a fellowship of men and women who desire to understand the Christian Faith; to live the Christian Life; and to find the Christian Way. Its members desire to commit themselves to God and to each other in a common effort to put into practice certain Affirmations or articles of faith which are succinctly stated. In another Appendix will be found "Four Services of Thanksgiving," to be used either for private or corporate prayer.

The earlier chapters of the book aim at defining what is meant by God's Vitality and showing how it reaches men, and it is described as an invitation and a guide to a greater vitality and joy in living. It has been written with the conviction that for many "life is sadly impoverished compared with what it might be."

We remember a certain Curate's egg and the young Ecclesiastic's historic description of it,—“parts of it are excellent!”

S. R. C.

CHURCH BOOK ROOM NOTES.

WINE OFFICE COURT, FLEET STREET, E.C.4.

Confirmation.—A Confirmation Address by Bishop Knox has been added to our Confirmation series, and is published at 9d. per dozen or 4s. per 100. The Address has been republished in response to several requests and will, we feel sure, be much appreciated.

We have received from the Church Missionary Society, a copy of a recent publication of theirs entitled *The Merry Mountaineer*, by R. W. Howard, Head Master of Liverpool College. The title is a very fitting one for the story of Clifford Harris of Persia, and gives a true description and glimpse of the vivid character of the young missionary who gave his life for the Persians. Cheerfulness and courage are the keynotes of the character portrayed in the book, and most interesting are the vivid descriptions of his romantic campaign of unselfish service and teaching among the villagers round Isfahan, in the intervals of a busy school routine. The book is an inspiration to all who read it, and is a very fitting gift to confirmees. It is published at 1s.

Evangelical Doctrine.—In our advertisement columns will be found an advertisement of *The Evangelical Doctrine of the Holy Communion*, edited by Dr. Macdonald, Rector of St. Dunstan's-in-the-West (7s. 6d.). We strongly recommend this book. It is a volume of historical and doctrinal essays of unique value and importance. It is marked with true scholarship, and the reader is directed to first-hand sources of information both in general at the close of each essay and in detail in footnotes. It is not too much to say that this book should not only be in the library of every Theological College but in that of every minister of religion.

Missionary Books.—The Church of England Zenana Missionary Society have sent us three missionary books for young people which we have pleasure in commending. *Chopsticks*, by F. I. Codrington (2s. 6d.), which has reached its third edition, has the following new features: a coloured frontispiece, a number of extra illustrations, and a foreword by Lady Hosie; *Priceless Jewel*, by D. S. Batley (1s. 6d.), is a good story of missionary adventure in India; and *Birds of a Feather*, by A. M. Robinson (1s. 6d.), is an interesting and well-illustrated story of one term's jolly doings at a home school for children of missionaries.

The XXXIX Articles.—The Rev. C. M. Chavasse has written a pamphlet entitled *The XXXIX Articles as the Faith of the National Church*, which is published by the World's Evangelical Alliance at 3d. The pamphlet is a valuable one, and in a short space gives the history, the value and the teaching of the Articles in clear and concise paragraphs. The greater part of the pamphlet deals with the question of the real issue now at stake, the Assent to the *Articles* and Revision.

Famous Men.—Under the editorship of Sir Harry Johnston, a new series of books is being published by Messrs. Collins at 3s. 6d. each. The series is as follows: (1) *A Book of Great Authors*, (2) *A Book of Great Voyages*, (3) *A*

Book of Empire Builders, (4) *A Book of Great Travellers*, (5) *A Book of Empire Heroes*, (6) *A Book of Great Sailors*. The first volume gives short sketches of the lives of ten famous men, including Homer, Virgil, Chaucer, Shakespeare, Milton and Lessing. The second volume has six short biographies, including Sir John Hawkins, Sir Walter Raleigh, Captain Cook and Captain Vancouver. The third has eight sketches of the lives of eminent men, three of whom are Peter the Great, William Pitt and Bismarck. The fourth volume contains short stories of the adventures of eight great travellers, including Alexander Kinglake, Frederick Selous, Harry Derwent and Marianne North. The fifth contains sketches of the lives of eight empire heroes, including Livingstone, Stanley and Sir Francis Younghusband. The last volume gives the principal events in the lives of eight great sailors, including Columbus, the two Cabots and Martin Frobisher. The books are attractively got up and are brightly written. They are rich in educational value.

Oxford Movement Centenary.—A series of "Tracts for the Times" particularly suitable for insertion in parish magazines during the coming year has been published by the "Conference of West of England Clergy in the dioceses of Exeter, Truro, Bath and Wells, and Salisbury." No. 1 is in the form of questions and answers as to what the Oxford Movement is, and what is the outcome of the Movement. No. 2 gives extracts from the writings of the various founders of the Movement, and is entitled *The Founders of the Anglo-Catholic Movement Tread the Way to Rome*. No. 3 consists of extracts from Froude's diary and Newman's *Apologia*. No. 4 is a statement of Newman's attack on the XXXIX Articles. No. 5 is a statement as to John Keble's position, particularly in regard to the famous Tract 90. No. 6 takes for its title *The Oxford Movement and Holy Scripture*, and is divided into two sections: 1, *The Bible is supreme over the Church*, and 2, *The Bible is supreme over tradition*. The Tracts are published at 1s. per 100, post free.

Parochial Church Councils.—The following forms and books have been issued by the Church Book Room: *The Parochial Church Councils (Powers) Measure*, with complete Text, Introduction, and Notes, by Albert Mitchell, 1s.; *The Enabling Act*, with complete Text and the Constitution of the National Assembly of the Church of England, with Notes, Introduction, and "Ladder of Lay Representation," and other Appendices, including Diocesan Conferences Regulation, 1922, Representation of the Laity Measure, 1929, etc., by Albert Mitchell, 1s.; *Parochial Church Councils*, a leaflet for distribution amongst P.C.C. members, by Albert Mitchell, 3s. per 100; *Parochial Electors' Roll Book*, containing 100 sheets and with alphabetical index cut through, 3s. 6d.; *Application for Enrolment on Church Electoral Roll*, 1s. per 100; also printed on card for Card Index System, 1s. 6d. per 100; *Notice of Enrolment of a Non-Resident*, 10d. per 100; *Notice to Cancel Entry in another Parish*, 10d. per 100; *Notice of Removal to another Parish*, 10d. per 100; *Notice of Revision of Church Electoral Roll*, 1d. each, 9d. per dozen; *Notice of Annual Parochial Church Meeting*, 1d. each, 9d. per dozen; *Notice of Joint Meeting for electing Churchwardens*, 1d. each, 9d. per dozen; *Notice of Parochial Church Council Meeting (for Church Door)*, 3d. per dozen; *Notice of Parochial Council Meeting with Agenda*, 1s. 6d. per 100; *Form of Parochial Voting Papers*, with space for 20 names, 2s. 6d. per 100; 40 names 2s. 6d. per 100; *Electoral Roll Sheets*, 2s. per 100; *Nomination Forms to Diocesan Conference*, 6d. per dozen; *Nomination Forms to House of Laity*, 6d. per dozen; *Nomination Forms to Parochial Church Council*, 1s. per 100. Sample packets of the above leaflets and forms can be supplied on application, price 3d. post free.